Eastern School Bibliographic Guides

Sanskrit Language Study: A Selected Bibliography with Annotations

No. 1, issued Feb. 1993

Eastern School Bibliographic Guides

Sanskrit Language Study: A Selected Bibliography with Annotations

No. 1, issued Feb. 1993

Eastern School Bibliographic Guides are compiled and annotated by David Reigle, in collaboration with Nancy Reigle, who are solely responsible for their content.

Contents

Introduction 3
Sanskrit-English Dictionaries 4
English-Sanskrit Dictionaries 5
Introductory Sanskrit Study 6
Sanskrit Course Textbooks 7
Sanskrit Readers 10
Simplified Sanskrit Grammars 12
Sanskrit Reference Grammars 13
Sanskrit Syntax 16
Vedic Sanskrit 18
Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit 20
Traditional Sanskrit Study 21
Modern Spoken Sanskrit 23
Suggested Selections 24

1st edition, Feb. 1993
2nd enlarged edition, June 1993

Published by: Eastern School Press
3185 Boyd Rd.
Cotopaxi, CO 81223-9688
U.S.A.

Introduction

Sanskrit is the most perfect language known. It is, as its name means, "perfected, refined, polished, finished, well put together, perfectly constructed." It is constructed from verb roots, which undergo regular processes to form noun or verb stems, which in turn are given declensional or conjugational endings. Its classical grammar, that written by Pāṇini some centuries before the Christian era, is also the most perfect known. Sanskrit grammar, or vyākaraṇa, is as its name means, the "taking apart" of the words of the language, which are so regularly and "perfectly constructed" as to allow such analysis. It is also unique among the world's languages in having its alphabet sounds systematically arranged on a scientific basis. Sanskrit is the eldest sister of all Indo-European languages, being in the words of Sir William Jones, "more perfect than the Greek, more copious than the Latin and more exquisitely refined than either." It is thus a linguist's dream, and has even been considered by computer programmers as the basis of an "artificial intelligence" language.

How is it that a language as perfect as Sanskrit has come into existence? According to Indian tradition, Sanskrit is not a humanly evolved language, but is the language of the gods (deva-vāṇi, daivī-vāk). As such it has special sanctity and special efficacy. Its verb roots are thought to be the primal vibrations which brought the worlds and everything in them into manifestation. Sanskrit words are thought to be the true or archetypal names of their referents, not just arbitrary appellations. For this reason Sanskrit has been in India pre-eminently the language of mantra, i.e., Sanskrit words recited for their effect as sound.

But perhaps the main reason that most people undertake study of Sanskrit is to directly access its voluminous writings, including sacred texts of Hinduism, Buddhism, and Jainism. There exist thousands upon thousands of untranslated Sanskrit manuscripts. Even among the important texts that have been translated, anyone who has compared a few different translations of the same work will quickly see that their meaning cannot be captured in a single translation, and in many cases cannot be captured in a European language like English at all.

Sanskrit-English Dictionaries

A Sanskrit-English Dictionary, by Horace Hayman Wilson. 1st ed. 1819; 2nd ed. 1832; 3rd rev. ed. 1874; rev. & enlarged 1900; reprint of 1900 ed. with 1819 preface (no preface in other eds.) Delhi: Nag Publishers, 1979.

A Sanskrit-English Dictionary, by Sir Monier Monier-Williams. 1st ed. 1872; new ed., greatly enlarged and improved, 1899; reprint, all Oxford University Press; reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1963, etc.; reprint New Delhi: Munshiram Manoharlal, 1976.

The Practical Sanskrit-English Dictionary, by Vaman Shiv[a]ram Apte. 1st ed. 1890; 2nd rev. and enlarged ed. 1912; rev. and enlarged ed., Poona, 1957 (3 vols.); 4th rev. and enlarged ed. (reprint of 1912 ed. plus 112 p. addenda of new words) Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1965, etc.; reprint of 1957 ed. Kyoto: Rinsen Book Company, 1978, etc. (compact ed., 3 vols. in 1).

An Encyclopaedic Dictionary of Sanskrit on Historical Principles, general editor, A. M. Ghatage. Poona: Deccan College Postgraduate and Research Institute, vol. 1 [a-ach], 1976-1978; vol. 2 [aj-ad], 1979-1981; etc.

The most widely used Sanskrit-English dictionaries today are those of Monier-Williams and V. S. Apte. Though Wilson's pioneering dictionary has in effect been superseded by these more complete ones, Prof. R. V. Joshi recommended that it be reprinted because it is the only one which gives etymologies, a very useful feature. Comparing Monier-Williams' dictionary with Apte's, the former's entries include or are in roman transliteration, while the latter's entries are all in devanāgarī script (as are Wilson's). Thus casual users or students not yet fluent with devanāgarī will require Monier-Williams'. They should note, however, that the transliteration system used therein is not the international one now in use. Sanskrit teachers sometimes prefer Apte's so that their students are required to use the script. Monier-Williams' draws on a wider range of sources for his vocabulary (about 500 compared to Apte's about 250), and his entries are fuller and include more compounds. Apte's includes more vocabulary from literary works such as dramas, poetry,

etc., and his entries are easier to use (assuming fluency with devanāgarī), in that the different meanings of a word are numbered. Often the primary meaning of an entry among the different meanings listed must be found by reference to its use in compounds, particularly in Monier-Williams'.

