Hemaraj Pande's Caurāsī Bol

Padmanabh S. Jaini

In 1956, Professor Hiralal R. Kapadiya published an article called "Dikpata Caurāsī Bol [Pratyukti]: (84 Bol Vicāra) Rekhādarśana," describing the contents of an important metrical Hindi work by Upādhyāya Yaśovijayjī¹. At the end of this text we learn that it is a refutation of the [Sitapaṭa]Caurāsī Bol, i.e., Eighty-Four Points of Controversy between the Digambaras and the Śvetāmbaras, a composition by Hemaraj Pande:

हेमराज पांडे किये, बोल चुरासी फेर, या विधि हम भाषा वचन, ताको मत कियजेर. (१५८)

Professor Kapadiya informs us that he had asked a Śvetāmbara monk Candanasāgaragani to search for a manuscript of this Digambara work. A handwritten paper manuscript of it indeed was found in Surat and was identified as the original work of Hemaraj Pande. However, Professor Kapadiya received from Surat only the first four and the last five verses of this manuscript, which he reproduced in his article. At the end of the fifth verse the author's name appears as Kavi Hema, who composed it for the benefit of one Kaurapal in the city of Agra. Unfortunately, the Surat manuscript was never fully edited or published, and we hear nothing more about it.

My search in the catalogues of Jain bhandaras in Rajasthan, prepared by Dr. Kasturchand Kasliwal², yielded several entries for this important manuscript. I am indebted to Mr. Subhash C. Jain of Jaipur who, with the kind help of Dr. Kasliwal, obtained for me a xerox copy of one of these manuscripts, together with correct readings of several obscure words in it. The manuscripts, listed as No. 320, has a total of 9 pages copied in Samvat 1723 (=A. D. 1666). Verse number 24 of this manuscript, which lists the 18 defects (dosas) that are absent in a kevalin in the Digambara tradition,

appears as a quotation in Upādhyāya Yaśovijayjī's composition (verse no. 19). Thus it can be safely assumed that this work is identical with the one that formed the pūrva-pakṣa for the Śvetāmbara refutation.

The author of the Caurāsī Bol, Hemaraj Pande, is the same person who wrote the Hindi Pravacanasāra Bhāṣā Ṭīkā called Bālāvabodha, published in the Pravacanasāra of Kundakunda, edited by Dr. A. N. Upadhye³. This work was completed in Agra in Samvat 1709 (=A. D. 1653) when Shah Jahan was on the throne of Delhi. We learn from a biography of Hemaraj, written by Dr. Kasturchand Kasliwal, that he was also the author of some 15 additional works, several in verse, including the Caurāsī Bol, which was completed in the same year as the Bālāvabodha⁴.

At the end of his brief article, Professor Kapadiya had expressed a wish that these two texts should be edited, translated, and compared to arrive at a better understanding of these two ancient Jain traditions:

आम प्रस्तुत कृतिनुं अनेकविध महत्त्व होवाथी... अेनो विशेष प्रचार अने अभ्यास थवो घटे. आ माटे आ कृतिनुं समीक्षात्मक संस्करण तैयार करावी प्रकाशित करावों जोईओ. अेमां पूर्वपक्ष तरीके हेमराज पांडेनी सितपट चौर्यासी बोल नामनी कृतिने स्थान आपवुं घटे. विशेषमां प्रस्तुत कृतिनो गुजराती अनुवाद पण आपवो जोईओ. साथे साथे सामसामी अपायेली दलीलो केटली सबक अने प्राचीन छे ते दर्शाववुं जोईओ.

The present edition of Hemaraj Pande's Caurāsī Bol thus takes one more step in furthering a critical study of the manifold issues that separate the Digambara and the Śvetāmbara traditions. As is well known, two major issues, namely, kevali-bhukti (whether a kevalin, i.e., an Omniscient Being, partakes of food or not) and strī-mukti (whether a woman may attain moksa in that very life or not) dominate that debate. The Strīnirvāna Kevalibhuktiprakarane, edited by Muni Jambuvijayjis, is a most comprehensive collection of original and commentarial material available on these two topics. This has facilitated a good amount of modern research, notably, an article entitled, "Food and Freedom: The Jaina Sectarian Debate on the Nature of the Kevalin," by Professor Paul Dundas6, and my own book Gender and Salvation: Jaina Debates on the Spiritual Liberation of Women⁷. But the remaining issues are not less important and call for scholarly attention. Professor Kapadiya in his article takes note of some 27 major topics and puts together a longer list from the headings that appear in Upādhyāya Yaśovijayjī's "Pratyukti" published in the Gūrjara Sāhitya Sangraha⁸.

Hemaraj Pande's work contains eighty-four (caurāsī) points (bol) presented in a composition of ninety-one verses in varieties of Hindi meters. The number eighty-four seems to have been deliberately chosen by him to match with the eighty-four hundred thousand varieties of yonis into which a jīva may repeatedly be reborn in the course of samsāra (see verse no. 88). He is suggesting thereby that those who hold these views may not escape samsāra. In the absence of any prior Digambara work on this topic, we might assume that he himself drew up this list and composed his verses accordingly.

Upādhyāya Yaśovijayajī's refutation has one hundred sixty-one verses and yet his response seems to be limited to only some fifty-one topics. I list here in serial order the eighty-four points attributed by Hemaraj to the Śvetāmbaras. The Śvetāmbara refutation does not follow the same order of items nor does it address all the points and hence is given in a separate list.

A brief outline of the eighty-four disputed views (vādas) attributed to the Śvetāmbaras by the Digambara śrāvaka Hemaraj Pande [numbers refer to the verses]:

Introductory verses with a brief account of the beginning of the Śvetāmbara sect during the time of ācārya Bhadrabāhu. (1-18)

- 1. The Kevalin partakes of food by morsel (kavala-āhāra). (19-24)
- 2. The Kevalin needs to answer the calls of nature (nīhāra). (25-27)
- 3. The Kevalin is subject to the suffering of disease (roga). (28)
- 4. The Kevalin may suffer attacks (upasarga), such as that which happened to Mahāvīra at the hands of Gośāla? (29)
- 5. The Jina (like Vardhmana) attends school although he possesses avadhijñāna at the time of his birth¹⁰. (30-31)
- 6. The Jina, prior to abandoning the household, distributes gifts for an entire year¹¹. (32)
- The Jina gives up clothes at the time of his renunciation but Indra, the King of Gods, places a length of cloth over his shoulder (devadūṣya)¹². (33)

