ENCORE: THE PRATİTYASAMUTPĀDAHṚḌDAYA—
KĀRIKĀ OF NĀGĀRJUNA

By

V. V. GOKHALE

in collaboration with M. G. DHADPHALE

Introduction:

The Buddhist theory of causality envisages all creation (samutpāda) as taking place by the Cause (hetu) approaching (pratītya) what is called the Result (phala). There is no doubt a certain link-up (pratisaṇḍhi) between the Cause and the Effect; and yet there is a lack of actual migration (asamkrama) from the Cause to the Effect. This, in brief, is said to be the essence of the first Enlightenment (bodhi), attained by the Buddha sitting under the Pipul tree at Bodhgaya about 2500 years ago. In his vision the Buddha saw the Wheel of Life (bhava-cakra) as consisting of the well-known twelve sectors (dvādasāṅga), each one linked up with and conditioned by the other to form the Past (atīta), the Present (pratyutpanna) and the Future (anāgata). They are: (1) Avidyā (Ignorance), (2) Samskaras (Habit-formations), (3) Vijñāna (Consciousness), (4) Nāma-rūpa (Name and Form), (5) Sadāyatanā (Six Senses) (6) Sparśa (Sensation, Contact), (7) Vedānā (Feeling), (8) Trṣṇā (Desire), (9) Upādāna (Grasping), (10) Bhava (Course of life), (11) Jāti (Birth), and, (12) Jarā-maraṇa (Maturity and Death).

This theory was variously interpreted by later philosophers, among whom the great Nāgārjuna (who lived about 500 years after the Buddha) made it the basic principle of a relativistic philosophy, expounded by him in his Madhyamaka-śāstra. Sāntarakṣita, another great writer, who followed him, another 500 years later and wrote the Tattvasamgraha, had still the same veneration for this theory of Causality, although he gave it a dynamic orientation by describing it as a ‘moving Reality’ (calam). Still others tried to bring out its epistemological or psychological import in the long
history of Buddhist philosophy. What concerns us here, however, is the Nāgārjunian interpretation of the Buddhist chain of Causation, which he epitomised within the framework of only five Sanskrit stanzas in the Ārya-metre, which he called the "Heart of the Causality-theory" (Pratītyasamutpāda-hṛdaya).

In my doctoral-dissertation, submitted in Bonn, two Chinese versions of a post-Nāgārjunian Sanskrit text, called the Pratītyasamutpāda-śāstra, consisting of 30 stanzas and attributed to one Ullaṅgha (whose name appears to be suspect under its Chinese garb) were translated into German and critically investigated on the basis of some Sanskrit, Pāli and Sino-Tibetan sources. It was found therein, that all the five stanzas of the above-mentioned text of Nāgārjuna were incorporated in it and commented upon, although the Sanskrit original of only one and a half-stanza (out of five) was actually discovered to have been quoted in the existing Sanskrit works. The remaining three and half Stanzas were taken to have been, lost for good.

By a lucky coincidence, however, about twenty years later, the full Sanskrit text of these five stanzas together with a fragment of its commentary (attributed to an unknown Šuddhamati in Chinese and to Nāgārjuna himself in Tibetan) on the first two stanzas only, was located in one of the Sanskrit mss. carefully preserved at the Kundeling monastery in Lhasa (Tibet), which I was kindly allowed to copy out by the Lama of the monastery: Hu-tuk-tu Taktsa—Rimpochhe Lobzang Jigme Gyaltsen. The Sanskrit stanzas followed by the commentary—fragment was published by me in the Kirfel Jubilee volume in 1955.

(1) See: L. de la Vallée Poussin: Théorie des douze Cauṣes (Gand, 1913)—also includes the Tibetan version of the present 0Kārikā by Nāgārjuna.

(2) "Das Pratityasamutpadaśāstra des Ullaṅgha, kritisch behandelt und aus dem chinesischen ins Deutsche übersetzt." (Bonn 1930).

