

BHAVYA'S CONTROVERSY WITH YOGĀCĀRA IN THE APPENDIX TO *PRAJÑĀPRADĪPA*, CHAPTER XXV.

BY
CHRISTIAN LINDTNER (Nærum)

The four major extant works of the Mādhyamika philosopher Bhavya (or Bhāvaviveka, c. 490–570) — *Madhyamakahrdayakārikā* (with the autocommentary *Tarkajvālā*), *Prajñāpradīpa*, **Karatalaratna* (i.e. *Zhāng-zhēn lùn*) and *Madhyamakaratnapradīpa* — all provide remarkable evidence of his sustained controversy with what had, from common roots, through a process of still, to some extent, obscure development gradually grown into the main rival and independent branch of Mahāyāna philosophy in the sixth century A.D., viz. Yogācāra.¹ Though Mādhyamikas had been criticizing their *svayūthyas* before Bhavya was to do so,² and though the successors in his own school continued to do so, each in his own way,³ in the following centuries, none of them seem to have done so with such a display of deep personal involvement and subtle thoroughness as Bhavya. Provoked by the rapidly expanding influence of these philosophers whom he, as it were, considered as *svanītāv abhimāninaḥ* — viz. Asaṅga, Vasubandhu, Dignāga and their followers⁴ — and their dogmas of *cittamātra*, *svabhāvatraya*, *ālayavijāna*, etc. he engaged himself in a debate with the distinct objective of vindicating, in

¹ For further details about Bhavya and the works ascribed to him, see my *Adversaria Buddhica* in *WZKS*, XXVI (1982), pp. 172–184, and *On Bhavya's Ratnapradīpa* to appear in *Indologica Taurinensia*, XII. — For his controversy with Yogācāra see my *Bhavya's Controversy with Yogācāra in the Ratnapradīpa*, chapter IV, to appear in B. K. Matilal (ed.), *Buddhist logic and epistemology*, and Kōsai Yasui, *Chūgan Shisō no Kenkyū*, Kyōto 1961 (in Japanese).

² The earliest critique of what was later to become some of the basic dogmas of Yogācāra is in fact already found in the *Laṅkāvatārasūtra* (cf. e.g. II, 198 & III, 48). There can be no doubt that this sūtra was (in some earlier form than the *textus receptus*) known to Nāgārjuna and Āryadeva. Thus there are clear allusions to it in Nāgārjuna's controversy with the «Vijñānavādins» in *Bodhicittavivaraṇa*, 25–56 (edited in my *Nagarjuniana*, Copenhagen 1982, pp. 180–217). These two texts are the most important documents for the controversy with Yogācāra (a term which is not free from ambiguity) before Bhavya, who frequently claims them as his authorities.

³ Among the numerous post-Bhavya Mādhyamikas criticizing Yogācāra (or Vijñānavāda) Candrakīrti (c. 530–600, cf. *AO*, XL (1979), p. 91), being not only a (partly) contemporary and a rival of Bhavya, but also to some extent acquainted with Dharmapāla's (and Sthiramati's?) retorts to Bhavya, is of foremost interest. See his *Madhyamakāvatāra*, pp. 135–202 (ed. La Vallée Poussin); *Pañcaskandha-prakāraṇa*, pp. 115–121 (ed. Lindtner); *Sūnyatāsaptativṛtti*, *Ya fol.* 318b7–320b7 (Peking ed.).

⁴ *Madhyamakahrdayakārikā*, V, 1 with *Tarkajvālā*.

accordance with *āgama* supported by *yukti*,⁵ the Madhyamaka system of Nāgārjuna and his followers as the fundamentally orthodox form of Buddhism. The documents pertaining to this somewhat neglected controversy between the two main schools of Mahāyāna retain for us today a record of the greatest historical and intellectual interest.

The earliest, most extensive and comprehensive critique of Yogācāra is to be found in Bhavya's *magnum opus*: *Madhyamakahrdayakārikā* (*MHK*), V, 1–113 with the commentary *Tārkajvālā* (*TJ*).⁶ The latest is provided by *Madhyamakaratnapradīpa* (*MRP*), IV, called **Neyārthatathyasamvrtiprajñā* which is also, in a sense, the most mature and, in accordance with the scope of *MRP* as a whole, the most gratifying from the point of view of systematic presentation.⁷ From the interjacent period we have the critique of *svabhāvatraya* etc. in the appendix of Bhavya's commentary *Prajñāpradīpa* (*PP*) to the *Nirvāṇaparīkṣā* chapter of Nāgārjuna's *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā*, and the critique of *para-tantrasvabhāva*, *tathatā*, etc. in **Karatalaratna* or **Talaratna* (*TR*). Like *MRP* they draw heavily from *MHK* and *TJ*, to which they not only all expressly refer for further details, but from which they derive the substance of their arguments and often even their very form of phrase. Thus *PP*, *TR* and *MRP* when seen in relation to *MHK* and *TJ* show, apart from minor additions and omissions, an almost complete substantial dependency on the work of his youth, but seen in relation to one another prove to be mutually supplementary. But even if *PP*, *TJ* and *MRP* do not offer much new from the point of view of philosophical arguments they certainly indicate a clear development in the style and form of presenting his basic ideas. A study of all his contributions in their chronological order thus provides us with a unique opportunity to catch a glimpse into his workshop and follow his development, not so much as a philosopher but rather as a creative author and stylist engaged in reshuffling and systematizing his original ideas anew in accordance with the demands of the scope of the work in progress as a whole.

As Bhavya's critique of Yogācāra in *MHK* (*TJ*), *TR* and *MHK* will be dealt with elsewhere, I shall here confine myself to offer a critical edition of the Tibetan version of the appendix to (the now lost Sanskrit original of) *PP*, XXV, only adding that an annotated English translation by Dr. David Eckel will appear in *Indiske Studier*

⁵ Cf. Shōtarō Iida, *Āgama (Scripture) and Yukti (Reason) in Bhāvaviveka*, in *Kanakura Kinenronbunshū*, Tōkyō 1966, pp. 79–96. See also the same author's *Reason and Emptiness. A Study in Logic and Mysticism*, Tōkyō 1980.

⁶ Until the extant Sanskrit text of *MHK* is published one may refer to Susumu Yamaguchi's edition of the Tibetan version (with a Japanese translation) in the appendix to his *Bukkyō ni okeru Mu to U no Tairon*, Tōkyō 1941/1964². It is based on the Peking and Derge editions.

⁷ Cf. my papers referred to in note 1 and my translation of the first chapter in *JIP*, IX (1981), pp. 169–177.

(Copenhagen 1984), and that the Chinese version of *PP* omits the appendix. The sources on which this recension of the Tibetan version is based are as follows:

P: *Prajñāpradīpa-mūlamadhyamakavṛtti*, Tibetan Tripitaka, Peking edition, No. 5253, Tsha fol. 303a6–312a8.

D: *Prajñāpradīpa-mūlamadhyamakavṛtti*, Tibetan Tripitaka, Derge edition, No. 3853, Tsha fol. 242a1–249a1.

A: *Prajñāpradīpaṭīkā*, Tibetan Tripitaka, Peking edition, No. 5259, Za fol. 322a1–362a1.

E: *Prajñāpradīpaṭīkā*, Tibetan Tripitaka, Derge edition, No. 3859, Za fol. 271a4–305a4.

The translators of Bhavya's *Vṛtti* as well as Avalokitavrata's excellent *Ṭīkā* to it were Jñānagarbha and Klu'i rgyal mtshan.⁸ The *Vṛtti* is quoted in the *Ṭīkā* in its entirety and is virtually identical with the form it has in the version of the *PP*, the very few variants (see the *apparatus criticus*) being, perhaps with one or two exceptions, accounted for by subsequent scribal corruption.

PRAJÑĀPRADĪPA

Ch. XXV.

[1] *rnal 'byor spyod pa pa¹ dag gis smras pa:-*

«dmigs pa thams cad ñer zi zin ||
spros pa ñer zi zi ba ste ||
sañs rgyas kyis ni gañ du yañ ||
su la'añ chos 'ga' ma bstan to ||»²

*žes bya ba ni bden na de rtogs par bya ba'i thabs gžan gyi dbaṅ la skur pa 'debs pa de ni
mi ruñ ste; 'o na ji lta bu že na?*

«ño bo ñid gsum śes par bya ||
dañ po kun tu³ brtags pa yin ||
gñis pa gžan gyi dbaṅ yin te ||
tha ma yoñs su grub pa yin ||»⁴

⁸ For the translators see J. Naudou, *Les bouddhistes kaśmīriens au Moyen Age*, Paris 1968.

¹ *pa pa* PE : *pa po* D : *pa A*

² *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā*, XXV, 24 (ed. Lindtner):
sarvopālambhopāśamaḥ prapañcopāśamaḥ śivah |
na kva cit kasya cit kaś cid dharmō buddhena deśitah ||

³ *kun tu* PEA : *kun du* D

⁴ This and the two following verses are quoted from Asaṅga's *Xiān-yáng-shèng-jiào-lùn*, see *Taishō daizōkyō*, XXXI, 1602, 557b7–8.