- 8. In the absence of the gaṇadharas—the only human beings who can interpret the divya-dhvani—the Jina (Mahāvīra) preached his first sermon to the gods only¹³. (The Digambara point seems to be that if this were the case, then it would be wasted as the gods could not take any vratas. They believe that the Jina maintained silence for sixty-six days until Gautama, the first gaṇadhara-to-be, appeared in the samavasarana.)¹⁴ (34--35)
- 9. Mahāvīra's mother (Triśalā) was not his natural mother because he was conceived in the womb of the brahman Devānandā¹⁵. (36a)
- 10. The first Tīrthaṅkara. Ādinātha, was born with a twin sister (yugaliyā), and they became husband and wife. (36b)
- 11. In addition to his twin-wife, Ādinātha married Sunandā, a second wife, who had become a widow (i.e., vidhavā-vivāha)¹⁶. (37-38)
- 12. Mahāvīra was first conceived in the despicable family of a brahman. (39)
- 13. By the orders of Indra, Harinegameśī transferred that foetus into the womb of Triśalā and this is called (by the Śvetāmbaras) a miracle (acherā, i.e., āścarya)¹⁷. (40-45)
- 14. The belief that only two Jinas, namely, Malli and Nemi, were unmarried, while in fact there were five. (According to the Digambaras, Vāsupūjya, Pārśva, and Mahāvīra were also kumāras, i.e., unmarried). (45)
- 15. The belief that a Kevalin (for example, Bāhubali) would respectfully greet another kevalin, like Rsabha¹⁸. (46-47)
- 16. A Kevalin like Mahāvīra unknowingly suddenly sneezed (which suggests that the Kevalin's body still has impurities). (48)
- 17. Gaṇadhara Gautama paid respects to a non-Jaina mendicant [named Khandaka]. (49-50)
- 18. A woman may attain mokṣa in that very life (strī-mukti). (51-53)
- 19. Tīrthankara Malli was [not a man but]a woman. (54-58)
- 20. A yugala (male and female twins) born in [the continent of] Harivarsa was snatched by a heavenly being (deva) and brought to

- the continent of Bharata where he made their bodies small (to suit the Bharata region, i.e., against the rule that a bhogabhūmi person cannot come to the karmabhūmis)¹⁹. (59)
- 21. They were anointed as king and queen in Mathurā, where they ate meat and were reborn in hell (i.e., when in fact a person born in the bhogabhūmi is reborn only in heaven). For this reason, the Śvetāmbaras consider this a miracle (acherā). They maintain that the lineage of the Haris (Harivamśa) derives from this family. (In the view of Digambaras, this story violates the rules pertaining to the twins born in a bhogabhūmi). (60-64)
- 22. A muni does not break the aparigraha-mahāvrata even when he keeps 14 requisites (upakaraṇas, such as pātras for collecting food and water, clothes, blanket, and so forth). (65-67)
- 23. Kāla is not a separate dravya. (68-69)
- 24. The ganadhara of Tirthankara Munisuvrata was a horse²⁰. (70)
- 25. A muni may partake of meat under some special conditions. (70)
- 26. A muni should beg food from different houses and eat that food at his place of residence. (70)
- 27. It is not a sin if one beats up a person who reviles your doctrine. (70)
- 28. Bharata was Brāhmī's brother, and yet he wanted to make her his wife. (71)
- 29. Bharata became a kevalin while still living in the household²¹. (71)
- 30. Draupadī was a virtuous wife but yet she had five husbands. (71)
- 31. A mendicant disciple attained kevalajñāna while carrying his teacher [called Caṇḍarudrācārya]on his shoulders. (72)
- 32. Mahāvīra was married²². (72)
- 33. Mahāvīra's son-in-law, called Jamāli, disputed with him²³. (72)
- 34. Kapila was a kevalin and yet he danced²⁴. (72)
- 35. Vasudeva (the father of Kṛṣṇa) had as many as seventy-two thousand wives. (73)

- 36. Bāhubali was taller even than five bow-lengths. (73)
- 37. A muni may receive food from a member of the śūdra caste. (73)
- 38. Heavenly beings (devas) can have conjugal relationships with human females. (73)
- 39. A woman called Sulasā produced thirty-two sons from one foetus²⁵. (73)
- 40. The first Vāsudeva called Triprstha was born from a nānati (?)26. (73)
- 41. Mahāvīra visited non-aryan regions²⁷. (74)
- 42. Mahāvīra preached to the mlecchas even in the fourth time period. (74)
- 43. There is no fault if a person who is fasting takes medicine. (74)
- 44. A cakravarti can have sixty-four thousand wives. (74)
- 45. The nudity of a Jina in the samavasarana remains invisible. (75)
- 46. The sky-cladness (i.e., nudity of a muni) is a cause for producing passions. (75)
- 47. A yati may keep a [walking] stick. (75)
- 48. A yati may have ear ornaments (doubtful reading). (75)
- 49. Marudevī (the mother of Jina Rṣabha) attained mokṣa while riding on an elephant²⁸. (75)
- 50. There is no fault if a weak muni takes food other than at the fixed times. (75)
- 51. A householder may attain kevalajñāna without undergoing the formal act of renunciation. (76)
- 52. A person born as a cāṇḍāla may become a muni and attain mokṣa. (76)
- 53. It is acceptable to worship an ornamented image of the Jina. (76)
- 54. Mokṣa is possible without giving up clothes and ornaments. (77)
- 55. The sun and moon in their original form came to greet Mahāvīra. (77)
- 56. The Digambara list of the eighteen faults from which a Jina is free is changed into a different list. (For example: They do not consider a kevalin to be free from hunger and thirst.) (78)