Far and away the most ambitious Sanskrit dictionary project ever undertaken is the monumental *Encyclopaedic Dictionary of Sanskrit on Historical Principles* being published from Poona. It is modeled on the Oxford English Dictionary, in that for each meaning of each entry, it quotes a sentence in which the word occurs in that meaning, and gives the reference for the quotation. To achieve this a team of scholars started in 1948 to go through and excerpt words and illustrative quotations from about 1500 Sanskrit books. The dictionary will, it is hoped, include virtually all words in the Sanskrit language, estimated to be about two million. Of course, relatively new fields like Buddhist tantric literature are not fully covered in the 1500 books selected for inclusion (represented here by only the *Hevajra* and *Guhyasamāja Tantras*). The entries include both devanāgarī and roman transliteration (in the now universally used international transliteration system). It is issued in fascicles, three of which make one bound volume. The plan was to issue one fascicle per year, starting in 1976. The first two volumes (six fascicles) cover just over half of the first letter of the alphabet, so as can be seen, it will take several decades yet to complete. No serious research library will be complete without it.

English-Sanskrit Dictionaries

A Dictionary, English and Sanskrit, by Monier Williams. 1st ed. 1851; reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1976, etc.; reprint as *English-Sanskrit Dictionary*, by Sir Monier Monier-Williams. New Delhi: Munshiram Manoharlal, 1976.

The Student's English-Sanskrit Dictionary, by Vaman Shivram Apte. 1st ed. 1884; 3rd rev. and enlarged ed. 1920; reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1960, etc.

Monier-Williams' English-Sanskrit dictionary (1851) was prepared before he undertook his Sanskrit-English dictionary

(1872), and thus it was not able to benefit from his later work, but instead drew largely on Wilson's early Sanskrit-English dictionary (1819, 1832). No revised edition was ever prepared. Similarly, Apte's English-Sanskrit dictionary (1884) was prepared before he undertook his Sanskrit-English dictionary (1890), but his had the advantages of more predecessors to consult, including both of Monier-Williams' dictionaries, and particularly Anundoram Borooah's English-Sanskrit dictionary, and also had the advantage of having a revised edition (1920). So although Monier-Williams' dictionary is larger than Apte's, it is in this case not necessarily better.

Introductory Sanskrit Study

Sanskrit Pronunciation: Booklet and Cassette, by Bruce Cameron Hall. Pasadena: Theosophical University Press, 1992.
First Lessons in Sanskrit Grammar and Reading, by Judith M. Tyberg. Los Angeles: East-West Cultural Center, 1964, etc.
Introduction to Sanskrit, Part One, by Thomas Egenes. San Diego: Point Loma Publications, 1989.
Sanskrit: Essentials of Grammar and Language, by Kurt F. Leidecker, 1st ed. 1934; reprint 1966; 2nd ed. Adyar, Madras: The Adyar Library and Research Centre, 1976.

Sanskrit Pronunciation, by Bruce Cameron Hall, Ph.D. Harvard, should be studied by all who read literature containing Sanskrit words. The accompanying tape makes it an effortless way to learn "to pronounce Sanskrit words so that they are recognizable to Indian scholars." (p.1). The booklet contains "Sanskrit words often found in theosophical texts, with brief definitions." It includes terms from both Hinduism and Buddhism which are commonly used in writings on those subjects as well.

Textbooks used in Sanskrit courses at universities move too fast to allow most students to fully absorb everything that is covered at the time. Study of a simplified text beforehand, such as Judith Tyberg's *First Lessons in Sanskrit Grammar and Reading*, can be very helpful in offsetting this drawback. It is based on James R. Ballantyne's *First Lessons in Sanskrit*, first published in 1851, which indeed states itself to be "intended to precede

the study of any regular Sanskrit Grammar." It includes useful appendices listing noun and pronoun declension paradigms, verb conjugation paradigms, and a complete listing of the sandhi rules.

Thomas Egenes' *Introduction to Sanskrit: Part One* "is not a complete survey of Sanskrit grammar, or even a primer," but similar to Tyberg's in function, "is meant to be more of a 'pre-primer,' a basic step-by-step introduction to the fundamental aspects of the language." (p. vii). Like Tyberg's, it shows how to write the devanāgarī characters, but spreads this out over five lessons. Being confronted with learning forty-nine new characters, and all at once, can be overwhelming; but as T. Saraydarian said, it is quite easy if you merely take one per day. The principle of "small, learnable steps" has been followed in this book. It includes "answers to exercises" for students on their own.

Kurt Leidecker's *Sanskrit: Essentials of Grammar and Language* presents an overview or outline of the language. For many of us, it is important to see a map of where we are going before entrusting ourselves to even the best of drivers. This book gives a list of all commonly used verb-roots, nearly 300, with meanings. It is these action-phonemes, rather than noun-roots, or thing-phonemes, which are the basic building blocks of the Sanskrit language. In fact, in the Hindu doctrine of śabda-brahman, or sound as brahman, these verb-roots are thought to be the basic building blocks of the universe itself. The book then shows how words, both nouns and verbs, are built from these verb-roots according to the regular processes of Sanskrit grammar.

Sanskrit Course Textbooks

Devavāṇīpraveśikā: An Introduction to the Sanskrit Language, by Robert P. Goldman and Sally J. Sutherland. 1st ed. 1980; 2nd rev. ed. 1987; reprinted with corrections, 1992; Berkeley: Center for South and Southeast Asia Studies, University of California.

A Rapid Sanskrit Method, by George L. Hart III. 1st ed. Madison: South Asian Studies, University of Wisconsin, 1972; reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1986.

A Sanskrit Manual for High Schools, by R. Antoine. 2 vols. Calcutta: Xavier Publications, 1953, etc.

Sanskrit: An Introduction to the Classical Language, by Michael Coulson. New York: David McKay Co., Inc., 1976 (Teach Yourself Books: Hodder and Stoughton).

Sanskrit Sandhi and Exercises, by M. B. Emeneau and B. A. van Nooten. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1952; 2nd rev. ed. 1968.