«mtshan ñid de bzin skye ba dan ||
don dam ño bo ñid med pas ||
ño bo ñid ni gsum po dag ||
ño bo ñid med ñid du 'dod ||»⁵

de la gañ gi tshe kun brtags pa'i ño bo ñid med pa'i phyir mi dmigs śiñ, gzan gyi dbaṅ gi
ño bo ñid kyaṅ rgyu mtshan du mi 'dzin pas yaṅ dag par rjes su mi mthoṅ⁶ ba de'i tshe
na dmigs pa thams cad ñe bar'zi ba yin no.

[α. Parikalpitasvabhāva]

[2] de dag dan lhan cig tu 'di dpyad par bya ste; de la kun brtags pa'i ño bo ñid ces bya
ba de gañ yin? de mtshan ñid ño bo ñid med pa ñid kyis ño bo ñid med pa ni ji lta bu yin?

gal te kun brtags pa'i ño bo ñid ni chos rnam kyī⁷ ño bo ñid dan, khyad par la sogs
par tha sñad pa'i rnam par rtog pa gañ yin pa ste ('di lta ste: ño bo ñid du rnam par rtog
pa ni⁸ gzugs dan, tshor ba zes bya ba la sogs par⁹ rnam par rtog pa'o; khyad par du¹⁰
rnam par rtog pa ni bstan du yod pa dan, bstan du med pa zes bya ba la sogs par rnam
par rtog pa'o), de mtshan ñid ño bo ñid med pa ñid kyis ño bo ñid med pa ni rgyu
mtshan la sogs pa lña po dag gi khoṅs su ma gtogs pa'i phyir ro (de de ltar yod pa ma
yin yaṅ miñ don la 'jug pa las kun nas ñon moṅs par 'gyur te, ji ltar miñ don la 'jug pa de
ltar byis pa rnam de'i ño bo ñid la mñon par zen par byed do) ze na?

de la¹¹ 'dir gal te gzugs zes bya bar yid la brjod pa dan, tshig tu brjod pa'i kun brtags
pa'i¹² ño bo ñid gañ yin pa de med do ze na ni, dños po la skur pa 'debs pa yin te, yid la
brjod pa dan, tshig tu brjod pa la skur pa 'debs pa'i phyir ro.

ci ste¹³ gañ yaṅ ruñ bas de gñis kyī don kun brtags pa gañ yin pa de med de, dper na
thag pa la sbrul bzin no ze na ni, kun brtags pa med pa ma yin te, de la rñam pa 'dra'bas
blo gros 'khrul pas kun brtags pa'i don med kyaṅ tha sñad du sbrul 'khyil ba la¹⁴ de
med pa ma yin pa'i phyir ro. ci ste tha sñad du'aṅ sbrul 'khyil ba la¹⁴ sbrul med do ze

⁵ *ibid.*, 55 7b15–16, q.v. (Bhavya also follows Asaṅga in the sequel!)

⁶ mthoṅ PDE : gtoṅ A

⁷ kyī PDE : kyis A

⁸ pa ni A : pa'i PDE

⁹ par A : pa PDE

¹⁰ par du ADE : par P

¹¹ la PDE : lta A

¹² pa'i AE : pa PD

¹³ ci ste PDE : ji ste A (semper ji pro ci infra)

¹⁴ de med pa ma yin pa'i phyir ro. ci ste tha sñad du'aṅ (P : du yaṅ AE) sbrul 'khyil ba la om. D

¹⁵ ma PAE : mi D

na ni, grags pa'i gnod par 'gyur ro; ci ste don dam par dños po sel bar byed na ni, dbu ma pa'i tshul gyis rjes su smra ba yin te, don dam par sbrul rdzas su yod pa ma yin pa'i phyir dan, ño bo ñid las skye ba med pa'i phyir ro. thag pa dan sbrul 'khyil ba la ma¹⁵ dmigs pa kho nar thag pa dan sbrul gyi blo skye na ni, pha rol pò ran la ses par byed par¹⁶ rab tu ma grub bo. gañ yañ ruñ ba la ma grub pa ni gtan tshigs ma yin no zes bya ba der tha sñad kyi dus su ni phyogs gñi ga la grags pa'i sgrub par¹⁷ byed pa 'dod par bya'o — zes sñar bstan zin to.

kun brtags pa'i don yod pa ma yin par ston par 'dod pas¹⁸ ni slob dpon gyis dbu ma pa'i tshul 'thad pa dan bcas pa bka' stsal pa ñid 'dod par bya ste, brjod par bya ba'i ño bo ñid bkag pa kho nas yul de la yid dan tshig gi brjod pa 'jug pa ldog pa'i phyir ro.¹⁹

kun brtags pa'i mtshan ñid med do ze na ni, gtan tshigs kyi don ma grub pa ñid de, miñ ni gzugs dan 'du byed du gtogs pa'i phyir dan, ño bo ñid dan, rtog pa dan, rjes su dran pa'i²⁰ rnam par rtog pa dag kyañ rnam par ses pa dan, 'du byed kyi phuñ por gtogs pa'i phyir ro.

gžan yañ tha sñad²¹ pa'i brjod pa 'jug pa ni brjod²¹ par bya ba'i don gyi ño bo ñid dan, khyad par gyi yul can yin la, don dam par brjod par bya ba'i don gyi ño bo ñid dan, khyad par bkag pa'i phyir mñon par zen pa'i ñon moñs pa mi 'thad de, skyes bu²² 'phyon ma pas gzugs su byas pa'i na chuñ la bdag med pa ñid du rtogs²³ pa bžin pas miñ gi dbañ gis don la mñon par zen par mi rigs te, tshul bžin ma yin pa yid la byed pa las rigs so.

[β. Paratantrasvabhāva]

[3] de bžin du gžan gyi dbañ gi ño bo ñid ces bya ba de yañ gañ yin?

chos rnam kyi rten ciñ 'brel par 'byuñ ba'i ño bo ñid kun nas ñon moñs pa dan, rnam par byañ ba'i gži gañ yin pa ste.²⁴

«btags pa²⁵ rgyu mtshan bcas phyir dan ||
gžan du gñis po med phyir dan ||

¹⁶ par AE : pa PD

¹⁷ sgrub par PD : ses par AE

¹⁸ pas PD : pa AE

¹⁹ Reference to *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā*, XVIII, 6, q.v.

²⁰ pa'i AE : pa PD

²¹ pa'i brjod pa 'jug pa ni brjod om. P

²² bu PDE : bu dan A

²³ rtogs AE : rtog PD

²⁴ ste PD : de AE

²⁵ btags pa AE : brtags pa'i PD (ut saepius infra)

kun nas ñon moñs dmigs pa'i phyir ||
gžan dbaṅ yod pa ñid du 'dod ||»²⁶

'di la yaṅ gal te gžan gyi dbaṅ gi²⁷ ño bo ñid tha sñad kyi bden par gtogs par 'dod na ni, de 'dod la rag ste, de ston pa don med do. ci ste don dam par na ni rten ciṅ 'brel par 'byuṅ ba ma yin te, skye ba med pa'i rab tu byed par bstan pa'i tshul gyis skye ba bkag pa'i phyir ro.²⁸

«btags pa rgyu mtshan bcaś phyir daṅ» žes bya ba de yaṅ phyogs kyi chos ma yin pa'i phyir, gtan tshigs kyi don ma grub pa ñid do. ci ste yaṅ, «btags pa rgyu mtshan bcaś phyir daṅ» žes bya ba 'dir chos mthun pa'i dpe'i tshig yin pas de'i phyir rjes su dpag pa ni don dam par gžugs žes btags pa gaṅ yin pa de ni rgyu mtshan daṅ bcaś pa ñid yin te, btags pa'i phyir ro žes brjod par byed na yaṅ, dper na 'di lta bu'o žes bya ba'i rjes su 'gro ba med pas gtan tshigs kyi don ma grub pa ñid do. gtan tshigs kyi don 'gal ba ñid kyaṅ yin te, gtan tshigs spyir²⁹ brjod pa'i phyir ro.

gaṅ dag³⁰ don dam par miṅ daṅ gžugs skye ba med do žes dam bcaś pa de la dam bcaś pa'i skyon 'dogs par byed pa de dag gal te rjes su dpag pas gnod pa smra na, de ñid kyi phyir de la rjes su dpag pas gnod pa med do. ci ste grags pas gnod do že na? de ni daṅ po ñid du lan btab zin to. ci ste mñon sum gyis gnod do že na? de yaṅ 'dir skahs med do. [4] don dam pa ni gñis su med pa'i phyir ci žig gaṅ gis kun nas ñon moñs pa daṅ, rnam par byaṅ bar 'gyur?

don dam par skye ba med par smra ba ni kun nas ñon moñs pa daṅ, rnam par byaṅ ba la skur pa 'debs pa ma yin no!

skur pa 'debs pa ma yin pa ma yin te, 'di ltar mdo sde las:-

«thog ma med pa'i dus ldan khamś ||
sa bon kun gyi gnas yin te ||
de yod pas na³¹ 'gro kun daṅ ||
mya ñan 'das pa thob par 'gyur ||»³²

²⁶ The Sanskrit of this (= *Xiān-yáng-shèng-jiào-lùn*, 558c 25–26, q.v.) is found as *Madhya-makahrdayakārikā*, V, 6:

prajñāpteḥ sanimittatvād anyathā dvayanāśataḥ |
saṃkleśasyopalabdheś ca paratantrāstitā matā ||

²⁷ dbaṅ gi AE : omm. PD

²⁸ Reference to *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā*, I, 1, q.v.