- 57. They also make changes in the list of thirty-four atisayas of a Tīrthankara. (78)
- 58. Camara, the king of the Vyantaras, went to conquer the king of the Saudharma heaven²⁹. (79)
- 59. Seeing his adamantine stick, Camara then came to take refuge at the feet of Mahāvīra. (79)
- 60. When a Jina attains nirvāṇa, his body does not evaporate entirely like a lightning (contrary to the Digambara belief). (80)
- 61. If a householder sees a muni who is suffering from lust, he may offer a woman to him so that he does not abandon his mendicant life. (80)
- 62. Even the body of a kevalin can cause destruction of beings. (80)
- 63. When Mahāvīra died, the gods gathered together and worshipped his jawbone³⁰. (81)
- 64. At the janma-kalyāṇaka of Mahāvīra, he shook Mount Meru (with his toe). (81)
- 65. There are only fourteen dreams, not sixteen (as the Digambaras hold), that foretell the birth of a Tirthankara³¹. (81)
- 66. Gangādevī lived for fifty-five thousand years. (82)
- 67. Cakravarti Bharata merely followed the ways of the world (i.e., he was unattached like a monk while still ruling his kingdom). (82)
- 68. There are not ninety-six bhogabhūmis. (83)
- 69. There is no fault in taking water from a leather bag. (83)
- 70. There is no fault in taking a meal prepared with ghee kept in a leather bag. (83) 71. There is no fault in eating food that has become stale. (83)
- 72. There is no fault in eating a whole (sāre?) fruit. (83)
- 73. The goddess Nīlāñjanā did not dance in front of Rṣabha to make him renounce the world (doubtful reading). (84)
- 74. Vardhamāna resolved while still in the womb of his mother that he would not renounce the world as long as his parents were alive³². (84)

- 75. Bāhubali was born as a twin (yugala) (doubtful reading of lines 4 and 5). (84)
- 76. Nābhi and Marudevī were twins (yugala) and Rṣabha was born to them. (85)
- 77. All yugalas have impurities in their bodies. (85)
- 78. All śalākā-puruṣas (included in the list of sixty-three) have nīhāra (they respond to the calls of nature). (85)
- 79. There are not one hundred Indras, but only sixty-four Indras. (86)
- 80. There are only twelve abodes of heaven, and not more. (86)
- 81. The Yādavas, although they followed the path of the Jinas, partook of meat. (86)
- 82. A human being can go beyond the mountain called Mānusottara. (86)
- 83. There are not twenty-four kāmadevas. (86)
- 84. In the nine uppermost heavens, there is no minimum age limit (i.e., they all have the same age?) [The last line of verse 87 is missing. The meaning of the third line is not clear.] (87)

Concluding verses:

These are the eighty-four points [corresponding, that is, leading to rebirth in] eighty-four hundred thousand yonis. Those who believe in these indeed are sporting in the ocean of samsāra. (88)

In the city of Agra, there lives the wise and learned Kaurapal. For his sake Kavi Hema composed this poem. (89)

I have not composed this work with any grudge [against the Śvetāmbaras] nor have I done this just to support my own view. This is a preaching consisting of truth. May it make good people happy. (90)

May these words of mine, which reveal the truth, illuminate the hearts of all. May they tear the cover of darkness in the form of doubt. Let there be an increase of knowledge and happiness. (91)

Thus ends the Caurāsī Bol, the Eighty-Four Points of Controversy.

I give below a list of the items found in Upādhyāya Yaśovijayjī's [Dikpaṭa] Caurāsī Bol [Pratyukti] based on the headlines appearing in the Gūrjara Sāhitya Sangraha, vol. 1, pp. 572-597. (Numbers at the end refer to verses.)

Introductory verses give an account of the origin of the Digambara sect in Vīra-nirvāṇa samvat 609, as narrated in the story of a muni called Sāhasamalla, a disciple of ācārya Kṛṣṇa. (1-17)

- 1. The [Śvetāmbara]list of the eighteen defects (doṣa) that are not found in a Kevalin differs from that of the Digambaras. (18-19)
- 2. The Kevalin does eat food by morsel (kevali-bhukti). (20-23)
- 3. The Tirthankara's body has the same seven components (sapta-dhātus) as any other human being. (20-23)
- 4. The Kevalin is subject to 11 kinds of hardships (parīṣahas). (24-33)
- 5. The Kevalin's speech consists of articulated words. (34)
- 6. All śalākā-purusas have nīhāra. (35-37)
- 7. Human beings may go outside the boundary of the Mānusottara Mountain. (38-39)
- 8. Cakravarti Bharata attained kevalajñāna while still in the state of a householder. (40-42)
- 9. Mokṣa is possible even of those possessing non-Jain mendicant insignia (anyaliṅga-mukti). (43)
- 10. It is possible for a woman, for example Malli-kumārī, to attain mokṣa (strīmukti). (44-47)
- 11. Even after becoming a kevalin, Bāhubali greeted respectfully (vinaya) Jina Rṣabha. (48)
- 12. Tirthańkaras do indeed give gifts of wealth for an entire year prior to their renunciation. (48)
- 13. Kapila, a kevalin, danced [in order to convert five hundred thieves to the holy path of mendicancy as narrated in his story, and hence there is no fault in it]. (48)

- 14. Malli and Nemi were the only two Jinas who did not marry. (49)
- 15. Draupadī did marry all the five Pāṇḍava brothers. (50)
- 16. A muni should collect alms by going from house to house (and not take his meal standing in one house as is the custom among the Digambaras). (50)
- 17. It is proper to worship an image of a Jina with items such as musk (kastūrī), etc. (51)
- 18. A naked image of a Jina is not auspicious; it is proper to worship an image of a Jina with ornaments. (52-53)
- 19. A Jina's nudity is not visible to anyone as Indra places an ambara (a piece of cloth) on his shoulder. (54)
- 20. The gaṇadhara Gautama did honor a parivrājaka, a mendicant of a non-Jaina order, for the sake of dharma. (55)
- 21. It is proper to make a sthāpanā of a Jaina monk (guru) in his absence similar to the image of a Jina. (56-57)
- 22. Śatruñjaya is a holy place (tīrtha). [This item is missing in the Digambara list.](58)
- 23. A Jain monk may give initiation (dīksā) and even preach a sermon (both of which are auspicious activities) while still maintaining the śuddha-upayoga. (59-63)
- 24. Vasudeva (father of Kṛṣṇa) had seventy-two thousands wives (i.e., more than a cakravarti. This is similar to Bāhubali being stronger than Bharata). (64-65)
- 25. Jamāli was the son-in-law of Jina Mahāvīra and he did start a wrong view (kumata, i.e., a nihnava). (66)
- 26. A disciple of Caṇḍarudrācārya attained kevalajñāna (while he was carrying his sick teacher on his shoulders). (67)
- 27. The vyavahāra naya is as important as the niścaya naya. (68-76)
- 28. The dravyārthika and the paryāyārthika nayas are equally important. (77-87)