For several decades Sanskrit instruction in American universities meant the "Perry-Whitney-Lanman method," i.e., *A Sanskrit Primer*, by Edward Delavan Perry (1885, 1913, 1936), *Sanskrit Grammar*, by William Dwight Whitney (see below), and *A Sanskrit Reader*, by Charles Rockwell Lanman (see below). The serious drawbacks of this system are well-known to all of us who experienced it, and are a major contributing factor to the appalling rate of attrition among first-year Sanskrit students. The *Devavāṇīpraveśikā*, written by University of California (Berkeley) teachers Robert Goldman and Sally Sutherland after extensive work in India, has now thankfully replaced Perry's *Sanskrit Primer* at most American universities. It is designed for the first two quarters of a three quarter school year. The *Devavāṇīpraveśikā* is written for today's students, so cannot and does not assume any previous foreign language study, as did the Perry-Whitney-Lanman method with its reliance on analogy to Greek and Latin. It utilizes the traditional Sanskrit grammatical terminology, because as stated by Goldman, ". . . there seems to me to be no reason whatever to abandon the precise and sophisticated terminology of the Indian grammarians for the poorly adapted and often simply misleading terminology of classical grammars." This also offers the advantage of facilitating interface with native grammars, etc. Besides utilizing traditional terminology, it also retains traditional grammatical classifications, such as the ten verb *gaṇas* used by Pāṇini, which Whitney had reduced to eight. Another feature is the citing of paradigms in the traditional Indian manner, in which they have been learned and recited for ages. The lessons clearly explain the inner workings of compounds, and their vigraha, or traditional analysis, is illustrated. The

exercises and readings are based on the *Rāmāyaṇa*, as the authors are General Editor and Associate Editor of the Vālmiki Rāmāyaṇa Translation Project.

A Rapid Sanskrit Method was written by then University of Wisconsin (Madison) teacher George Hart (now teaching Tamil at University of Califonia, Berkeley) drawing largely on Harvard teacher Daniel Ingalls' method. It is designed for the first semester of a two semester school year. Much of the method referred to pertains to study after the first year, so is not found in this book: "while class study is essential for a Sanskritist, it is equally essential that he supplement his study with extensive Sanskrit reading on his own after the first year." This method emphasizes gaining fluency in reading "simple Sanskrit" by the rapid reading of texts such as the *Mahābhārata* (including the *Bhagavad Gītā*) and the *Kathāsaritsāgara*. "I would stress that no matter what field of Sanskrit a student wishes to investigate, fluency in simple Sanskrit is a prerequisite. I have found that students who cannot read easy Sanskrit with facility simply cannot handle more difficult texts, no matter how much effort they put forth, for they lack an intuitive model for the structure of the language, something which can be acquired only by extensive rapid reading of the sort which cannot be carried on in the more technical subjects." (p. vii). This book, as stated, does not contain this rapid reading material, but covers the basic elements of grammar (as does the *Devavāṇīpraveśikā*), in preparation for it.

A Sanskrit Manual for High Schools by R. Antoine is used extensively in India, including by paṇḍits hired to teach Western adults. It is designed to be taught very slowly over about four years of high school, though of course an adult can go through it much more quickly. It is unique in that it lays greater stress on translation from English to Sanskrit than on translation from Sanskrit to English. Ability to compose in a classical language has long been seen as the real test of its mastery. These volumes include many useful charts, and clear explanations of elements of grammar such as the special uses of the cases, and sentence constructions using passive verb-forms.

Sanskrit: An Introduction to the Classical Language was written by Edinburgh University teacher Michael Coulson, for

the Teach Yourself Books series. It is a complete Sanskrit course which can (at least theoretically) by followed without a teacher. It includes or utilizes roman transliteration throughout. Unlike many other books, its exercises and examples are mostly taken directly from Sanskrit texts (specifically from the prose dialogue of the major dramas), not made up. Explanations of Sanskrit usage which might normally be given orally are here written out. Nowhere else have we seen information on how to read a Sanskrit commentary (pp. 258ff.).

Sanskrit Sandhi and Exercises is a small booklet of 26 pages, listing the sandhi rules and giving exercises from which to learn them. Sandhi is the change that dissimilar sounds naturally undergo upon meeting, which in Sanskrit are written out. This booklet was written because the sandhi rules are not easy to use from Whitney's grammar, and are normally scattered in primers. It can be used to supplement textbooks such as the *Devavāṇīpraveśikā* if desired. Tyberg's *First Lessons* includes an appendix giving the sandhi rules all together, like in this book.

Sanskrit Readers

A Sanskrit Reader, Text and Vocabulary and Notes, by Charles Rockwell Lanman. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1884, etc.

A Sanskrit Reader, Containing Seventeen Epic and Puranic Texts, with a Glossary, by J. Gonda. Utrecht: N.V. A. Oosthoek's Uitg. Mij., 1935.

Bhagavad Gītā, With Saṃskṛt text, free Translation into Enlish, a Word-for-Word Translation, an Introduction to Saṃskṛt Grammar, and a complete Word Index, by Annie Besant and Bhagavan Das. Adyar, Madras: Theosophical Publishing House, 1st through 6th eds., 1905, 1926, 1940, 1950, 1962, 1973.

Lanman's *Sanskrit Reader* has long been and still remains in widespread use. It contains selections from easy works, including the famous Nala story from the *Mahābhārata*, twenty stories from the *Hitopadeśa* (cognate with Aesop's fables), six stories from the *Kathāsaritsāgara*, and some selections from the *Laws of Manu*. It then gives thirty-one hymns from the *Ṛgveda*,

followed by selections from the *Black Yajurveda* and various *Brāhmaṇas*, and a couple selections from the *Gṛhya Sūtras*. All selections are in devanāgarī script. A glossary containing all words is included, with the entries in roman transliteration. Also included are extensive grammatical notes.