²⁹ spyir DAE : phyir P

³⁰ dag PD : omm. AE

³¹ na AE : ni PD

³² From *Abhidharmasūtra* (quoted *Mahāyānasamgrahabhāṣya*, *Triṃśikābhāṣya*, *Ratnagotravibhāga*, etc.):

anādikāliko dhātuḥ sarvabījasamāśrayaḥ |

tasmin sati gatiḥ sarvā nirvāṇādhigamo 'pi ca ||

— note that Bhavya here (as e.g. TJ, 235a7) reads 'bīja' for 'dharma'.

žes gsuñs pas; de ni gžan gyi dbaṅ yin par 'dod de, de yaṅ dag na ni chos kyi dbyiñs žes bya la, ma dag na ni ñon moñs pa can žes bya'o že na?

mdo sde las de skad gsuñs pa ni tha sñad kyi bden pa'i lugs gsal bar bya ba'i phyir te,³³ «thog ma med pa'i dus ldan khamś» žes bya ba ni rnam par śes pa thog ma med pa'i dus nas žugs pa'i phyir ro.³⁴ «khamś» žes bya ba ni 'phags pa'i chos kyi rgyu yin pa'i phyir te, gser daṅ dñul gyi khamś bžin no. «sa bon kun gyi gnas yin te» žes bya ba ni khamś gsum par gtogs pa daṅ, ma gtogs pa daṅ, dge ba daṅ, mi dge ba'i bag chags kyi sa bon gyi gnas yin pa'i phyir ro. «de yod pas na 'gro kun daṅ» žes bya ba ni de'i dbaṅ gis 'gro ba 'thob par byed pa'i chos mñon par 'du byed pa na'o. «mya ñan 'das pa thob par 'gyur» žes bya ba ni thos pa daṅ, bsam pa³⁵ daṅ, bsgoms pa las byuñ ba skye ba med pa śes pa ñid kyis mi skye ba'i chos can mya ñan las 'das pa 'thob pa'i phyir³⁶ žes bya bar tshigs su bcad pa'i don khas blañs pa'i phyir ro. tshigs su bcad pa'i don gžan yin par ni tshad ma dag gis bstan dka' ba'i phyir des ni lan mi thebs so.

[5] ci ste yaṅ mdo sde las:-

«brtags pa'i dños po med pa ñid ||
gžan gyi dbaṅ ni yod pa yin ||
sgro 'dogs pa daṅ skur pa'i mthar ||
rtog par byed pa ñams par 'gyur ||»³⁷

žes gsuñs pas; gžan gyi dbaṅ yod pa ñid do že na?

mdo sde'i don ni gžan gyi dbaṅ la miñ yod pa ma yin pa'i phyir daṅ, gžan gyi dbaṅ yaṅ tha sñad du sgyu ma daṅ, rmi lam lta bu'i bdag ñid du yod pa ñid gsal bar byed pa yin te; gžan las kyaṅ ji skad du:-

«miñ ni gaṅ daṅ gaṅ dag gis ||
chos rnams gaṅ daṅ gaṅ brjod pa ||
de la de ni yod min pa ||
de ni chos rnams chos ñid do ||»³⁸

³³ te DAE : to P .

³⁴ ro DAE : to P

³⁵ bsam pa P : bsams pa DAE (which is possible)

³⁶ phyir PD : phyir ro AE

³⁷ From *Lañkāvataraśūtra*, II, 191 ~ X, 305 (ed. Nanjio q.v. for variants):

nāsti vai kalpito bhāvaḥ paratantraś ca vidyate |

samāropāpavādaṃ hi vikalpānte (!) vinaśyati ||

— references to this in Dharmapāla's commentary to *Catuḥśataka* (*Taishō daizōkyō*, XXX, 1571, 247b 23 ff., q.v.) and in numerous later Madhyamaka texts (*Pañcaskandhaprakaraṇa*, *Śūnyatāsaptatvṛtti*, *Satyadvaya vibhaṅgavṛtti*, etc.). — Cf. also Kajiyama in *WZKSO*, XII–XIII (1968/1969), pp. 200–203, and *Tarkajālā* to MHK, V, 68.

³⁸ From *Ārya-Bhavasamkrāntiśūtra* (quoted *Bodhisattvabhūmi*, *Tattvasaṃgrahapañjikā*, etc. = *Madhyamakahrdayakārikā*, V, 74):

žes bya ba dañ, de bžin du:-

«bskyed bya med ciñ skyes pa med ||
rkyen rnamś dag ni gañ dag kyañ ||
'ga' yañ³⁹ gañ na'añ yod pa min ||
tha sñad du ni brjod par bya ||»⁴⁰

žes bya ba dañ, de bžin du:-

«gañ la cuñ zad skye med ciñ ||
'gag pa'añ cuñ zad yod min pa⁴¹ ||
'gro ba dben mthoñ de la ni ||
yod pa ñid dañ med ñid med ||»⁴²

ces bya ba la sogs pa gsuñs pa lta bu'o.

[6] khyed cag chos kyi khams ji ltar kun nas ñon moñs pa dañ, rnam par byañ bar 'gyur bar ston?

chos kyi khams ñon moñs pa can⁴³ dañ, ñon moñs pa can ma yin pa ñid du brjod par bya ba ma yin pa la, ñon moñs pa'i dri ma glo bur du⁴⁴ yod pa'i phyir:-

«chu khams gser dañ nam mkha' dag ||
dag pa bžin du dag par 'dod ||»⁴⁵

de ji ltar ñon moñs pa can dañ, ñon moñs pa can ma yin pa ñid du brjod par bya ba ma yin že na?

«gal te ñon moñs de ma gyur ||
lus can thams cad grol bar 'gyur ||

yena yena hi nāmnā vai yo yo dharmo 'bhilapyate |
na sa saṃvidyate tatra dharmāṇāṃ sa hi dharmatā ||

³⁹ 'ga' yañ DAE : dga' yañ P

⁴⁰ Lañkāvatārasūtra, II, 144~X, 89 (ed. Nanjio, q.v. for variants):
na cotpādyam na cotpannāḥ pratyayā api ke cana |
saṃvidyante kva cit ke cid vyavahāras tu kathyate ||

⁴¹ pa DAE : la P

⁴² Lañkāvatārasūtra, III, 14~X, 196 (ed. Nanjio, q.v. for variants):
yasya notpadyate kiṃ cin na ca kiṃ cin nirudhyate |
tasyāsti nāsti nopaiti viviktaṃ paśyato jagat ||

⁴³ can PD : omm. AE

⁴⁴ du PE : pa AD

⁴⁵ Madhyāntavibhāgākārikā, I, 16ab (ed. Nagao):
abdhātukanakākāśasuddhivac chuddhir iṣyate ||

gal te rnam dag de ma gyur ||
'bad pa 'bras bu med par 'gyur ||»⁴⁶

yañ na:-

«ñon moñs ma yin mi moñs min ||
de ni dag min ma dag min ||
sems ni rañ bzin 'od gsal phyir ||
ñon moñs glo bur⁴⁷ yin phyir ro ||»⁴⁸

de ni rigs pa⁴⁹ ma yin te; bdag tu smra ba dag gis kyañ:-

«gal te ñon moñs bdag ma gyur ||
lus can thams cad grol bar 'gyur ||
gal te rnam dag bdag ma gyur ||
'bad pa 'bras bu med par 'gyur ||»⁵⁰

de'i phyir re žig bdag rtag pa dag pa⁵¹ byed pa med pa yod de, 'on kyañ 'khor ba dañ
thar pa dag kyañ yod do žes de ltar⁵² phyir zlog par byed nus pa'i phyir ro. de'i phyir
rañ gi grub pa'i mtha'i skyon sba ba'i thabs 'thad pa med pas mi 'grub bo.

gžan yañ chu la sogs pa rgyu dañ rkyen gyi dbañ gis skye ba'i khyad par brten pa⁵³
dag bzin du tha sñad pa'i rnam par šes pa ñon moñs pa can dañ, ñon moñs pa can ma yin
pa'i dños por skye ba la bltos pas ñon moñs pa rnams dañ lhan cig skye ba dañ, ñon
moñs pa rnams med par phyin ci ma log pa'i šes pa dañ lhan cig skye ba yañ⁵⁴ kun nas
ñon moñs pa dañ, rnam par byañ ba dag tu 'byuñ bar⁵⁵ 'gyur bar ruñ ba; de ltar chos
kyi khams ni ñon moñs pa rnams dañ, šes pa dañ lhan cig skye ba ma yin pas chu la sogs
pa bzin du de bzin ñid kun nas ñon moñs pa dañ, rnam par byañ ba dag tu 'gyur bar mi
rigs so.