- 29. Time (kāla) is not a dravya. (88-92)
- 30. Mahāvīra shook Mount Meru (with his toe) at the time of his janmakalyāṇaka. (93-94)
- 31. The ganadhara of Jina Munisuvrata was not a horse, contrary to what the Digambaras have alleged. (The true story is that a horse, a friend of the Jina in a former life, at the time of his death, received the teachings from him. He was reborn in heaven and he established an image of that Jina at Bhrgukaccha. That place came to be called Aśvaavabodha). (95–102)
- 32. The pañca namaskāra mantra consists of sixty-eight syllables. [This item is not found in the Digambara list.] (103-107)
- 33. The Tirthańkara teaches in Ardhamāgadhī. (108-109)
- 34. In the heavens the gods worship the jawbone of the Tīrthaṅkaras. (110)
- 35. One can attain moksa even if born in low families. (111-114)
- 36. There was the transfer of the embryo of Mahāvīra. (115)
- 37. The transfer of embryo does not result in Mahāvīra having two fathers. (116-121)
- 38. Bāhubali having attained kevalajñāna performed circumambulation (pradaksinā) to the Jina Rsabha, a proper thing to do. (122-123)
- 39. Mahāvīra sneezed. (124)
- 40. The bringing of the yugaliyas to Mathurā from Harivarṣa to establish the Harivamśa is a form of acherā. Such things do happen once in a while in the infinite time cycle. (125-129)
- 41. Camara arrived in the heavenly abode called Saudharma. (130)
- 42. Mahāvīra did wander in the non-aryan regions. (131)
- 43. Gods may have sexual relations with human females. (131)
- 44. The first preaching of Mahāvīra took place soon after his attaining kevalajñāna—and not after a silence of sixty-six days as believed by the Digambaras. (132-136)

- 45. The mother of a Tirthankara witnesses only fourteen dreams—not sixteen as believed by the Digambaras. (137)
- 46. The thirty-four atisayas of a Tīrthańkara are correct as they are listed by the Śvetāmbaras. (The Digambaras are wrong in including "absence of hunger" as an atisaya.) (138)
- 47. There is nothing wrong with taking water stored in a leather bag. (139)
- 48. It is not improper for a monk to receive food prepared from ghee that has been stored in a leather bag. (139)
- 49. Marudevi and Nābhi were twin brother and sister from whom Jina Rṣabha was born. There is nothing improper in this considering the time when it took place. (140-141)
- 50. It is proper for a sādhu to keep pātras for collecting food and water, clothes, and other requisites (upakaraṇas). (142-155)
- 51. The Jaina Āgamas are indeed still in existence (a fact disputed by the Digambaras). (156-157)

Concluding verses:

Hemaraj Pande has composed Eighty-four Points (Caurāsī Bol). Accordingly, we also have refuted them in this spoken language (bhāṣā). There are in the words of Digambaras a hundred more faults, but why waste time on them? (158-159)

A learned person has faith in that which is truthful, while a fool delights in falsehood. But if he were to trust only the true words and keep the company of saints, he would surely enjoy unbroken happiness. Thus says the Vācaka (i.e., Upādhyāya) Jasa (i.e., Yaśovijaya). (160-161)

I give below a copy of the manuscript of *Caurāsī Bol* (by Hemarāja Pāṇḍe) described above without any emendations as only a single manuscript was available for this edition. Doubtful readings are indicated by (?).

चौरासी बोल

(१) ॐ नम: सिद्धेभ्य:।

छप्पय छन्द —

सुनय पोष हत दोष मोक्ष मुख शिव पद दायक गुण मणि कोष सुघोष रोषहर तोष विधायक। एक अनंत सरूप सन्त वन्दित अभिनन्दित निज सुभाव परभाव भाव भासेइ अमंदित॥ अविदित चरित्र विलसित अमित सर्व मिलित अविलिस तन। अविचेलित कलित निज रस ललित जय जिन विदेलित कलिलघन॥॥॥

इकतीसा सवैया-

नाथ हिम भूधर तें निकसि गनेश चित्त भूपरि उतारी शिव सागर लों धाई है। परमत वाद मरयाद कूल उन्मूलि अनुकूल मारग सुभाय ढिर आई है। बुध हंस सेइ पापमल कों विध्वंस करै सुखंश सुमित विकासि वरदाई है। सपत अभंग भंग उठै है तरंग जामें ऐसी वानी गंग सखंग अंग गाई है॥२॥

दोहा—

सेतंबर मत की सुनी जिनते है मरजाद।
मिलहि दिगंबर स्यौं नहीं जे चौरासी बाद ॥३॥
तिन्ह की कछु संछेपता कहिए आगम जानि।
पढत सुनत जिनिके मिटै संसै मत पहिचानि॥४॥
संसय मत मैं और है अगनित कलिपत बात।
कौन कथा तिन्ह की कहै कहिए जगतविख्यात॥५॥

चौपाई---

जगत रीति सौजे न मिलाही, कहे अछेरे जिनमतमांही। जामै कथा कही बहुतेरी, संसय उपजावन भव बेरी ॥६॥ तातैं सेतंबर मत चाले, संसयमती जानि निखले भद्रबाहु स्वामी कै बारै, बारह वरस काल हुवसारें॥७॥ तहां भयो इनकौ अंकुरौ, क्रम क्रम बढत बढत हुवपूरौ। कहवित कौ यह जैन कहावै, भोजन सिवस नाम ज्यौं पावै ॥८॥ जो नर नांहि वस्तु का खोजी, सो न सुमत अमृतरस भोजी। अंतरहिष्ट होइ घट जाकै, भेदबुद्धि परकासै ताकै॥९॥

दोहरा---

आकदुम्ध्र अर गोदुग्ध, इनमैं बडौ विवेक। एक घटावै दिष्टि कौ, तेज बढावै एक ॥१०॥ कहा भयौ जौ पीत है. पीतल कनक न होइ। परगट करै निदग्ध लिख, मुगध न जानै सोइ॥११॥ कहत यथारथ सो लखै, जाकै होइ सुदिष्टि ! कहा लखै रवि कै उदय, जो नर अंध निकिष्टि ॥१२॥ कहै सुनै कछ होत नहि, जाकै घट परकास। सोइ नर निज अक्ष सौं, लखै सुलक्ष विलास ॥१३॥ जौं कठोर पाषान परि, वरसै मुसलधार। तौ भी मेघ न करि सकै, कोमलता गुनसार ॥१४॥ तावत ज्यौं प्रगट करें, अगनि सुदर्ब कुदर्ब्ब । त्यों ही बुध सत असत का, भेद करत है सर्व ॥१५॥ भूंसि उठतु स्वान ज्यौं, दुर्जन सुनि सुनि बात । तौ भी सत्यारथ कहै सधी सदा अवदात ॥१६॥ कहा करै सविता पिता, सबही कों सुख देइ। आधासीसी युक्त नर्, सो दुख सहज लहेइ ॥१७॥ यथारथ कल्पित कहै, जे नर अंध कुबद्धि। बंधन करि भव वन भमहि, लहिह न कबहु न सुद्धि ॥१८॥ वीतराग दुषनरहित, भूषन भूकल (?) जास। जिस जग भूषन देव कै, कहिंह अहार गरास ॥१९॥