Gonda's *Sanskrit Reader* is long out-of-print, and perhaps never gained widespread use because its selections are all in roman transliteration rather than devanāgarī. It also contains a complete glossary, but only two pages of grammatical notes. Nonetheless, its selections, thirteen from the *Mahābhārata* and four from the *Purāṇas*, are of much interest, and would make excellent choices for "rapid reading" (see above).

While the Besant/Das ed. *Bhagavad Gītā* is not a Sanskrit reader per se, we have found no better text for a second-year reader. All agree that the *Bhagavad Gītā* is an excellent choice for second-year, but many teachers object to using an edition which includes English translation, and even word-by-word meanings. With the bulk of the student's time put into dictionary look-up, however, little is left for the all-important syntax. A student can end second-year Sanskrit with considerable skill in using the dictionary, which is useful, or with an understanding of how to construe a verse, which is more useful. In both cases they will have studied a vocabulary of some 3000 words. The word-by-word meanings by Bhagavan Das are very carefully done, giving the basic meaning of the word, not necessarily how it was taken in the translation. This saves time-consuming dictionary work. Sanskrit verb-forms, such as participles, are carefully translated by matching English verb-forms. This can help check whether one has understood the Sanskrit verb-form correctly, without spelling it out like in Winthrop Sargeant's edition (which, in any case, is not always accurate). Devanāgarī script is used throughout. Full vigraha, or traditional delineation of compounds, is given. This is not found elsewhere, and few Western Sanskrit teachers can accurately generate it. Bhagavan Das was born and raised a Sanskrit paṇḍit in Benares. The order of the words as they occur in the verses is left unchanged in the word-by-word meanings. A disciplined student, using the word meanings given, and with a knowledge of cases and tenses, can

concentrate on learning to "think them" in the Sanskrit verse order, checking the construal with the accompanying translation. Time spent on this is likely to be more productive in learning to read Sanskrit than the same time spent on using the dictionary. As to Annie Besant's translation, it should be recalled that it passed through the hands of some of the best paṇḍits of Benares: Pramada Das Mitra, Ganganatha Jha, Kali Charan Mitra, Upendranath Basu, and lastly Bhagavan Das. Thus, while it makes no claims to be literally accurate like Franklin Edgerton's translation, to characterize it as "unreliable," as done by some scholars and even other Theosophists, is mere blind prejudice.

Simplified Sanskrit Grammars

A Sanskrit Grammar for Students, by Arthur A. Macdonell. 1st ed. 1901; 2nd ed. 1911; 3rd ed. 1927; reprint of 3rd ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1950, etc.; reprint of 3rd ed. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1974, etc.

A Concise Elementary Grammar of the Sanskrit Language, by Jan Gonda, translated from the German by Gordon B. Ford, Jr. (of *Kurze Elementar-Grammatik der Sanskrit-Sprache*, 4th ed., Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1963). University, Ala.: University of Alabama Press, 1966, etc.

Macdonell's *Sanskrit Grammar for Students* was written to eliminate what the author had found to be unessential in an elementary grammar. "It was also partly due to my conviction that the existing Sanskrit grammars, being too much dominated by the system of Pāṇini, rendered Sanskrit unnecessarily hard to learn. . . . the native Indian system is incompatible with the practical methods of teaching and learning in the West. . . . All such matter has been eliminated in the present work, not from any prejudice against the Indian grammarians, but solely with the intention of facilitating the study of the subject by supplying only such grammatical data of the actual language as have been noted by scholars down to the present time. Vedic forms have also been excluded. . . . I made it my guiding principle to leave out all matter that is found exclusively in Vedic literature or in the Hindu grammarians, the aim I had in view being to describe

only such grammatical forms as are to be met with in the actual literature of post-Vedic Sanskrit." While leaving out this material, it at the same time "is intended to supply a complete account of Classical Sanskrit." Macdonell also wrote *A Vedic Grammar for Students*, which corresponds paragraph for paragraph with this book, allowing easy comparison of classical and Vedic Sanskrit.

Gonda's *Concise Elementary Grammar of the Sanskrit Language* was translated from its original German for use in a Sanskrit class "designed primarily for linguists who wish to acquire a knowledge of Sanskrit grammar as rapidly as possible. Professor Gonda's book is ideal for this purpose. The grammar is presented in a clear and thorough way and is accompanied by twenty useful translation exercises. In addition, there are thirteen well chosen reading selections and a Sanskrit-English glossary containing every word which occurs in the translation exercises and reading selections." (from the translator's preface). It is very concise, the grammar portion covering only 96 pages, and uses roman transliteration throughout. The exercises, etc., allow it to also be used as a primer. Jan Gonda has written prolifically on Indo-European linguistics, Sanskrit, and the Vedas, and is considered the leading Vedic scholar of recent times.

Sanskrit Reference Grammars

Sanskrit Grammar, Including both the Classical Language, and the older Dialects, of Veda and Brahmana, by William Dwight Whitney. 1st ed., Leipzig, 1879; 2nd rev. ed. 1889; many reprintings of 2nd ed., Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press; 5th ed., Leipzig, 1924; reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1962, etc.
The Roots, Verb-forms, and Primary Derivatives of the Sanskrit Language. A Supplement to his Sanskrit Grammar, by William Dwight Whitney. 1st ed., Leipzig, 1885; reprint New Haven, Conn.: American Oriental Society, 1945 (American Oriental Series, vol. 30); reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.
A Higher Sanskrit Grammar, by Moreshwar Ramchandra Kale. 1st ed. 1894; reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1972, etc.
New Model Sanskrit Grammar, by D. Krishna Iyengar. Madras: The Samskrit Education Society, 1968, 1969.

A Dictionary of Sanskrit Grammar, by Kashinath Vasudev Abhyankar and J. M. Shukla. Baroda: Oriental Institute, 1961; 2nd rev. ed. 1977 (Gaekwad's Oriental Series, no. 134).