⁴⁶ Ibid., I, 21:

saṃkṣiptā ced bhaven nāsau muktāḥ syuḥ sarvadehinah |
viśuddhā ced bhaven nāsau vyāyāmo nisphalo bhavet ||

⁴⁷ glo bur DAE : blo bur P

⁴⁸ Madhyāntavibhāgakārikā, I, 22 (ed. Nagao):

na kṣiptā nāpi vākṣiptā śuddhā na caiva sā |
prabhāsvaratvāc cittasya kleśasyāgantukatvataḥ ||

⁴⁹ pa AE : pas PD

⁵⁰ Probably composed by Bhavya himself, cf. note 46.

⁵¹ rtag pa dag pa D : rtag pa dag P : brtag pa AE

⁵² de ltar AE : de lta D : om. P

⁵³ brten pa P : bsten pa DE : ston pa A

⁵⁴ yañ PAE : dañ D

⁵⁵ 'byuñ bar PD : omm. AE

gal te du ba dañ, khug rna la sogs pa yod pa dañ, med pa nam mkha'⁵⁶ dri ma dañ bcas pa dañ, dri ma med par brjod par bya ba ma yin nam že na? ma yin te, nam mkha' rdzas su yod pa ñid bkag pa'i phyir ro. rdzas su yod pa ñid yin na yañ dri ma dañ bcas pa dañ, dri ma med pa dag mi 'grub ste, skye ba dañ, 'gag pa med pa'i phyir, dper na chos kyi khams bzin no. yañ na nam mkha'⁵⁷ dri ma dañ bcas pa dañ,⁵⁸ dri ma med par 'gyur ba bzin du chos kyi khams la yañ kun nas ñon moñs pa dañ, rnam par byañ ba dag ñe bar btags pa'i phyir 'dod pa'i don ñams so. «kun nas ñon moñs⁵⁹ dmigs pa'i phyir» zes bya ba de la yañ dam bcas pa'i gtan tshigs kyi skyon sña ma bzin no.

[7] de skye ba ño bo ñid med pa yañ ji lta bu yin?

gal te⁶⁰ rkyen gyi stobs kyis skye žiñ rañ mi skye ba gañ yin pa'o že na? de⁶¹ don dam par ji lta rkyen gyi stobs kyis skye — ño bo⁶² ñid kyis sam? gzan gyi dños pos sam? gñi gas sam? ci yod pa las sam? ci med pa las sam? ci yod pa dañ, med pa las skye'o? zes brjod par bya grañ na, rnam pa thams cad las kyañ sñar bstan pa'i tshul gyis de skye ba med pa'i phyir, rkyen gyi stobs kyis skye ba⁶³ bstan dka'o.

ci ste sgyu ma la sogs pa'i skye ba bzin du brjod par bya ba ma yin pa'i skye ba spyir⁶⁴ brjod na ni tha sñad kyi bden pa sgrub pa⁶⁵ yin no. rkyen gyi stobs kyis skyes pa sgyu ma la sogs pa bzin du ño bo ñid las⁶⁶ skye ba med par ston pas dbu ma pa'i smra ba'i rjes su smra ba yañ yin te,⁶⁷ dBu ma pa'i bstan bcos kyi tshul ni:-

«rten ciñ 'brel par gañ 'byuñ ba ||
de ni stoñ pa ñid du bsad ||»⁶⁸

ces bya bas dños po rnams rañ las skye ba med pa yin pa'i phyir ro.

ci ste ño bo ñid las skye ba med pa ni ño bo ñid med pa ñid⁶⁹ yin te, mdo sde las:-

«gañ žig rkyen las skyes pa⁷⁰ de ma skyes ||»⁷¹

⁵⁶ mkha' AE : mkha'i PD (pro mkha' ni?)

⁵⁷ mkha' DAE : mkha'i P

⁵⁸ dañ PAE : om. D

⁵⁹ moñs : moñs pa PDAE

⁶⁰ te PD : te de AE

⁶¹ de PDE : om. A

⁶² ño bo PD : ji (!) ño bo AE

⁶³ skye ba PD : skye ba med pa AE

⁶⁴ spyir DAE : phyir P (cf. n. 29)

⁶⁵ sgrub pa PD : bsgrub pa AE

⁶⁶ las PDE : la A

⁶⁷ yin te PDE : ma yin te A

⁶⁸ Mūlamadhyamakakārikā, XXIV, 18ab (ed. Lindtner):
yañ pratītyasamutpādaḥ sūnyatām tām pracakṣmahe |

⁶⁹ ñid PDE : om. A

⁷⁰ skyes pa PD : skye ba AE

žes gsuñs pa'i tshig dañ rjes su mthun pa'i phyir ro že na? de lta na yañ dbu ma pa'i smra ba'i rjes su smra ba yin te, ño bo ñid las de skye ba 'gog pa'i phyir ro.

[8] ji ltar rnal 'byor spyod pa pas⁷² gžan gyi dbaṅ gi ño bo ñid rgyu mtshan du mi 'dzin pas yañ dag par rjes su mi mthoṅ ba yin?

gal te ji ltar snaṅ ba de ltar med pa yin no že na? ci'i phyir de de ltar med pa yin?⁷³
gal te don dam par de ltar ma skyes pa'i phyir ro že na ni? dbu ma pa'i smra ba'i rjes su smra ba yin no! ci ste ji ltar skyes pa de ltar med de, brten nas⁷⁴ skyes pa'i phyir, sgyu ma la sogs pa bžin no že na ni? 'o na de lta na gžan gyi dbaṅ yod pa ñid kyaṅ ma yin la, dbu ma pa'i⁷⁵ smra ba'i rjes su smra ba yin te! dbu ma pa'i⁷⁵ smra ba'i tshul ni:-

«rmi lam ji bžin sgyu ma 'dra⁷⁶ ||
dri za'i groṅ khyer ji bžin du ||
de ltar⁷⁷ skye dañ de bžin gnas ||
de bžin du ni 'jig pa⁷⁸ gsuñs ||»⁷⁹

žes bya ba yin pa'i phyir ro.

gal te gñis po dag yoñs su ma grub pa'i phyir,⁸⁰ ji ltar snaṅ ba de ltar med do že na ni?
de la ci'i phyir gñis po dag yoñs su ma grub ces brgal žiṅ brtag pa de dañ lan ñid⁸¹ de bžin du ñe bar gnas so.

[9] ci ste yañ 'di sñam du:-

«don dañ sems can bdag rnam rig ||
snaṅ ba'i rnam par šes pa ni⁸² ||

⁷¹ From *Anavataptahradāpasamkramaṇasūtra* (often quoted in Sanskrit, cf. ref. in *JIP*, IX (1981), p. 204, n. 69 and *Vimalakīrtinirdeśa* (tr. Lamorte), p. 41):

yah pratyayair jāyati sa hy ajāto...

⁷² rnal 'byor spyod pa pas AE : rnal 'byor pas PD

⁷³ yin PAE : yin te D

⁷⁴ brten nas PDE : rten nas A

⁷⁵ pa'i PDE : pa A

⁷⁶ 'dra PD : bžin AE

⁷⁷ de ltar PDE : ji ltar A

⁷⁸ 'jig pa D : 'jigs pa P : 'jig par AE

⁷⁹ *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā*, VII, 34 (ed. Lindtner):

yathā māyā yathā svapno gandharvanagaram yathā |

tathotpādas tathā sthānam tathā bhaṅga udāhṛtam ||

— note that all the Tibetan and Chinese versions, with the sole exception of *Zhōng lùn* (*Taishō daizōkyō*, XXX, 1564, 12a 23), invert the ordo naturalis of *māyā* and *svapna* in *pāda* a.

⁸⁰ phyir DAE : phyir ro P

⁸¹ de dañ lan ñid PD : de ñid AE

⁸² ni AE : yis PD

*rab tu skye'o de'i don med ||
de med pas na de yañ med ||»⁸³*

*ces bya bas don med pa'i phyir, rgyu mtshan du 'dzin par⁸⁴ mi 'grub bo sñam na⁸⁵ yañ
don de bstan par dka'o!*

*gal te bstan par mi dka' ste, mdo sde las:- «kye rgyal ba'i sras 'di lta ste: kham
gsum pa 'di ni sems tsam mo»⁸⁶ zes gsuñs pa'i phyir ro ze na? de ni lan ma yin te, mdo
sde'i tshig gzan du rnam par bśad pa'i phyir dañ, bsgrub par bya ba'i don mñon sum ma
yin pa de ni⁸⁷ luñ dañ rjes su dpag pa dag gis 'grub pa'i⁸⁸ phyir ro.*

*gal te rnam par śes pa ni tsai tra⁸⁹ la sogs pa'i don gyis stoñ pa yin te, 'jug pa dañ
ldan pa'i phyir dañ, 'bras bu yin pa'i phyir dañ, mi rtag pa'i phyir dañ, gyo ba med pa'i
phyir dañ, dus su⁹⁰ 'jug pa'i phyir, dper na rañ gi bag chags thob pas 'jug pa'i rmi lam
gyi sems bzin no zes rjes su dpag pa'i phyir dañ, luñ las:-*

*«phyi rol snañ ba yod min te ||
lus dañ loñs spyod gnas 'dra bar ||
sams ni sna tshogs snañ bas na ||
sams tsam du ni ña smra'o ||»⁹¹*

zes gsuñs pa' phyir skyon med do ze na?