सवया इकतीसा—

केवली आहार करै मानत ही लागतु है दूषन अठारै महाप्रमाद मोहियै। मोहकर्म नास कारि बीरज अनंत धारी ताहि भूख लगै ऐसे कहतन सोहियै॥ भुंजत अनंत सुख भोजन सौ कौन काज आदितके वंदे कहाँ कहा दीप वोहियै। काहू परकार ईस कौंन कबल आहार जे कहे है तिन्हकें जग्यो है पा[प] कहिये ॥२०॥

मोहनी करम नासै वेदनी को बल नासै
विस के विनासै ज्यों भुजंगम की हीनता।
इंद्रिनि के ग्यान सौ न सुख दुख वेदै जहाँ
वेदनी कौ स्वाद वेदै इंद्रीयी अधीनता॥
आतमीक अंतर अनंत सुख वेदै जहाँ
बाहिर निरंतर है साता की अछीनता।
तहां भूख आदिक असाता कहा बल करै
विस कणिका न करै सागर मलीनता॥२१॥

देव मानसी कही अहार तैं तृपित होइ नारकीक जीविन कौं कर्म कौं अहार है। नर तिर्यंच कैं प्रगट कवला आहार एक इंद्री धारक के लेप कौ आधार है॥ अंडे की विरिध होइ ओजाहार सेवन तै पंखी उर ऊषमा तै ताकी बढ़वार है। नोकर्मवर्गना कौ केवली के है आहार थितिकारक है जो न सविकार है॥२२॥

दोहरा---

और जीव कौ लगत निह, तनपोषक सुखदाइ। समय समय जगदीप कौं, लगैं वरगना आइ॥२३॥

छपय--

क्षुधा त्रिषा भय दोष रोग जर मरणजनम मद
मोह खेद परसेद नीद विस्मय चिंता गद रित विषाद ।
ए दोष निह अष्टदश जाकै केवलग्यान अनंत
दरसन सुख वीरज ताकै निह सपत धातु ॥
सब मल रिहत परमौदारिक तन सिहत अंतर अनंत
सुख रस सरस सो जिनेस मुनिपति सिहत ॥२४॥

दोहरा—

जिहां आहार बनै नहीं, तहां कयौं होइ निहार। परगट दूषन देखि यै, इसमै कौन विचार॥२५॥ कलिप विकलिपी कहतु है, और दोष विकसल । निर्मल केविलनाथ के, है निहार मलजाल॥२६॥

चौपइ—

जौ मुनि तपवी रिद्धि के धारी, गहत अहार ते न नीहारी। क्यों करि सकल जगत के स्वामी, करै निहार अमलपदगामी ॥२७॥

दोहरा--

जाकै देखि मिटै विकट घोर उपद्रव वर्ग । दोष होइ ताकौं कहै रोग और उपसर्ग ॥२८॥

सवैया इकतीसा--

कहै कोउ कोध साला (?) हुवौ है गोसाला मुनि तिनितेजोञ्चालमाला छोडी परजलती। वीरके समोसरिण दाहे जिन दोइ मुनि ताकी झाल स्वामीहू कौ पहुची उछलती॥ तहां भयो उपसर्ग नाही उषमा तै फिरि उदर की व्याधि लइ आमलो प्रज्वलती। परगट दोष जांनि तजै असौ सरधान जानवान जिनिकै सुजोति जगी बलती॥२९॥

दोहरा---

जनमत ही मित श्रुति अविध, तीन ग्यान घट जास । कहै पढ़ियों वट साल सों, वर्धमान गुनवास ॥३०॥ कहै और सितवास सब (?) जब जिन होइ विराग । एक वरस लौं दान दे, अंत करें घरत्याग ॥३१॥ जिन वैराग दसा धरत, त्याग सब पर भाव । कहा जानि आपनौ करों, पाछै दान बताव ॥३२॥ धरै दिगंबर दसा जिन, पाछै अंबर आनि । इंद धरै जिनकंधपरि यह संसयमित मानि ॥३३॥

चौपड़----

गनधर विना वीर की धनी निफल, खिरी न काहू मानी। समिकतव्रत का भया न धारी, कोउ तहां कहै सविकारी॥३४॥

दोहरा---

के न खिरै जौ खिरै, तौ होइ सफल तहकीक। खिरै फलविना जे कहैं, तिनकी वात अलीक॥३५॥

अडिल्ल-

लोकनाथ सो जिनवर जाकों पूत है, तिस माता स्यौ कहै और परसूत है। अदिनाथ कौ प्रगट कहतु है जुगलीया, तिनहींकों फिरि कहै भए ते पतितिया ॥३६॥

चौपइ—

कहै जुगलीया कोउ मुंबौ ताकी तियन रंडापौ हुबौ । सोई रिषभदेव घरि आनी, भई सुनंदा दूजी रानी ॥३७॥

सोरठा—

करै न निंदित काज जो समानिक होई जन। क्यों किर श्री जिनराज करै अकारज विधिकरन ॥३८॥ कहै कोउ कहै कोउ रिषभ थौ विप्र तिसूं देवानन्द तिय ता गाँभ जिन वीर उतर्यों। दिन असी तिनिल (?) बस्यौ तिहां तब इंद्र समर्यों होन जाति दुज कुल विषै महापुरुष अवतार जोगि नांहि तातै करों और गरभ संचार॥३९॥

सोखः—

कीयौ इन्द्र आदेस हिरनगवेषी देवकौ । कीधौ तास परवेस त्रिसला के तिनि गर्भमें ॥४०॥

चौपइ---

पहिलै गर्भ क्यों न हिर लीनों, आसी दिन बीते क्यों कीनों। पहिलै कहा जाने हो नांहीं, कहा विचारि धारि मनमांहीं ॥४१॥