Last month my friend and colleague: Dr. M. G. Dhadphale of the Fergusson College brought to my notice 19 photographs of Sanskrit-mss. written, not very elegantly, in the 'Gilgit' script (of about 600 A.D.), which he had obtained from the National Archives of the Govt. of India, (New Delhi), where, as reported by Dr. P. V. Bapat, they were removed for safe custody from the Srinagara Museum of Kashmir in 1947. In these photographs he expected to find the Sanskrit text of the Prasenajit-gāthā, of which Chinese and Tibetan versions are available, and which formed a part of his research studies; but on a close examination of them, based on the marginal numbering of the folios, it was found, that these 19 photographs contained not less than four different fragments of Sanskrit texts, among which the Prasenajit-gāthās sought for, occupied barely one folio (i.e. 2 photos), showing the ending colophon of the text as: Prasenajit-gāthāh samāptāh. On the other hand, on three of the remaining folios (i.e. 6 photos), we met quite unexpectedly with our Pratītyasamutpāda-hṛdaya text, followed by a longer fragment of the same commentary as the above (with a few unimportant variants) which, however, still remains incomplete! (An attempt has been made below to reconstruct the missing part.) The photographs have been reproduced herewith, showing the lines (1 to 5) and folio numbers (1a to 3b). For the decipherment of the script, the specimens provided by Dr. P. V. Bapat in his article on the subject were, among others, helpful.


Poona, 30-1-78.
Text of *Pratītyasamutpādaśārikā* by Nāgārjuna and its Commentary:

1. Round brackets: ( ) show our additions to the ms. (as seen in the photograph) or uncertain readings, partly based on the Lhasa-fragment (see note 3 to Introd.)

2. Modern orthography has been adopted for readings like: dharmma, karmma, for anusvāras and for interpunctuation in general.

(fol. 1a) O द्रातः वेण(5)क्षणकषा मूलीनोहिष्टा प्रतीत्यसंभूता: ।
ते कलेक्षकर्मदुःखसु संग्रंहतात्तुष्टृषु यथावतः ॥ (१)

आधारस्तियमवम: स्मृत(६): कलेश: कर्मविरित्य(वधानी च) ।
(७) शादा: सप्तचउध्यः, तृत्यंश्र्ट्टा द्रातः तु धर्मः ॥ (२)

तृत्यो भवति द्रातन्यान्वात्यत्मवन्ति सप्त, सप्तस्तः ।
सप्त उद्भवन्ति भूयो भगमु तदेव तु भवचक्षः ॥ (३)

(हेतु:) फलचं श(वं जग) ।बध्यो नास्ति कशिचविह सतः ।
शृवन्च्यो एत शून्या धमः: प्रभवन्ति धर्ममः: ॥ (४)

स्वाभावियोद्वयन्त्रादारण्योपकारकाकात्वेषा( बे? (sic) for हेा: जा:);
स्वाभयतपिठिसिरसंकरम(शच)॥ बिद्र्विचिद्धधपायी ॥ (५)

नापतेवयतःचिं च(तु:) प्रकृत्वाय न कि च चन ।
इस्तियं भूततो भूतं भूतदर्शीं विमुच्यते ॥ O ॥ (६)

(हेतु:) कशिचच्छवण्यप्रक्षुण्डगामो( हानो:) हावधारणशक्तिसंप म: शिष्यः
कंतिन्याद्यूनात्मनोपल्यस्यान्यप्राप्त: विनेषोपपमेपमुकुत्वनः—“भगवं
हावातः वेण(5)क्षणकषा (शेषा) ॥ (fol. 1b) मूलीनोहिष्टा: प्रतीत्यसंभूता: ।
कच्छन्यां संग्रहो बैचित्रयः इत्युपेक्षाृषुधिशासिः ”। तस्य(५)चायं धर्मस्तवः
स्थपास्मावे(लयोवच) ।—“वत्स, ते कलेक्षकर्मदुःखसु (पु संग्राही) र्तास्तु-३
यथावतः-तन हौ च दशा च द्रातः (शा:), अहस्येव विशेषा अहस्याविशेषा:, रथाय- ।
वाडग्यावं विशेष्यक्षिता, मौनामुमिनिनादा मूल(५), तेन मु(निनो) ॥—
हिष्टार्फ़क्षाति: प्रकाशिता इति पद्याः। ते च न प्राचूप्रग्रंथितवर्कालस्वभावाः-पुष्पसुता:। कि तार्क प्रतीतसंभूता: (तेसु) ह्रद (शाब्द) विशेषा: कलेशीर्कर्मसु दुःखशृः। चात्मोक्य प्रतीतवृ दण्डवययेन यथायतृ तुष्णु संपहृ गच्छिति। यथावदिति कस्मिनेनेवर्यर्घः। आह, (केव पुनः) (ते कलेश्या:) तु नामभिन्न, कि दुःखशृ यथायतृ वचनाविदी विशेषा: प्रत्ययास्तमृतुः। संपहृ गच्छित्त। उच्छ्यते आयामगतविज्ञायस्यः। बङ्गीः (येषां ध्रादाशा-)