*rnam par śes pa don gyis stoñ pa yin te zes dam bcas pa de'i⁹² don gañ yin? gal te de'i
don phyi rol gyi rkyen la mi bltos par⁹³ bag chags kyi sa bon gyi rgyu lañ rnam par śes*

⁸³ *Madhyāntavibhāgākārikā*, I, 3 (ed. Nagao):
arthasattvātma vijñaptipratibhāsam prajāyate |
vijñānam nāsti cāsyārthas tadabhāvāt tad apy asat ||

⁸⁴ *par PD : pa AE*

⁸⁵ *na AE : nas PD*

⁸⁶ *Daśabhūmikāsūtra* according to Avalokitavrata (cf. Rahder's edition p. 49: *cittamātram idaṃ yad
idaṃ traidhātukam...*). Also quoted TJ, Dsa fol. 218a4: *kye rgyal ba'i sras, kham gsum pa 'di dag thams
cad ni sems tsam yin no...* Similarly *Madhyamakahrdayakārikā*, V, 28 and *Madhyamakaratnapradīpa*,
IV, initio. — Cf. May in *EA*, XXV (1971), p. 274.

⁸⁷ *de ni AE : ni PD*

⁸⁸ *'grub pa'i DAE : sgrub pa'i P*

⁸⁹ *tsai tra PDE : tsa trai A*

⁹⁰ *su AE : omm. PD*

⁹¹ *Laṅkāvatārasūtra*, III, 33 X, 487 (ed. Nanjio, q.v. for variants):
drśyam na vidyate bāhyam cittam citram hi drśyate |
dehabhogapratīṣṭhānam cittamātram vadāmy aham ||
—cf. *Madhyamakāvatāra*, p. 194 (ed. La Vallée Poussin).

⁹² *pa de'i PAE : pa'i D*

⁹³ *bltos par P : ltos par DAE*

pa skye ba yin na ni, de la gal te don dam par phyi rol gyi rkyen la mi bltos par rnam par śes pa skye bar ston na dpe med do. ci ste tha sñad du na ni⁹⁴ grags pas gnod do.

sañs rgyas kyi dbaṅ gis sam, lha'i dbaṅ gis sam, daṅ po luṅ phog⁹⁵ pa'i rnam par rig pa las skyes pa'i rnam par śes pa dag gi⁹⁶ gtan tshigs kyi don ma ñes pa ñid daṅ, sañs rgyas 'byuṅ ba don med pa ñid daṅ, tha sñad kyi bden par gtogs pa'i don snaṅ ba med pa ñid du yaṅ 'gyur ro.

de ño bo ñid las⁹⁷ yod pa ma yin pa'i phyir,⁹⁸ phyi rol gyi don ño bo ñid yod pa ma yin yaṅ, phyi rol gyi don gyi yul gyi⁹⁹ ño bo ñid log par snaṅ ba ma rtogs pa la¹⁰⁰ sgyu ma mñon par mi śes pa bžin du lus daṅ loṅs spyod daṅ, gnas 'dra ba'i sems sna tshogs skye bas sems sna tshogs su snaṅ žiṅ, lus daṅ loṅs spyod daṅ, gnas kyi grib ma lta bus ñe bar kha sgyur¹⁰¹ ba'i phyir lus daṅ loṅs spyod daṅ gnas lta bur yaṅ snaṅ¹⁰² ño. de med du zin na de ltar snaṅ ba ñid du mi 'gyur te, dper na ri boṅ gi rva snaṅ ba ñid du mi 'gyur ba bžin no.

bcom ldan 'das kyis «sems tsam» žes gsuṅs pa'i mdo sde'i don kyaṅ sems las gžan pa'i byed pa po daṅ, za ba po med pa'i phyir sems tsam mo žes gsuṅs par khas blaṅs pa'i phyir, de ltar ñes par byar mi nus te,¹⁰³ byaṅ chub sems dpa'i sa drug pa las byaṅ chub sems dpa'¹⁰⁴ srid pa'i yan lag bcu gñis kyi skye ba daṅ, 'gag pa la¹⁰⁵ so sor rtog pa na¹⁰⁶ 'di sñam du: - «sdug bsñal gyi phuṅ po 'ba' žig pa 'dis sdug bsñal gyi siṅ ljon pa mñon par 'grub par byed gyi, byed pa po 'am tshor ba po ni med do»,¹⁰⁷ sñam nas de 'di sñam du sems te: - «byed pa po la mñon par žen pa las bya ba mñon par 'gyur gyi, gaṅ la byed pa po med pa de la don dam par bya ba yaṅ dmigs su med do»,¹⁰⁸ sñam nas de 'di sñam du sems te: - «'di lta ste: kham s gsum pa 'di ni sems tsam ste, sems tsam gyis rab tu phye ba daṅ, sems kyis mñon par 'du byas pa yin gyi, dbaṅ phyug¹⁰⁹ la sogs pa byed

⁹⁴ na ni PDE : ni A

⁹⁵ luṅ phog AE : luṅ 'bog P : luṅ dbogs D

⁹⁶ gi AE : gis PD

⁹⁷ las AE : la PD

⁹⁸ phyir PDE : phyir ro A

⁹⁹ yul gyi DAE : om. P

¹⁰⁰ rtogs pa la : gtogs pa la AE : gtogs pa las D : btogs pa las P

¹⁰¹ sgyur A : bsgyur PDE

¹⁰² snaṅ ño PD : ño AE

¹⁰³ mi nus te PD : mi ruṅ ste AE

¹⁰⁴ dpa' PAE : dpa'i D

¹⁰⁵ la PD : las AE

¹⁰⁶ na PDE : om. A

¹⁰⁷ Daśabhūmikasūtra, p. 49 (ed. Rahder):

...ayaṃ kevalo duḥkhaskandho duḥkhavṛkṣo 'bhinirvartate kārakavedakavirahita iti...

¹⁰⁸ Ibid., p. 49:

...kārakābhiniveśataḥ kriyāḥ prajñāyante; yatra kārako nāsti, kriyāpi tatra paramārthato nopalabhyate...

¹⁰⁹ phyug DAE : phyugs P

pa po ni med do»¹¹⁰ sñam du rnam par ñes par¹¹¹ mdzad nas:- «kye rgyal ba'i sras 'di lta ste: kham s gsum pa 'di ni sems tsam mo»,¹¹² zes gsuñs te; «tsam» zes gsuñs pa de ni byed pa po de¹¹³ dgag pa yin par ses pa bya'i, don dgag pa ni ma yin par ses par bya'o. [10] gañ dag 'di skad ces:- dños po gzugs can rnams ni sems kyi ño bo ñid yin te, rnam par ses pa'i yul yin pa'i phyir, dper na de ma thag pa'i rkyen bzin no¹¹⁴ — zes zer na, sems las byuñ ba dag gis ma ñes pa ñid yin no. gzugs la sog pa ni sems dañ sems las byuñ ba'i ño bo ñid yin par ston na yañ, sems dañ sems las byuñ ba dag gis so sor ma ñes pa ñid yin no. grub pa'i mtha' dañ 'gal ba yañ yin te, tshul ni:-

«de la don mthoñ rnam par ses ||
de yi bye brag sems las byuñ ||»¹¹⁵

zes bya ba yin pa'i phyir ro. sña ma bzin du dam bcas pa'i skyon yañ yod do. [11] gañ dag 'di skad ces:- 'di la gzugs kyi blo 'di'i yul rdul phra rab kyi gzugs gcig yin nam, 'dus pa yin; de la rdul phra rab kyi gzugs gcig ni gzugs kyi blo'i spyod yul ma yin te, de mi¹¹⁶ snañ ba'i phyir, dper na mig bzin no. ci ste 'dus pa yin na ni de gzugs kyi blo'i yul ma yin te, rdzas su yod pa ma yin pa'i phyir, dper na zla ba gñis su snañ ba bzin no¹¹⁷ — zes zer na, de la gal te don dam par mig gi rnam par ses pa gzugs la dmigs pa ñid dañ, gzugs kyañ mig gi rnam par ses pa'i dmigs par bya ba ñid ma yin par 'gog par byed na ni, grub pa la sgrub pa yin no. ci ste tha sñad du na ni¹¹⁸ grags pas gnod do. rdul phra rab dag¹¹⁹ dbañ po'i rnam par rig pa dag gi yul ma yin no¹²⁰ zes dam bcas pa de'i don kyañ gañ yin? gal te yul gzan yod pa yin na ni phyogs¹²¹ sña ma la gnod do. gal te de la yul med na ni dpe med de, gzugs kyi blo phyogs su byas pa yul med ma grub pa'i phyir ro.

gzan yañ blo¹²² rdul phra rab kyi gzugs bsags pa dañ, bsags pa ma yin pa gcig pu la dmigs pa dag phyogs su byas pas, gcig gi¹²³ dus la ni gtan tshigs kyi don ma grub pa ñid

¹¹⁰ Not found in the textus receptus of *Daśabhūmikasūtra*

¹¹¹ par PD : pa AE

¹¹² See note 86.