अडिल्ल—

दिज घरवासि सिद्धारथ घर जब संचरित ।
गरभ कल्यानक कहाँ कहां जिन काँ कर्यों ॥
जौ दुज घरि ताँ होइ होनता इसकी
सिद्धारथ घरि कीया न बनै हदीस की ॥४२॥
जौ दोनौ घरि ताँ कल्यानक छह गनौ ।
जौ दोनौ के नाहि तुछ पर्यों हीलनौ ।
सीलभंग ताँ होइ जिनेश्वरमात का
जातै वीरज नांहि सिद्धारथ तात का ॥४३॥

चौपइ---

जहां बात का नांहि निबेरी(रा), तहां कलपि करि कहै अछेरा। ऐसी बानी मूढ बखानै, दरसन मोहे लीन सरद्यानै ॥४४॥

दोहरा—

पंच कुमार जिनेस है सत्यारथ मत मांहि।
मिक्स नेमि एइ कुमर कहै दोई अरु नांहि॥४५॥
तीर्थंकर जिन कीं नमै सामानिक जिन होई।
कहै बाहुबलि केवली नयौ(म्यौ) रिषभ के पाई॥४६॥

सबैया इकतीसा--

अरिहंत पद वंदि वंदक सरूप मेरी, एैसे भाव परमाद गुनताइ बहे है। सातमी धरातै आगै आतमीक रस जागै, तहां वंद्यवंदक विभाव नांही रहे है।। साधकदसा मै जहां बाधक है ऐसे भाव, तहां जिन जिन वंदै मंद कैसै कहै है। पूरन सरूपधारी वीतराग अविकारी, वंदनीक एकै मांनी ग्यानी सरदहै है।।४७।।

सवैया तेईसा---

केवलग्यानिवषै जिनवीर कहै अनजान अचानक छींक्यौ। सो न बनै तब छींक उठै जब वात कफामय पित्त जीकौ॥ धातु विवर्जित निर्मल इ(ई) स सरीरविषै नहीं रोग रती कौ। छींक कलंक अडंकित अंकित सुद्ध दसा तहि दोष नहीं कौ॥४८॥

अडिल्ल-

तिरदंडी तापसी कुलंगी भेस रचै आवत सुनि जिन वीरनाथ उपदेसयौ(?)। गौतम स्वामी गनधर व्रत धरै जैन कौ वाकी सनमुख गयौ भवाति सौं लेनकौ॥४९॥

दोहरा---

अविरत सम्यकदरसनी, करै न कुमती मन । क्यों करि गनधर पूज्य पद, करै सुभ गति विधान ॥५०॥ जाकी सोलहस्वर्ग तैं आगै नाही गम्य । तिस नारी कौ यौ कहै रम्यै(?) मोक्षपद रम्य ॥५१॥

सवैया इकतीसा—

जाकै सब मलद्वार धारे है निगोद भा(?)र कबहूं न अविकार हिंसा तै रहतु है। सिथिल सुभाव लिए परपंच सब किए लाज कौ समाज(?) धरै अंबर बहुत है॥ छट्ठा गुनथांन नांहि थिरता न ध्यान मांहि मास मास रितु ताहि संकता लहतु है। जगत विलंबिनी कौ हीनदसा लंबिनी कौ यातै ही नितंबिनी कौ मोख न कहतु है॥५२॥

दोहरा---

मुकति कामिनी कौ रमै न कामिनि

X X X X X होइ(?) परगट ही देख ॥५३॥

समयविरोधी देखीयै परगट चित न विचार।

मिह्निनाथ जिन कौ कहै मिह्नकुमारि नारि॥५४॥

अडिल्ल-स्वर्गभूमि पाताललोक मै देखियौ, नारी नायक सुनौ कहूं न विसेषियै।

जगतबंधु अरिहंत देवपद कौ धरै, पर अधीन जो हीन निंद पद आचरै॥५५॥

चौपइ—

जों नारी कों जिनपद मानों, तो ताकी प्रतिमा करि जानों।
पुरुष आकार एक ही बंदों, नारीरूप क्यों न अधिनंदों ॥५६॥
जो नितंबिनी बन सोहै, कुचरूपादिक मंडित हो है।
तो लज्जा करि कामिनी रूपी, क्यों करि जिनवर होहि अनुखी ॥५७॥

दोहरा---

जाके दरसत परसत रागादिक मिटि जाइ। तिस नररूपी ईस कों वंदौ सीस नवाइ॥५८॥

चौपडु—

कहै युगल हरिखेत निवासी, काहू देव हर्यों सिवलासी।
पूरब बैर जानि दुख दीनौ, अवगाहन किर छायौ कीनौ ॥५९॥
सोइ भरतखंड फिरि आन्यौ, मथुरानगर राज दे मान्यौ।
पापी किर तिनि मांस खवायौ, नरक नगर के पंथ चलायौ॥६०॥
तिसके कुलि हरिबंस बखानै, सत्यारथ उपदेस न मानै।
जुगल सर्व ही सुरगतिगामी, नरक न सेविह तिरियु(?) परिणामी ॥६१॥
दोइ कोस की तिसकी काया, सुर क्यों किर लघु रूप बनाया।
जौ तुम ईसिह अछेरा मानौ, तौ भी नाहि बनै मनि आनौ॥६२॥
काल अनंत अनंत गए तै, एक एक ही युगल गहे तै।
सब हरिखेत भूमि का खालो, व्हैकै मिटै जुगल परनालो॥६३॥

दोहरा---

सब गणती के युगल है घटे बढ़ै नहीं कोइ।
मरणकाल ही जुगल कैं आइ युगलीया होइ॥६४॥
राखत चउदह उपकरण मुनि कौ नाही दोष।
परिग्रहत्यागदसा विषै करिहि परिग्रह पोष॥६५॥

जिंह परमाणु समान निह परिग्रह ग्रह कौ संच। तहां कहौ क्यों किर बनै वस्त्रादिक परपंच ॥६६॥

सवैया इकतीसा—

काल पाय मैले होइ आसा होइ धोवन की धोयें नासै संसय में और भविस तारे(?) हैं। नास भये मांगने कौ त्रास होइ नासने के डरतें सुध्यान विषे थिरता विसारे हैं।। देह दुति मंडन है ब्रह्मचर्य खंडन है जिनिलिंग लंडन है तातै पट डारे है। संवर धरनहार अंबर से अविकार होइ की निरंबर दिगंबर ही धारे है।।६७॥