Whitney's *Sanskrit Grammar* has long been and still remains the standard reference grammar in the English-speaking West, despite its hard-to-use style and dated terminology, simply because no Western writer before or since has described the Sanskrit language in English as comprehensively as he did. Whitney's linguistic output was prodigious in quantity and wide-ranging, including a comparison of the Greek and Latin verbs (1850), books on general linguistics (1867, 1873-74, 1875), a German grammar (1869), reader (1870), and dictionary, a French grammar (1886), an English grammar (1877) and the massive Century Dictionary (6 vols. 1889-91), as well as from Sanskrit a translation of the *Sūrya-Siddhānta* (1860, on astronomy), and editions and translations of two *Prātiśākhyas* (1862, 1871, texts on Vedic phonology) and of the *Atharvaveda* (ed. 1855-56, trans. 1905). He had also studied Persian, Arabic, Egyptian, and Coptic in the early 1850s. He clearly had a wide linguistic background to draw upon when he wrote his Sanskrit grammar (1879). Yet in his day ethnocentrism was the norm, and Whitney not surprisingly felt that he could analyze Sanskrit better than Pāṇini and milleniums of native scholarship had, so wrote his grammar accordingly, abandoning their classifications and substituting his own at will. Textbooks today such as the *Devavāṇīpraveśikā* have returned to the traditional Sanskrit grammatical classifications, but still use Whitney's grammar for reference because it remains the most comprehensive.

Whitney's *Roots, Verb-forms and Primary Derivatives of the Sanskrit Language* is a work of great practical use. While the most highly inflected verb in English, "be," has a grand total of eight forms, a Sanskrit verb can have literally hundreds of inflected forms. Obviously a dictionary cannot list these all, so only lists the verb by its root. This means that a very large number of verb-forms are not listed in the dictionary. This book lists under each root specimens of its conjugational forms in the various tenses, and its primary derivatives, found in use. This is very helpful for identifying specific verb-forms and their meanings.

Kale's *Higher Sanskrit Grammar* is to English-speaking India what Whitney's *Sanskrit Grammar* is to the English-speaking West: the standard reference grammar. But unlike Whitney, Kale had a high regard for Pāṇini's traditional grammar. He, like his countrymen, considered it a science whose very study was of great educational value, in that it developed ability in synthetic thought, so wrote his grammar accordingly. "To split up, therefore, a general rule of the ancient Indian grammarians into a number of the particular cases it comprehends, as is done by some modern writers on Sanskrit grammar, is not to build up but to destroy. . . . For a Grammar, then, to be practical and correct, in my humble opinion, it must be based on indigenous works understood and studied in their genuine scientific spirit. . . . I have closely followed Pāṇini as explained by Bhaṭṭoji Dikshit. . . . Many of the rules given are translations of the Sūtras of Pāṇini." (p. ii). Kale's grammar includes many obscure paradigms, a 68-page chapter on syntax which "contains almost everything given in the first 20 chapters of Prof. Apte's *Guide to Sanskrit Composition*, the same original having been followed by both," and a 156-page appendix prepared by Uddhavāchārya Ainapure entitled *Dhātukosha*, "containing almost all the roots in Sankrit and giving the 3rd pers. sing. in the important tenses and moods." (also contains English meanings). Kale is known for his editions and translations, with notes for students, of the great Sanskrit plays like those of Kālidāsa.

The *New Model Sanskrit Grammar*, two volumes published in 1968 and 1969 by the Samskrit Education Society, Madras, "is a record of the way in which an enthusiast in advanced age mastered the difficult subject dealt with here." "Sri Krishna Iyengar had started his study of Sanskrit grammar to help him to teach it to his own children and the manuscript he had offered was under preparation by him for sixteen years, from 1944 to 1960." (from the foreword by V. Raghavan). T. Ramachandra Sastri, Vyakarana Siromani (eminent Sanskrit teacher) from the Sanskrit College at Sriperumbudur, revised the manuscript for publication, "bestowing on the work an amount of labor equal to that of the author." It follows the program of the Samskrit Education Society of teaching "Pāṇini pre-digested." To achieve

this the author has presented detailed panoramic tables of the conjugational forms of verbs from 711 roots, "so that the forms can catch the eye of the student, during the panoramic view and get themselves easily imprinted in his mind." The first volume (341 pages) is on verbs, and half of it is devoted to these well-prepared and very useful verb charts. The second volume (pp. 343-486) deals with the alphabet, sandhi, nouns, compounds, etc., which are meant to come first, though published second. Like Pāṇini's, this grammar has no section on syntax per se.

A Dictionary of Sanskrit Grammar, is of course, not a reference grammar, but is listed here because of its great reference value in working with the traditional grammatical terminology, used in almost all books on Sanskrit published in India, and now in Sanskrit textbooks published in the West as well, such as the *Devavāṇīpraveśikā* (though the latter has its own glossary of grammatical terms). The author, K. V. Abhyankar, prepared this dictionary as a result of a lifetime's work on Sanskrit grammar. It fully covers Pāṇini's grammar, including the *Mahābhāṣya* of Patañjali and the *Kāśikā Vṛtti*, terms from other systems such as the *Kātantra*, and full coverage of the Vedic *Prātiśākhyas*. Its second edition was revised by J. M. Shukla, a former student of Prof. Abhyankar, at the latter's request. An important use of this dictionary is in working with Sanskrit commentaries, which frequently give grammatical explanations using technical terms. Its terms are listed in devanāgarī script (but defined in English).

Sanskrit Syntax

The Student's Guide to Sanskrit Composition, A Treatise on Sanskrit Syntax for the use of Schools and Colleges, by Vāman Shivarām Āpte. 2nd ed. 1885; 3rd ed. 1890; 26th ed. Varanasi: The Chowkhamba Sanskrit Series Office, 1970.