(fol. 2a), मङ्गलविशेषपाणामाया अविचा, अस्तमी तृणम, नवभुपादानमिभे नय: कलेश्या प्रत्यनुमालया तस्य। कि च, कर्मो इत्वार्दशामी च, संस्कारात्मकर्मावृत्तिः (.), भवः, द(शम.), द(मौ, विशेषी कर्मसंगृहीती वेदित्वार्थी। श्रीया: सत्य च दुःखः, एवं केलेशकर्मसंगृहीतानां ये श्रीया: विशेषा: सत्य च। ते दुःखसंगृहीता: प्रत्यनुमालया: तथा-। विज्ञान, नामभिन्न, पादयतन, स्पर्शो वेदना, जातिः, जे रामविभासः। च-शरदसमुख्ये इत्यवर्तः (.), पूः प्रागितायोगः(५)। पूः प्रागितायोगेन चात्मविभासतादितिः। खाया (५) (या) (सूत्र) मुच्चितानोति। एवंते केलेशकर्मः।

(खेपु), विज्ञान: तु महामहा द्रादाशा तु धमः। (नाठौ, धिनक्षारायणक्षुद्धश्वदः एतात् (ततः)। इड़े पुर्वनिविष्टः, नात्परः। ततिः। आह-।) परिंगः (ततः)। तेनादिर्वा (तृणमा) एवं केलेशकर्मः। खायाः कुः। किसंकारिकयृतः। उच्छ्यते-तृणम्। बहति इद्धः। (मृदुः)। कलेशकर्मः।

(fol. 2b)। विलित सत्यः तावेच हुःक्याः पुर्वनिविष्टः। सप्ततिः स्त्रयु उद्भवति भूयः। कलेश्या तेवः। तेभयः कर्मद्वयाचलितु। भूयो भागमत तदेवतु तु भवभवः, तत्त भवा:। (का), महापर्यायाखः। रत्ने चाचनन्(स्य)। श्यातान्त्रिकमूत्तरस्ते भावं पुष्पामनलोकः। परिस्मिति, तु-शाब्दो(५)। नियमजापनार्थः, यथा चकमानु-पुर्ब्बाय प्रभातिन न तथा नैपूण्यभ्रमेऽः। कि तार्क नियो ना(स्तीति), जानपदित नैशेषः (आह-।)। इवानी सर्वदेहेस्वरः, तथा:। कर्मकमः। कि वेत(५)। श्या कार्याचलितु, उच्छ्यते-हेतुः। तताव्रस्त स्त्रयु जगद्यो नातिविश्विद्भुव स्वयं अव्यक्तो.