¹¹³ de P : med de D : omm. AE

¹¹⁴ Cf. *Madhyamakahrdayakārikā*, V, 27

¹¹⁵ *Madhyāntavibhāgakārikā*, I, 8cd (ed. Nagao):

tatrārthadrṣṭir vijñānaṃ tadviśeṣe tu caitasāḥ ||

¹¹⁶ mi DAE : ni P

¹¹⁷ Cf. *Madhyamakahrdayakārikā*, V, 31–34 and Dignāga's *Ālambanaparīkṣā*.

¹¹⁸ du na ni A : du PD : du ni E

¹¹⁹ rab dag AE : rab PD

¹²⁰ no PDE : om. A

¹²¹ phyogs PAE : yul gzan phyogs D

¹²² blo AE : blo gzan PD

¹²³ gi DAE : gis P

de, bsags pa'i gzugs rdul phra rab kyi gzugs gzan gyis¹²⁴ phan btags pa gcig pu yañ rañ gi bdag ñid snañ ba'i blo bskyed pa¹²⁵ yin pa'i phyir, de'i blo yod pas de mi snañ ba ñid ma grub pa'i phyir ro. gzan gyi dus la ni grub pa la sgrub pa yin te, bsags pa ma yin pa'i gzugs mig gi rnam par śes pa'i yul ñid du khas ma blañs pa'i phyir ro. (chos mñon pa las kyañ:-

«gzugs can bcu ni bsags pa'o ||»¹²⁶

žes 'byuñ bas de'i phyir bsags pa ma yin pa ni yul gyi dños por mi 'grub bo.) gzugs la dmigs pa med par gzugs kyi blo skye bar¹²⁷ dam 'cha' na¹²⁸ ni gzugs la dmigs par mi byed pa'i blo ni mig gi dbañ po'i blo ñid yin par mi 'grub pas de mi snañ ba'i phyir žes bya ba'i gtan tshigs kyi gži ma grub pa ñid do.

gzugs kyi¹²⁹ blo'i yul 'dus pa ñid la yañ rdzas su yod pa ma yin pa'i phyir žes gañ smras pa de la sñā ma bžin du dam bcas pa'i skyon yod do. zla ba gñis su snañ ba yañ gal te don yin no že na ni, de rañ dañ gzan la mi 'grub ste, rnam pa de lta bu'i don mi srid pa'i phyir ro. 'on te zla ba gñis su snañ ba blo yin no že na? de ni¹³⁰ rdzas su yod pa ma yin par ma grub pa'i phyir, dpe la¹³¹ sgrub pa'i chos ma tshañ ba¹³² ñid kyi skyon yod do. gzugs kyi rnam par śes pa gzugs žes bya ba'i don gyis¹³³ stoñ par ston na ni¹³⁴ dpe la bsgrub par bya ba chos ma tshañ ba ñid kyi skyon yod de,¹³⁵ zla ba gñis su¹³⁶ mthoñ ba'i blo phyi rol gyi dmigs pa la ma bltos¹³⁷ par skye bar mi 'grub pa'i phyir ro.

[12] gzan yañ smra bar 'dod pa'i rnam par śes pa ni dmigs pa'i rkyen gzugs kyi rnam par śes pa'i gzugs su snañ ba ñid gañ yin pa de dañ ldan pa ma yin te, mig gi rgyu dañ ldan pa'i phyir, dper na de ñid kyi rañ gi bdag ñid du snañ ba bžin pas tha sñad du yañ¹³⁸ dmigs pa'i rkyen la skur pa 'debs pa'i phyir mdzad pa'i mtha' dañ 'gal ba'o.¹³⁹

¹²⁴ gyis PDE : gyi A

¹²⁵ bskyed pa AE : skyes pa PD

¹²⁶ Abhidharmakośakārikā, I, 35d (ed. Pradhan):

...saṃcitā daśa rūpiṇaḥ ||

¹²⁷ skye bar DAE : skyes par P

¹²⁸ 'cha' na PD : 'cha' ba AE

¹²⁹ kyi PD : la AE

¹³⁰ de ni PD : ni de AE

¹³¹ dpe la AE : dper na PD

¹³² ma tshañ ba PDE : tshañ ba A

¹³³ gyis DAE : gyi P

¹³⁴ ni AE : omm. PD

¹³⁵ de AE : do PD

¹³⁶ su AE : omm. PD

¹³⁷ bltos P : ltos DAE

¹³⁸ yañ PD : omm. AE

¹³⁹ ba'o PD : lo AE

rnam par śes pa ni rañ gi bdag ñid kyis¹⁴⁰ ñes par gnas pa'i phyir rgyu yod na lta ba med par mi 'thad pas dmigs pa med par mi 'grub bo.

ci ste sñam du:-

*«dmigs pa la ni brten byas nas ||
mi dmigs pa ni rab tu skye ||
mi dmigs pa la brten byas nas ||
mi dmigs pa ni rab tu skye ||»¹⁴¹*

žes 'byuñ bas skyon med do sñam na, phyogs de'i lan ni'btab zin te, rnam par rig pa tsam ñid kyis kye ba rab tu grub par¹⁴² gyur na ni de yañ 'grub par 'gyur ba¹⁴³ žig na de ni rab tu ma grub pa'i phyir ro.¹⁴⁴ de yod par gyur na yañ ji ltar rnam par śes pa med par 'gyur žes bya ba de ñid de bžin du ñe bar gnas so. gal te skye ba med pas don med pa'i phyir ro že na ni? de ñid dbu ma pa'i smra ba'i rjes su smra ba yin no.

[13] gžan yañ rnam par rig pa ñe bar blañ ba yañ byas nas gal te de yoñs su gtoñ bar yañ 'dod na ni, 'di ltar 'dam rdzab 'khru bas¹⁴⁵ mi reg par thag bsriñ ba¹⁴⁶ bzañ ño. don ño bo ñid med pa ñid du rtogs pa¹⁴⁷ bžin du rnam par śes pa yañ bdag med pa ñid dañ, skye ba med pa ñid du rtogs par byar ruñ ño. dañ por phyi rol gyi don gyi¹⁴⁸ yul sgom par byed ciñ, rim gyis¹⁴⁹ rnam par śes pa dañ, ye śes kyis yul sgom par byed na ni rim pa¹⁵⁰ kho nas bdag med pa ñid rtogs par 'grub pa'i phyir, sñā nas cig car du¹⁵¹ bsgom pa la ser sna bya mi dgos so.

de'i phyir de ltar kun brtags pa dañ gžan gyi dbañ mi mthoñ ba¹⁵² mi 'thad pa'i phyir dmigs pa thams cad ñe bar ži ba mi 'grub bo.

¹⁴⁰ kyis DAE : kyis P

¹⁴¹ *Madhyamakahrdayakārikā*, V, 4 & 49 = *Madhyāntavibhāgakārikā*, I, 6 (ed. Nagao):
upalabdhiṃ samāśritya nopalabdhiḥ prajāyate |

nopalabdhiṃ samāśritya nopalabdhiḥ prajāyate ||

¹⁴² grub par PDE : 'grub par A

¹⁴³ 'grub par 'gyur ba A : grub par gyur pa PDE

¹⁴⁴ phyir ro PDE : phyir A

¹⁴⁵ 'khru bas PD : 'khru ba bas AE

¹⁴⁶ bsriñ ba PDE : bsriñs pa A (cf. *Madhyamakahrdayakārikā*, V, 53)

¹⁴⁷ rtogs pa PDE : brtags pa A

¹⁴⁸ don gyi PD : omm. AE

¹⁴⁹ gyis DAE : gyi P

¹⁵⁰ rim pa AE : rim PD

¹⁵¹ car du DAE : char du P

¹⁵² ba P : bar DAE

[γ. Pariniṣpannasvabhāva]

[14] *de bzin du yoṅs su grub pa'i ṅo bo ṅid ces bya ba de yaṅ gaṅ yin?*

chos rnams kyi de bzin ṅid gaṅ yin pa'o ze na? 'o na don dam par chos de rnams ṅid ma grub pas de rnams kyi chos ṅid kyaṅ mi 'thad pa ma yin nam, ci ste tha sṅad du rmi lam lta bu'i bdag ṅid du skyes pa yod pa rnams don dam par de ltar yod pa ma yin pa ṅid ni chos rnams kyi de bzin yin no ze na ni,¹⁵³ de ṅo bo ṅid kyis skye ba med pa kho nar¹⁵⁴ grub pa'i phyir dbu ma pa'i¹⁵⁵ smra ba'i rjes su smra ba ṅid yin no.

ci ste 'di sṅam du yoṅs su grub pa'i ṅo bo ṅid ni med pa ma yin te; 'di ltar de ni gñis med pa'i dños po'i mtshan ṅid de, ji skad du:-

*«gñis dños¹⁵⁶ dños po med pa yi¹⁵⁷ ||
dños po stoṅ pa'i mtshan ṅid do ||»¹⁵⁸*

zes¹⁵⁹ bśad pa lta bu'o ze na, de la 'dir yaṅ 'thad pa gaṅ gis gñis med pa yin — gal te:-