Sanskrit Syntax, by J. S. Speijer. 1st ed., Leiden, 1886; reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1973, etc.

Sanskrit Syntax, by Irach J. S. Taraporewala. Delhi: Munshiram Manoharlal, 1967.

The Student's Guide to Sanskrit Composition by V. S. Apte has been widely used in India to teach Sanskrit syntax, as may

be seen by the large number of its reprintings. It contains numerous examples to illustrate the principles of Sanskrit syntax, always taken from classical Sanskrit literature, particularly the famous dramas and plays. It was also this literature from which Apte drew the additional type of vocabulary which distinguishes his *Practical Sanskrit-English Dictionary.* The present book of 416 pages includes Sanskrit-English and English-Sanskrit glossaries of the less common words found in the examples cited, since the examples do not include English translation. It is written in lesson format, and designed for use with a teacher.

Sanskrit Syntax by J. S. Speijer is designed as a work of reference. Sanskrit syntax poses special difficulties for speakers of European languages, since the syntax of the latter is determined by word order, while the syntax of Sanskrit is determined by inflectional endings, i.e., noun declensions and verb conjugations, not by word order. This necessitates learning a new way to think, a non-linear way. This book was the first Sanskrit syntax written in Europe, and still remains the only one written in English by a Westerner. The author states in his preface that "it may be judged, what it is, as a first attempt, and an attempt undertaken by a foreigner." It, like Apte's, is a work on the syntax of classical Sanskrit, not Vedic. It refers to the rules of Pāṇini whenever applicable, as well as making comparisons with Greek and Latin. It draws on a wider range of Sanskrit writings than Apte's, while Apte's quotes more examples.

Taraporewala's *Sanskrit Syntax* is a series of six lectures given in 1937, so is not a syntax textbook like Apte's, nor a reference syntax like Speijer's. These lectures are nonetheless of considerable value. The author knew not only English, Sanskrit, and his native Gujarati, but also German, Arabic, Persian, Pahlavi, and Avesta, had studied Greek and Latin, and was a professor of comparative philology. His translation of the Avesta Gāthās broke new ground in following his principle that a unit of meter is a unit of sense. This ancient Gāthic dialect of Avesta is in many ways closer to Vedic Sanskrit than is classical Sanskrit. This linguistic background led to some important insights in his lectures, particularly on the early Sanskrit verb

system, which must be reconstructed because no grammars describing it exist. "It is only when we contemplate the Grammar of the Vedic Language and when we compare the language with others like Homeric Greek or Avesta, that we can see the framework complete. We then realise that the verbal system preserved in later times and described by Pāṇini is but a broken down remnant of a very elaborate verbal system." (p. 64).

Vedic Sanskrit

A Practical Vedic Dictionary, by Suryakanta. Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1981.
Vedic Grammar, by A. A. Macdonell. 1st ed. 1910; reprint Varanasi: Bhartiya Publishing House, 1975.
A Vedic Grammar for Students, by Arthur Anthony Macdonell. London: Oxford University Press, 1916, reprints 1941, etc.; reprints Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1953, etc.
A Vedic Reader for Students, containing thirty hymns of the Rigveda in the original saṃhitā and pada texts, with transliteration, translation, explanatory notes, introduction, vocabulary, by Arthur Anthony Macdonell. 1st ed., Oxford University Press, 1917; reprints Madras: Oxford University Press, 1951, etc.

Suryakanta's *Practical Vedic Dictionary* comprehensively covers the Vedic Saṃhitās, basic words of the major Brāhmaṇas, words chosen from the Āraṇyakas, and some words from the Upaniṣads and Kalpa Sūtras. Previous Vedic study in the West relied primarily on Sanskrit-German dictionaries: the 7-volume *Sanskrit-Wörterbuch* of Böhtlingk and Roth, which includes both Vedic and classical Sanskrit, or Grassmann's *Wörterbuch Zum Ṛgveda*, covering only the *Ṛgveda*. The *Sanskrit-English Dictionary* of Monier-Williams, though less complete than the Böhtlingk/Roth, was sometimes utilized. Suryakanta's dictionary is a marked improvement on all of these, in that it deals exclusively with Vedic Sanskrit, and it covers all four Vedas. For each entry it gives Hindi as well as English definitions, usually illustrated by example(s), with reference(s), from the Vedic literature, so that the word's actual use can be seen. The Sanskrit definition given by Sāyaṇa in his commentaries is given when

available, which allows comparison between the results of modern scholarship (the Hindi or English definitions) and the traditional scholarship of Sāyaṇa's time (14th century A.D.). Suryakanta for his Ph.D. thesis edited a different *Atharvaveda Prātiśākhya* (1937) than the one Whitney had edited (1862). Based on the prescriptions of the latter, Whitney and Roth (also Lindenau) had introduced emendations into the text of the *Atharvaveda* against the manuscript evidence. The *Atharva Prātiśākhya* edited by Suryakanta shows that these emendations were unjustified. Yet the Roth/Whitney/Lindenau edition of the *Atharvaveda* is still the standard one used by scholars.

Macdonell's *Vedic Grammar* is used for Vedic study both in the West and throughout India, since, as noted above under Taraporewala's *Sanskrit Syntax*, no native grammars describing Vedic Sanskrit have come down to us. Some hold that Pāṇini's grammar adequately explains the Vedic language, and that students turn to grammars like Macdonell's only because their knowledge of Pāṇini is insufficient. See, for example, *Vedic Grammar (According to Pāṇini)*, by M. Sivakumara Swamy (Bangalore: Bhāravi Prakāśana, 1984). Others hold that Vedic grammar is much more complex than Pāṇini's, and one must turn to the evidence of other cognate languages to adequately understand it. See, for example, *Linguistic Introduction to Sanskrit*, by Batakrishna Ghosh (1st ed. 1937; reprint Calcutta: Sanskrit Pustak Bhandar, 1977). In any case, college students in India are often advised for Vedic Sanskrit to study both the *Siddhānta Kaumudī* (Svara and Vaidika chapters), i.e., Pāṇini (see below), and Macdonell's *Vedic Grammar*. The latter has thus become the standard reference on the subject.