दोहरा—

समयादिक परजाय कौ काल हरषं(?) समुझाहि । काल अणू जाणै नहीं ते असंख्य जगमाहि ॥६८॥

छप्पय—

काल अणू जौ नाहि समय तौ होइ कहो ते सुथिर। वस्तुविन नांहि नास उतपत्ति तहातै असन(?) जनम॥ जै होइहो उषर(?) -श्रम जगत मैं वृद्धि होउ परधान(?)। और क्षणभंगुरमत मै नहि सधै वस्तु सीमा चित्र(?)॥ प्रल[य]जनम नास थिरभाव बिना थिरता निमित्त। समयादि की काल अणू जिंग कहिह जिन ॥६९॥

सवैया इकतीसा—

मानै जो मुनिसुव्रत को गनधर घोरौ भयौ काहू काज के निमित्त मांस मुनि गहे है। घरि घरि विहरि अन्न मांगि मांगि कहै मुनि थान आनि भोजन को लहे है। जिजमतिनंदक को ठौर मारै पाप नही निर्दय सुभाव धरि काहू की न सहै है। साची वात झूठी कहै वस्तु को न भेद लहै हठ रीति गहे रहै मिथ्या वात कहे है। अति ने ब्राह्मी बहनि कहै नारी कीनी महासती दोष लाइ भववास चहे है। ग्रहवास वसतै ही केवली भरत भयौ आरसीकै मंदिर में मानि निरवहे है।

द्रौपदी सती को कहै भइ पंच भरतारी
अंधबंध भारीकिर संकट मैं फहै है ॥
साची वात झूठी कहै वस्तु को न भेद लहै
हठ रीति गिह रहै मिथ्यावात कहै है ॥७१॥
कोउ मुनि कंध पिर पंथ मैं गुरु को लिए
चलें जात केवली भयो है सरहै है ।
कहे है जमाइ वीरनाथ को जमाली नामा वीर है कुमारौ सुनि लरने को खहै है ॥
कबक ध्रवक किर केवली किपल नाचौ
मूख रिझावने को ऐसी मानि रहे है ।
सांची वात झूठी कहै वस्तु को न [भेद]लहै
हठ रीति गिह रहै मिथ्यावात कहै है ॥७२॥

छपय—

कहै बहुत्तरि सहस भइ वसुदेव बधूगन धनुष पंच सै उच्च बाहुबलि कहिहि धर्यों तन । सूद्रजाति घरि असन करत मुनि दोष न पावै देवमनुष्यणी भोग भोगवै हि सुरत वधावै(?) ॥ एक गरभ मांहि सुलसा धरै सुत बत्तीस बने नहि(?) पहिलै त्रिपिष्ट वसुदेव की नानति(?) उतपति मानहि ॥७३॥

मानै वीर विहार अनारज देस भूमि पर कहिहि मलेछ चतुर्थकाल सारे हुये(?) भरि(?)। देवलोक तै चारि कोस कौ कहि अवधारै प्राण जात ब्रतभंग करत निह पाप विचारे॥ उपवास माहि ओषध लभत ब्रती न धारै दोष मल चौसठि हजार नारी राखे चकवित धरि तन नवल(?)॥७४॥

समोसरण जिन नगन नांहि दीसै परवानैं(?) अविक तन(?) नभवस्त्र राग कारन सरधानिह। लाठी राख जती कहे अरु कर्ण वधाविह(?) जग(गज) उपिर ही मुगति गइ मरुदेवि बताविह॥ नारी अगम्य दुरधर कठिन पंच महाव्रत पग धरिह। न हि लहिह दोषबलहीन मुनि वारवार भोजन करिह॥७५॥

गीता छन्द—

दरिवत्त कि क्रिया बिन भाविलिंग गृहस्थ केवल पद धरे। चंडालादिक जाति तिह मुनि मुकति तनव(?) बसि करै॥ आभर्ण सिहत जिनेसप्रतिमा रागकारण मानते। अनिमल बखानिह और मानिह कलपना सरधान तैं॥७६॥ साभरण बसन मुगित चाहै मानि परिग्रह हठ गहै।
रिव चंद मंडल मूल आया वीर वंदन को कहै।।
सासुती गित मरजाद मेटिहं सूर सिस की जानते।
अनिमल बखानिह और मानिह कलपना सरधान तै।।७७।।
दूषन अठारह माहि बदलै कहै और सवारिकै।
चौतीस अतिसय बदल केई गहिह और विचारिकै।।
जिनिम(?) तै विनासी सौं(?) लरिह मुनि दोष रंच न बानतै(?)
अनिमल बखानिह और मानिह कलपना सरधान तै।।७८।।
सोधरम सुरपित जीतने को चमर वितरपित गयौ।
तसु वज्रदण्ड विलास पंडित कहिहि वीर सरिन भयौ॥
कर पूषत(?) मिर गयै न खिरै युगल तनु परवान तै।
अनिमल बखानिह और मानिह कलपना सरधान तै।।७९॥

निरबान होत जिनेस काया खिरै दामिनि बत ही। वर नारि दे थिर करै श्रावक देखि कामी मुनि कही॥ केवली तनु तै जीवबध है कहै मत मदपान तै। अनमिल बखानहि और मानहि कलपना सरधान तै॥८०॥

सुर मिले जिन दाढ पूजिह इंद्र जिन जब सिव गमै। जिन वीर मेरु अचल चलयों जनम कल्यानक समै॥ जिनजनम सूचक सुपन चौदह और नहीं मन आन तैं। अनमिल बखानिह और मानै कलपना संस्थान तै॥८१॥

दोहा--

गंगा देबी स्यौ कहै पचपन्न वर्ष हज्जार। चकवर्ति भरतेस नै कियो लोग व्यवहार॥८२॥

अडिल्ल—

भोगभूमि छानवै न गनिह उछेदि कै, चर्म नीर मै दोष न लागै वेदि कै। घृत करि साधित वासी भोजनु लेतु है, सारे फल कौ भुंजत दोष न देतु है॥८३॥