*«dmigs pa la ni brten byas nas ||
mi dmigs pa ni rab tu skye ||
mi dmigs pa la brten byas nas ||
mi dmigs pa ni rab tu skye ||»¹⁶⁰*

zes bya bas so ze na?

phyogs de'i lan ni¹⁶¹ btab zin to! gñis med pa zes bya ba'i dgag pa 'di yaṅ gal te¹⁶² med par dgag pa'i don yin na ni de gñis med par dgag pa kho na¹⁶³ mthu zad pa yin te, med pa'i skyon du ma gyur pa ni dgag pa gtso che ba'i phyir don dam par med pa ma yin pas 'di ltar¹⁶⁴ gñis med pa'i dños po yin no zes skur pa 'debs pa mi rigs so. 'on te ma yin par dgag pa'i don yin na ni de sgrub pa gtso che ba'i phyir dños po med pa ston par byed

¹⁵³ ni DAE : | P

¹⁵⁴ nar PD : na AE

¹⁵⁵ pa'i PDE : omm. A

¹⁵⁶ dños PAE : po D

¹⁵⁷ yi PA : yin DE

¹⁵⁸ *Madhyāntavibhāgākārikā*, I, 13ab (ed. Nagao):
dvayābhāvo hy abhāvasya bhāvaḥ śūnyasya lakṣaṇam |

— cf. *Madhyamakahrdayakārikā*, V, 10 ff.

¹⁵⁹ zes DAE : ces P

¹⁶⁰ See note 141.

¹⁶¹ ni AE : omm. PD

¹⁶² gal te PDE : rgal te A

¹⁶³ na PD : nas AE

¹⁶⁴ 'di ltar PDE : de ltar A

*pas*¹⁶⁵ *de ni mi 'dod de*,¹⁶⁶ *skur pa 'debs pa'i mtha' yin pa'i phyir ro. ri boñ gi rva med pa yañ dños po med pa ma yin te, 'di ltar med pa'i dños po de dañ*,¹⁶⁷ *don dam pa*¹⁶⁸ *'dra bar gyur na chad par lta ba bsgrub*¹⁶⁹ *par 'gyur ro.*

[15] *de'i*¹⁷⁰ *dmigs pa rnam par dag pa ñid kyañ ji lta bu yin? gal te rnam par mi rtog pa'i ño bo ñid kyis so že na, dmigs pa can gyi ye šes de ni rnam par mi rtog pa žes bya ba ma yin te, 'di ni 'di'o žes rnam par mi rtog kyañ yul snañ ba'i phyir, dper na mig gi rnam par šes pa bžin pas, mdo sde las:- «don dam pa'i bden pa gañ že na? gañ la ye šes kyañ mi 'jug na yi ge rnams lta smoš kyañ ci dgos»*¹⁷¹ *žes bya ba dañ:- «mthoñ ba med pa ni de kho na*¹⁷² *mthoñ ba'o»*¹⁷³ *žes bya ba dañ:- «tshañs pa,*¹⁷⁴ *de bžin gšegs pa rnams kyi byañ chub ni dmigs su med pa'o»*¹⁷⁵ *žes bya ba la sogs pa gsuñs pa dañ yañ 'gal lo. rtogs par bya ba skye ba med pa bžin du šes pa yañ skye ba med pa'i phyir,*¹⁷⁶ *de 'jug pa med par grub ste, bcom ldan 'das kyis:- «šes bya dañ tha mi dad pa'i ye šes kyis chos thams cad thugs su chud do»*¹⁷⁷ *žes gsuñs pa de yañ grub pa yin pas, de'i phyir dbu ma pa'i smra ba'i tshul la yañ dag par brten pa ñid legs so.*

*ci ste 'di sñam du dper na: thag pa bsdogs pa la sbrul du 'du šes pas thag pa'i ño bo ñid rtogs na sbrul gyi 'jigs pa*¹⁷⁸ *ñe bar ži ba bžin du de bžin ñid mthoñ bas ñon moñs pa ži bar 'gyur ba'i phyir chos kyi dbyiñs la dmigs par bya ba kho na yin no sñam na? ji ltar thag pa bsdogs pa la*¹⁷⁹ *sbrul gyi blo skyes na log par šes pa'i phyir 'jigs pa*¹⁸⁰ *skye'i, de'i blo ma skyes na yañ dag par šes pa'i phyir 'jigs pa med pa dañ, skyon cha mi mñam pa skyes na nad du 'gyur gyi, de ma skyes na sdug bsñal med par 'gyur ba bžin pas de bžin ñid la dmigs pa'i ye šes skye bar 'dod par mi bya'o. dños po rnams rnam pa thams cad du yoñs su ma grub pa ni*¹⁸¹ *dños po'i de kho na yin la, de ni*¹⁸² *rnam pa*

¹⁶⁵ *pas* PDE : *pa* A

¹⁶⁶ *de* PD : *do* AE

¹⁶⁷ *de dañ* DAE : *dañ* P

¹⁶⁸ *pa* A : *par* PDE

¹⁶⁹ *ba bsgrub* A : *bar bsgrubs* P : *ba 'grub* D : *ba bsgrubs* E

¹⁷⁰ *de'i* PD : *de mi* AE

¹⁷¹ From the *Akṣayamatinirdeśasūtra* (cf. references MCB, II (1932–1933), p. 113):

... *paramārthasatyam katamat? yatra jñānasyāpy apracārah, kaḥ punar vādo 'kṣarāṇām...*

¹⁷² *de kho na* DAE : *kho na* P

¹⁷³ From the *Dharmasamgītisūtra*, cf. JIP, IX (1981), p. 197, n. 7.

¹⁷⁴ *tshañs pa* DAE : *tshañ pa* P

¹⁷⁵ From the *Satyakaparivarta*, cf. Avalokitavrata *ad loc.*

¹⁷⁶ *phyir* DAE : *phyir ro* P

¹⁷⁷ Sūtra not traced.

¹⁷⁸ *gyi 'jigs pa* PDE : *gyis 'jig* A

¹⁷⁹ *pa la* PDE : *la pa* A

¹⁸⁰ *'jigs pa* PDE : *'jig pa* A

¹⁸¹ *pa ni* E : *pa'i* P : *pa* DA

¹⁸² *de ni* DE : *de'i* P : *de ñid* A

*thams cad du yañ yul gyi dños por ñe bar mi 'gyur ba'i phyir dmigs pa ñid du mi rigs so.
de ñid kyi phyir bcom ldan 'das la¹⁸³ 'jam dpal gžon nur gyur pas:-*

*«sañs rgyas nam mkha'i mtshan ñid de¹⁸⁴ ||
nam mkha' la yañ mtshan ñid¹⁸⁴ med ||
mtshan gži¹⁸⁵ mtshan ñid ñes grol ba ||
dmigs med khyod la phyag 'tshal lo ||»¹⁸⁶*

žes bya ba la sogs pas bstod pa mdzad do.

*ci ste 'di sñam du gal te de bžin gšegs pas chos kyi dbyiñs ma dmigs na, ji ltar de
thugs su chud pas sañs rgyas par gyur sñam na? chos thams cad rnam pa thams cad du
yoñs su ma grub pa'i phyir rnam pa thams cad mkhyen pa'i spyod yul ni de kho na žes
bya ste, šes bya dañ, de kho na dañ, spyod yul dañ, ye šes skye ba med pa ñid kyi¹⁸⁷
chos kyi dbyiñs thugs su chud pas sañs rgyas par gyur te; ji skad du:- «de bžin gšegs pa
rnams kyi byañ chub ni mñon par rtogs pa med pas rab tu phye ba'o»¹⁸⁸ žes gsuñs pa lta
bu'o.*

*de bžin ñid la dmigs pa'i ye šes ni don dam pa'i spyod yul can yin par mi rigs te, 'dus
byas yin pa'i phyir, dper na mig gi rnam par šes pa bžin no. de bžin du de'i dmigs par
bya ba de bžin ñid kyañ bslu ba'i¹⁸⁹ chos can yin žiñ de kho na ma yin te, dmigs par bya
ba yin pa'i phyir, dper na gzugs bžin no.*

*ci ste mdo sde las:- «don dam pa ni brtag par¹⁹⁰ mi nus pa dañ, rtog ge'i spyod pa
ma yin par bstan pa'i¹⁹¹ phyir rjes su dpag pas bstan par bya ba¹⁹² ma yin no»¹⁹³ ze na?
luñ dañ mthun pa'i rjes su dpag pa'i stobs ñid kyi rnam par rtog pa thams cad bkag
pas¹⁹⁴ rnam par mi rtog pa'i ye šes 'grub pa'i phyir don dam pa ni rjes su dpag pa'i yul
ma yin yañ, de gtso bo ma yin pa¹⁹⁵ ma yin te, yañ dag pa dañ yañ dag pa ma yin pa
brtag pa'i¹⁹⁶ sgrub pa¹⁹⁷ gžan med pa'i phyir de ni rigs pa ma yin no.*

¹⁸³ 'das la PDE : 'das A

¹⁸⁴ de || nam mkha' la yañ mtshan ñid omm. D

¹⁸⁵ gži PAE : ñid D

¹⁸⁶ From the *Sarvabuddhaviṣayāvatārajñānālokālamkārasūtra*, cf. *JIP*, IX (1981), p. 204, n. 59, and *Tarkajvālā*, Dśa fol. 250 a8.