Macdonell also prepared a simplified *Vedic Grammar for Students*, following the plan of his *Sanskrit Grammar for Students*, which latter, as noted above, deals only with classical Sanskrit. They correspond paragraph for paragraph, to facilitate comparison of Vedic and classical Sanskrit. Macdonell's *Vedic Reader for Students* was prepared as a companion volume to his *Vedic Grammar for Students*. The two comprise a self-contained and comprehensive introduction to Vedic Sanskrit, which can be followed without a teacher (assuming background in

classical Sanskrit). The *Vedic Reader* includes the famous Puruṣa Sūkta (X.90) and the Hymn of Creation (X.129). While Lanman's *Sanskrit Reader* includes extensive Vedic selections, Macdonell offers more help to the student (see subtitle, listed above).

Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit

Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Grammar and Dictionary, vol. I: Grammar; vol. II: Dictionary, by Franklin Edgerton. 1st ed. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1953; reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1970, etc.
Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Reader, edited with notes, by Franklin Edgerton. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1953; reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1972, etc.

Various Buddhist texts in Sanskrit exhibit non-standard Sanskrit forms, some more, some less. Edgerton has categorized these texts, according to how "hybrid" their language is, into three classes. The first class, in which hybrid forms are found throughout, consists essentially of only one text: the *Mahāvastu.* The second class, in which hybrid forms are found mostly in the verse portions, but not much in the prose portions, includes such texts as the *Lotus Sūtra* and the *Lalita Vistara.* The third class, the largest, in which hybrid forms are not common anywhere, distinguished primarily by its vocabulary, includes for example the Prajñāpāramitā literature. Much work on Buddhist texts in Sanskrit, then, will not necessarily require reference to the *Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Grammar.*

Edgerton regards Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit as a different language from standard Sanskrit, and treats it accordingly. His *Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Dictionary* therefore excludes words occurring (with the same meanings) in standard Sanskrit, as found in the Sanskrit (-German) dictionary by Böhtlingk and Roth. So, for example, a term like nirvāṇa, though a fundamental Buddhist term, is not included in Edgerton's dictionary, since it is found with the same meaning in the Böhtlingk/Roth dictionary. Edgerton's dictionary, then, cannot be used by itself for Buddhist text work, but can be used as a supplement to others like Monier-Williams' Sanskrit-English dictionary. Many Sanskrit

Buddhist texts were published between the time of these dictionaries and Edgerton's. The latter thus includes fundamental Buddhist terms from these texts, such as the Yogācāra term *ālaya-vijñāna*, which were not available for inclusion in the earlier dictionaries. But it, like the encyclopedic Sanskrit dictionary coming out from Poona, has not fully utilized even the few Buddhist tantric texts available to it, probably because there was no one to explain their meaning. Thus though it quotes vocabulary from the *Sādhanamālā*, it does not give the meaning of *ālambya* or *avalambya* as used throughout that text. The list of abbreviations of works quoted, etc., used in the dictionary is found only in the grammar, so the dictionary is not a self-contained work, but requires reference to the grammar volume.

Since many of the texts referred to by Edgerton are hard to obtain, he prepared a *Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Reader* for use with his grammar and dictionary. It includes selections primarily from the *Mahāvastu* and *Lalita Vistara*. All three of Edgerton's volumes use roman transliteration exclusively, no devanāgarī.

Traditional Sanskrit Study

The Aṣṭādhyāyī of Pāṇini, edited and translated into English, by Śrīśa Chandra Vasu. 2 vols., 1st ed. Allahabad, 1891; reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1962, etc.

The Siddhānta Kaumudī of Bhaṭṭoji Dīkṣita, edited and translated into English, by Śrīśa Chandra Vasu. 2 vols., 1st ed. Allahabad, 1906; reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1983, etc.

The Laghukaumudī: A Sanskrit Grammar by Varadarāja, with an English version, commentary, and references, by James R. Ballantyne. 1st ed. Varanasi, 1849; 2nd ed. 1867; 4th ed. 1891; reprint Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1967, etc.

Amarakośa, by Amara-Siṅha. Many Sanskrit editions available; translated into English by H. T. Colebrooke, 1808, eds. 1825, 1891; also published as *Amara's Nāmalingānuśāsanam (Text)*: A Sanskrit Dictionary in three Chapters, Critically Edited with Introduction and English equivalents for each word, and English Word-Index, by N. G. Sardesai, and D. G. Padhye. Poona: Oriental Book Agency, 1st ed. 1940, 2nd ed. 1969.

Traditionally, Sanskrit study in India has meant study of Pāṇini's grammar, the *Aṣṭādhyāyī*, universally considered the most perfect grammar known to history. Pāṇini, standing at the end of a long line of predecessors (of whom sixty-four are mentioned), prepared a grammar to match the language it describes: Sanskrit, meaning "polished, refined, perfected." It consists, according to the traditional recital, of 3,972 sūtras. About a third of these terse sūtras have been explained by Kātyāyana in his vārttikas. These sūtras and vārttikas were in turn explained by Patañjali in his *Mahābhāṣya*, or "Great Commentary." These three, Pāṇini, Kātyāyana, and Patañjali, are honored as the three greatest teachers of vyākaraṇa, the science of grammar. Their writings together comprise a bulk which can be overwhelming. The comparatively brief *Kāśikā Vṛtti*, or "Benares Commentary," is the earliest extant commentary which explains all 3,972 of Pāṇini's sūtras. The translation of Pāṇini's *Aṣṭādhyāyī* listed above, by Śrīśa Chandra Vasu, includes the substance of the *Kāśikā Vṛtti*. As a commentary of some kind is necessary to even make Pāṇini's sūtras intelligible, this was an excellent choice.