सवया इकतीसा—

रिषभ विसगता निमित्त नीलंजना नृत्य मानै नहीं देव देवी की(?) कीनी विधान की। माता पिता जीवतें विसगता कौं नाहि धरै बीर वर्धमान असी गर्भवास आन की।। बाह्बल कौ कहै कि युगल सरूप धारी हाड पूजै कौडे(?) थापि कहै परिवान की(?)। नाभि मरुदेवी कैं जुगल धरम मानतु है। तिनहीतै जिन उतपत्ति सरधान की।।८४।।

चौपइ--

होहि जुगलीया सब मलधारी, कहै सलाका पुरुष निहारी। चौसिठ इन्द्र न अधिके जानै, बारह देवलोक ही मानै ॥८५॥ जे जादौ (=यादव) जिन मारग पक्षी, तिनकौ कहै मांस के भक्षी। मनुज मानुषोत्तर के आगै, जाहै कहै न दूषन लागै॥८६॥

रोडक--

कहै नाही नाही काम चडवीस अरु नवै नवोत्तरे लघु समुद्र मांन नाही। ऐरापित नर तिज खेत एक सों साठि मांही [one line missing?———॥[८७]॥ चौरासी लख जोनि है ए चौरासी बोल। जै मानै ते मानि है भवसागर कल्लोल॥८८॥

दोहा----

नगर-आगरा मैं वसे कौरपाल सग्यान ।
तिस निमित्त किव हैम नै कियें किवत परवांन ॥८९॥
दोष भाव धिर निहं कियो, कियो न निज मत पोष ।
सत्यारथ उपदेस यह, कर्यों सुजन संतोष ॥९०॥
सत्यारथ वानी प्रगट, घटघट करौ उदोत ।
संयम(संसय) तिमिर पट[ल]फटौ, बढ्यौ ग्यान सुख होत ॥९१॥
इति चतुरासीतिर्व्वाद: सर्व पाखंड...
इति चौरासी बोल समाप्तः ॥
लिखतं स्वामी वेणीदास अवरंगावाद मिह संवत् १७२३ पोस सुदि पंचमी ।
यह पोथी का पत्र ९ अंक पत्र नव छै ।
या पोथी साह जो x x x x x वाकी छै ॥
ग्रंथाग्रंथ संख्या ॥...॥मुकाम सांगानैर मध्ये॥

Annotations:

- Jain Satya Prakāśa, vol. 21. I would like to thank Dr. John Cort for providing me with a copy of this article.
- Kasturchand Kasliwal, ed., Rajasthān ke Jain Śāstra Bhandārom kī Grantha-sūcī, Jaipur 1957, part 2, entry # 320.
- Pravacanasāra of Kundakunda, ed. A. N. Upadhye, Rājacandra Jaina Śāstramālā, Agas 1964, pp. 105-106.

- 4. Kasturchand Kasliwal, Kavivar Bulakhichand Bulakidas, evam Hemaraj, Śrī Mahāvīra Grantha Akādamī, Jaipur 1983, pp. 205-228.
- 5. Strînirvāṇa-Kevalibhuktiprakaraṇe of Śākaṭāyana, ed. Muni Jambūvijayjī, Jaina Ātmānanda Sabhā, Bhavnagar 1974.
- 6. Paul Dundas, "Food and Freedom: The Jaina Sectarian Debate on the Nature of the Kevalin." Religion, vol. 15, London 1985, pp. 161-198. See also P. S. Jaini, "Kevalibhuktivicāra of Bhāvasena: Text and Translation," Researches in Indian and Buddhist Philosophy: Essays in Honour of Professor Alex Wayman, ed. R. K. Sharma, Delhi 1993, pp. 163-178.
- P. S. Jaini, Gender and Salvation: Jaina Debates on the Spiritual Liberation of Women, Berkeley 1991.
- 8. It may be noted here that Upādhyāya Meghavijaya (of the Tapāgaccha, c. 1653-1704), a contemporary of Upādhyāya Yaśovijaya, in his Sanskrit Yuktiprabodha Svopajña-vṛtti has also responded to the eighty-four points raised against the Śvetāmbaras by Hemaraj. This work appears not to have come to the attention of Professor Hiralal Kapadia. Hiralal Kapadiya, Gūrjara Sāhitya Saṅgraha, part 1, 1936, pp. 572-597. An earlier edition of this appears in Śrī Prakaraṇa-ratnākara, Nirnayasagara Press 1903, part 1, pp. 566-574.

नव्याशाम्बरा वाराणसीयाः श्वेताम्बरगीतार्थेभ्यो व्याख्यानं श्रृण्वन्तोऽन्यजनस्य तच्छासनश्रद्धाविभंगाय चतुरशीर्ति जल्पान्...चकुः, तन्निबन्धोऽपि कवित्वरीत्या हेमराजपण्डितेन निबद्धः ।

- (p. 172 ff., published by Rishabhadeva Kesharimal Śvetāmbara Samstha, Ratlam, 1928).
- 9. Helen M. Johnson, trans., *Triṣaṣṭiśalākāpuruṣacaritra*, 6 vols., Oriental Institute of Baroda 1931-1962, vol. 6, p. 227. Henceforth *TSPC*.
- TSPC, vol. 6, p. 33. In fact, however, according to Hemacandra, the Jina teaches grammar to Indra.
- 11. TSPC, vol. 6, p. 37.
- 12. TSPC, vol. 6, p. 38.
- 13. TSPC, vol. 6, p. 125.
- 14. TSPC, vol. 6, p. 127.
- 15. TSPC, vol. 6, p. 25.
- 16. TSPC, vol. 6, p. 38-40.
- 17. TSPC, vol. 6, p. 26.

- 18. TSPC, vol. 1, p. 326.
- 19. For the Digambara version of this story, see *Harivamśa Purāṇa of Jinasena*, ed. Pannalal Jain, Delhi 1962, sarga 15, pp. 230-235.
- 20. TSPC, vol. 4, p. 86.
- 21. TSPC, vol. 1, pp. 376-378.
- 22. TSPC, vol. 6, pp. 34-36.
- 23. TSPC, vol. 6. pp. 193-195.
- 24. TSPC, vol. 6, p. 299.
- 25. TSPC, vol. 6, pp. 142-143.
- 26. TSPC, vol. 6, p. 10. He was born to an incestuous marriage of a king to his daughter.
- 27. TSPC, vol. 6, p. 84.
- 28. TSPC, voi. 1, p. 197.
- 29. TSPC, vol. 6, pp. 106-109.
- 30. TSPC, vol. 6, p. 352.
- 31. TSPC, vol. 6, p. 29.
- 32. TSPC, vol. 6, p. 28.