¹⁸⁷ kyi AE : kyi DP

¹⁸⁸ Sūtra not traced.

¹⁸⁹ bslu ba'i PA : slu ba'i DE

¹⁹⁰ brtag par AE : brtag PD

¹⁹¹ ma yin par bstan pa'i DAE : ma yin pa'i P

¹⁹² bya ba PAE : bya ba de bžin D

¹⁹³ Sūtra not traced.

¹⁹⁴ pas AE : pa'i PD

¹⁹⁵ gtso bo ma yin PAE : gtsó bo D

¹⁹⁶ brtag pa'i AE : brtags pa'i PD

¹⁹⁷ sgrub pa DAE : bsgrub pa D

[16] *dpyad pa*¹⁹⁸ *rgyas par ni dBu ma'i sñiñ po'i de kho na la 'jug pa'i skabs*¹⁹⁹ *nas rnal 'byor spyod pa pa dag dañ lhan cig byed par 'gyur ro. žar la bśad pas chog ste, 'di ni mñon par brtson pa rnams rañ gi sde pa dag dañ lhan cig rigs pa dañ rigs pa ma yin pa rtogs pa'i*²⁰⁰ *phyogs tsam žig bstan pa yin no. de la 'dir rab tu byed pa'i don ni pha rol po dag gis rab tu byed pa'i dañ por bsgrub pa*²⁰¹ *smras pa'i skyon brjod pas mya ñan las 'das pa ño bo ñid med pa ñid du bstan pa yin no.*

de'i phyir:-

«*mya ñan 'das med mya ñan 'das ||*
*'jig rten mgon pos bstan par*²⁰² *mdzad ||*
*nam mkhas*²⁰³ *mdud pa bor*²⁰⁴ *byas pa ||*
*nam mkha' ñid kyis bkrol ba*²⁰⁵ *bžin ||*»²⁰⁶

žes bya ba dañ, de bžin du:- «*bcom ldan 'das, gañ dag chos 'ga' žig ſkye ba 'am, 'gag par 'tshal ba de dag la sañs rgyas 'byuñ ba ma mchis so. bcom ldan 'das, gañ dag mya ñan las 'das pa dños po las yoñs su tshol bar bgyid pa de dag la 'khor ba las yañ dag par 'da' ba*²⁰⁷ *ma mchis so. de ci'i slad du že na? bcom ldan 'das, mtshan ma thams cad rab tu ži ba dañ, gyo ba thams cad ñe bar ži ba gañ lags pa de mya ñan las 'das pa lags pa'i slad du'o. bcom ldan 'das, mi gti mug can gañ dag mya ñan las 'das pa dños po las yoñs su tshol bar bgyid pa de dag ni, legs par gsuñs pa'i chos 'dul ba 'di la rab tu byuñ nas, mu stegs can gyi lta bar lhuñ ba lags te: bcom ldan 'das, gañ dag chos thams cad gtan yoñs su mya ñan las 'das pa dag — 'di lta ste dper bgyi na: til dag las til mar dañ, 'o ma dag las mar bžin du — mya ñan las 'das pa yoñs su tshol bar bgyid pa de dag ni mu stegs can lhag pa'i ña rgyal can lags par bdag smra'o. bcom ldan 'das, rnal 'byor spyod pa pa dag*²⁰⁸ *yañ dag par žugs pa ni chos 'ga' yañ ſkye ba 'am, 'gag par mi bgyid ciñ chos 'ga' yañ thob par mi 'tshal, mñon par rtogs par mi 'tshal lo*»²⁰⁹ *žes bya ba la sogs pa dañ, de*

¹⁹⁸ *dpyad pa* DAE : *spyad pa* P

¹⁹⁹ For the title see Avalokitavrata: «*dBu ma'i rtsa ba tshig le'ur byas pa dbu ma'i sñiñ po'i 'grel pa rtog ge 'bar ba*» *žes bya ba'i nañ nas* «*rNal 'byor spyod pa pa de kho na la 'jug pa*» *žes bya ba'i skabs nas ston par 'gyur ro.* — Cf. Gokhale in *IJJ*, II (1958), p. 165.

²⁰⁰ *rtogs pa'i* AE : *rtog pa'i* PD

²⁰¹ *bsgrub pa* A : *sgrub pa* PDE

²⁰² *bstan par* P : *bstan pa* DAE

²⁰³ *mkhas* P : *mkha'* DAE

²⁰⁴ *mdud pa bor* PDE : *sdud pa por* A

²⁰⁵ *bkrol ba* DE : *bgrol ba* PA

²⁰⁶ Quoted from Bhavya by Candrakīrti, *Prasannapadā*, p. 540 (ed. La Vallée Poussin):

anirvāṇaṃ hi nirvāṇaṃ lokanāthena deśitam |

ākāśena kṛto granthir ākāśenaiva mocitaḥ ||

²⁰⁷ *'da' ba* PAE : *'das pa* D

²⁰⁸ *spyod pa pa dag* A: *spyod pa* PD : *spyod pa pa* E

²⁰⁹ From *Brahmaparipṛcchāsūtra* quoted *Prasannapadā*, p. 540:

...*na teṣāṃ bhagavan buddhotpādo ye kasya cid dharmasyotpādaṃ vā nirodhaṃ vecchanti, na teṣāṃ*

bžin du:- «rab 'byor, mya ñan las 'das pa yañ sgyu ma lta bu dañ, rmi lam lta bu'o»²¹⁰
žes rgya cher gsuñs pa dañ, de bžin du:- «śā ri'i bu,²¹¹ gañ dag mya ñan las 'das pa dños
 po las yoñs su tshol²¹² bar byed pa de dag ni 'khrug loñ²¹³ ba yin te, ña yañ de dag gi
 ston pa ma yin la, de dag kyañ ña'i ñan thos ma yin no»²¹⁴ *žes bya ba lā sogs pa dañ, de*
bžin du:-

«blo yis rnam par gžig²¹⁵ na ni ||
 brtags²¹⁶ pa med ciñ gžan dbañ med ||
 grub pa'i dños po yod min na ||
 ji ltar blo yis²¹⁷ rnam par brtags ||»²¹⁸

«dños ñid med ciñ rnam rig med ||
 kun gži yod pa ma yin te ||
 byis pa ñan rtog ro 'dra bas ||
 de dag rnam par brtags par 'gyur ||»²¹⁹

žes bya ba la sogs pa gsuñs pa de dag 'grub pa yin no.

*bhagavan samsārasamatikramo ye nirvāṇaṃ bhāvataḥ paryeṣante. tat kasya hetoḥ? nirvāṇaṃ iti bhagavan
 yaḥ praśamaḥ sarvanimittānāṃ uparatih sarveñjitānām. tad ime bhagavan mohapuruṣā ye svākhyāte
 dharmavinaye pravrajya tīrthikadr̥ṣṭau nipatitā nirvāṇaṃ bhāvataḥ paryeṣante — tadyathā tilebhyas
 tailaṃ kṣīrāt sarpiḥ — atyantaparinirvṛtesu bhagavan sarvadharmeṣu ye nirvāṇaṃ mārganti tān aham
 ābhīmānikān tīrthikān iti vadāmi. na bhagavan yogācāraḥ samyak pratipannaḥ kasya cid dharmasyot-
 pādamaṃ vā nirodhaṃ vā karoti, nāpi kasya cid dharmasya prāptim icchati nābhisamayam iti vistarāḥ...*

²¹⁰ *Aṣṭasāhasrikāprajñāpāramitā* quoted in *Prasannapadā*, p. 450: ...nirvāṇaṃ apy (ārya-)Subhūte
 māyopamaṃ svapnopamaṃ...

²¹¹ śā ri'i bu PAE : śa ra dva ti'i bu D

²¹² tshol DE : tshal PA

²¹³ loñ PD : gloñ AE

²¹⁴ From the *Bodhipiṭaka* (byañ chub kyi sde snod) according to Avalokitavrata. It is identical with
 the *Bodhisattvapitaka*, which is often quoted.

²¹⁵ gžig : žig P : gžags DAE

²¹⁶ brtags AE : brtag PD

²¹⁷ blo yis PD : blos ni AE

²¹⁸ *Laṅkāvatārasūtra*, II, 198 ~ X, 374 (ed. Nanjio, q.v. for variants):
buddhyā vivecyamānaṃ tu na tantraṃ nāpi kalpitam |

niṣpanno nāsti vai bhāvaḥ kathaṃ buddhyā vikalpyate ||

²¹⁹ *Laṅkāvatārasūtra*, III, 48 ~ X, 91 (ed. Nanjio, q.v. for variants):
na svabhāvo na vijñaptir na vastu na ca ālayaḥ |
bālair vikalpitā hy ete śavabhūtaiḥ kutārkikaiḥ ||