Pāṇini has carefully arranged his sūtras throughout so that the general rule is stated first, then subordinate rules in an ever narrowing focus, i.e., reasoning from universals to particulars. The study of Pāṇini's grammar is held to be of great educational value, which has often been likened to that of the study of Euclid's geometry in the West. "For to make up a particular form the mind of the student has to go through a certain process of synthesis." (Dr. R. G. Bhandarkar). This has reference to how Sanskrit words are built from verb-roots according to regular processes described by Pāṇini. To more easily learn the processes of grammar recorded by Pāṇini, his grammar has in recent centuries been rearranged topic-wise. The *Siddhānta Kaumudī*, a rearrangement according to topic which includes grammatical examples, came to be used throughout India in place of Pāṇini's *Aṣṭādhyāyī* in its normal arrangement. The bulky *Siddhānta Kaumudī* (1028 + 713 + 408 + 247 + 106 pages in Śrīśa Chandra Vasu's translation) was greatly abridged as the *Laghukaumudī* (424 pages in Ballantyne's translation). For person's wanting to study Sanskrit grammar in brief but using

the actual sūtras of Pāṇini, this is the book. Ballantyne's explanatory notes increase the usability of his translation.

The *Amarakośa* is far and away the most widely used of kośas, which served traditionally as dictionaries. It, like other such kośas, is a versified vocabulary. Thus one did not look up a word as in our alphabetically arranged dictionaries, but rather memorized the entire kośa. Groups of synonyms make up the verses, and the arrangement is by subjects. This type of lexicon has been used for milleniums in India, while alphabetically arranged lexicons have arisen only in the last couple centuries, since Western contacts. "Consequently an old Pandit having mastered the versified vocabulary of Sanskrit easily understands or scans any difficult verse given to him without the aid of a Dictionary." (p. 1). Today's Western student may still be able to achieve a memory feat like this with the help of "superlearning."

Modern Spoken Sanskrit

A Companion to Contemporary Sanskrit, by Hajime Nakamura. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1973 (published for The Eastern Institute, Tokyo).
Conversational Sanskrit: A Microwave Approach, by N. D. Krishnamurthy, U. P. Upadhyaya, Jayanthi Manohar, and N. Shylaja. Bangalore: Adarsha Educational and Social Service Trust, [1984].

Nakamura's *Companion* is a short work (74 p.) on Sanskrit as spoken by paṇḍits in India today. From the preface: "Sanskrit is not a dead language, but a living language . . . I have found some discrepancies between living Sanskrit and some explanations in Western works . . . Taking these items into consideration, I have prepared an introductory work to living Sanskrit, which is earnestly spoken by learned persons even nowadays."

Conversational Sanskrit is a Sanskrit course in 50 lessons (392 p.), a "maiden attempt to popularize Sanskrit as the spoken language." Its exercises adapt Sanskrit to everyday speech. "We trust that our efforts in providing a simplified Sanskrit for this purpose will be appreciated . . . Only simple structures required for day-to-day conversations have been used in this book."

Suggested Selections

Getting started:
Sanskrit Pronunciation: Booklet and Cassette, Bruce Cameron Hall. Should be studied by anyone using Sanskrit terms.
Sanskrit: Essentials of Grammar and Language, Kurt F. Leidecker. Outline of the language and how words are formed.
First Lessons in Sanskrit Grammar and Reading, Judith Tyberg. Good choice to start actually learning Sanskrit from.

Getting serious:
Devavāṇīpraveśikā: An Introduction to the Sanskrit Language, Robert P. Goldman and Sally J. Sutherland. Best choice for full Sanskrit course textbook in the West. Requires a teacher.
Sanskrit Grammar, William Dwight Whitney. This is the standard reference grammar in the West, despite its ethnocentrism. It, unlike Kale's grammar, gives all terms in roman script.
The Roots, Verb-forms, and Primary Derivatives of the Sanskrit Language, William Dwight Whitney. A necessary supplement to his grammar, since many verb-forms are not in the dictionary.
A Sanskrit-English Dictionary, Monier Monier-Williams. Well laid out. Entries include roman script, unlike Apte's dictionary. (Note that Arthur Macdonell's *Practical Sanskrit Dictionary* has not been listed in the foregoing because of its limited scope.)
Bhagavad Gītā, Annie Besant and Bhagavan Das. Best choice for second-year Sanskrit study. This edition with word-by-word meanings makes an excellent self-contained Sanskrit tutor.

Note: A large number of the books listed in this guide are in print. If you are unable to obtain them from your local bookseller, we can help you obtain them. Also, any book which is out-of-print can be obtained from us in photocopied form.

Eastern School Press
3185 Boyd Road
Cotopaxi, CO 81223
719-942-4602

International Transliteration System

अ	आ	इ	ई	उ	ऊ
a	ā	i	ī	u	ū
	ऋ	ॠ	ऌ	ॡ	
	ṛ	ṝ	ḷ	ḹ	
	ए	ऐ	ओ	औ	
	e	ai	o	au	
		अं	अः		
		aṃ	aḥ		

क	ख	ग	घ	ङ
ka	kha	ga	gha	ṅa
च	छ	ज	झ	ञ
ca	cha	ja	jha	ña
ट	ठ	ड	ढ	ण
ṭa	ṭha	ḍa	ḍha	ṇa
त	थ	द	ध	न
ta	tha	da	dha	na
प	फ	ब	भ	म
pa	pha	ba	bha	ma

य	र	ल	व
ya	ra	la	va
श	ष	स	
śa	ṣa	sa	
	ह		
	ha		