(च्यक्तोत्वा, तत्वः), चेवं परिवामते, नात्परामातृकमतः। श्या इत्यवर्तः नैशेषः। इवानी सर्वेदेहेस्वरः, तथा:। कर्मकमः। कि वेत(५)। श्या कार्याचलितु, उच्छ्यते-हेतुः। तताव्रस्त स्त्रयु जगद्यो नातिविश्विद्भुव स्वयं अव्यक्तो (श्यात्वा, तत्वः), चेवं परिवामते, नात्परामातृकमतः। श्या इत्यवर्तः नैशेषः। इवानी सर्वेदेहेस्वरः, तथा:। कर्मकमः। कि वेत(५)। श्या कार्याचलितु, उच्छ्यते-हेतुः। तताव्रस्त स्त्रयु जगद्यो नातिविश्विद्भुव स्वयं अव्यक्तो।
कक्षी-बीजा(५)मन्त्र: निदर्शनें ११ हुणा: (५c शम)। स्वभावात्मा नो च न विचारते, 
व्यवहार-परलोक च सिद्धत इति। यथा च न मृदोभयं शिव(श्रे) संस्कारति, 
नो तुता(४) वा मृदोभयंस्य, न शिष्यस्यायतं एव भव(५)हेतुकदोष 
प्रसंगत। एवं मारणालिकं चित्तं न परलोकं गंचितं, वाश्वदोषस्यप्रसंगतं। (५) 
परस्त्र(५) नयं एव भवत्वेद्यहेतुकदोषस्यप्रसंगतं। यथा च मृदोभयंनेत्रिमतं 
शिष्यस्यायतं भवति, न तदेव तत्त्व नान्यदेव तदति भक्ष्यमभिधा, एवं मा 
(fol. 3b), हणालिकं चित्तं प्रतिद्वयोपत्यंशिष्य चित्तं भवति, न तदेव 
तन्नायदेव तदति शक्यमभिः(धा)सु, यथा दीपदीपम्(स्), मुद्रया(•) 
प्रतिमुद्रा, (स्त्र)विवाद(शर्ति); प्रतितिबंधक, श(झात्)। ॥ प्रतिद्वयः; आदिव- 
मणिगमयं(सृया) वहनि, बीजाकुरि, यथा मा(व) फलविषणेनिम 
तिको(५) न्यस्त मुखद्रवो भवति, न स एव स, नान्य(३) एव स इतिः सुकराः प्रवेशः। 
एवं स्तन्धप्रतितिसंवरसक्मशच विण्डुभिस्वधार्शी, (पन्च) सन्धा रूपवेदनालि- 
संस्कारविवाहान्वंका, तेन-प्रतिसंधिः, रिषेष् च निन्ध्यंत तदेवेदुकाशचामुन्त्र भवति, 
न चास्मालोकातरं लोक अनुभावो(५) पि भावं संक्रमण, एव ताव (संसार) - 
क्षमः, च-शन्त्रो निव्र(लिग) तो वि (प) येन्येणानुगत(वो), यस्माति 
(स्वयम्) दुःखा(५) नामतो भावान्तैवव्यवहरणामस्य वस्तुसंस्मोहो न भवति, 
अर्नंग्या(स) रज्यःकप्ये ॥ ॥ ॥

Notes on Sanskrit Text

1. Ms. त for तिः or तः (as in fol. 2 b, 1-4. below)
2. Ms. ष for visarga (:') frequently.
3. Ms. सङ्गम for सङ्ग.
4. Ms. भगवं for भगवन्.
5. Ms. स्ते.
6. Ms. सङ्ग.
7. Ms. पूँ for प्र.
8. Ms. घ्रम्येने.
9. The Lhasa-fragment of this commentary breaks off here. The following part is based purely on our present photographs of the text, which remains still incomplete (see note 13 below).
10. Ms. शून्यो
11. Ms. गृह्यम् for ग्रह्.
12. Ms. वय.
13. The last nearly seven letters are illegible. Including these, the remaining portion of the Commentary is tentatively restored on the basis mainly of its Tibetan versions, which attribute it to Nagarjuna himself instead of Suddhamati of the Chinese version. This portion is shown with a wavy line and in round brackets.
14. This verse appears as no. 6 in the kārikā-text, with which the present ms. begins. The reading: प्रकृत्त्वम् however, appears as: bshag-par-byas-ba, in Tib., which seems to stand for: निन्दवत्वम्. It is both preferable and found in the ms. of शुक्लविवर्धण according to LVP's work cited above in note 1 of the Introduction.
15. The addition of this word: (आर्य=phags-pa) is found only in the Tanjur version (Berlin), catalogued by H. Beckh (1914).
16. उपदेश्यो sic, उपदेश्य?—also below in fol. 3a, l. 2.