

THE SECOND CHAPTER OF BHAVYA'S
*MADHYAMAKAHRDAYA**
(Taking the Vow of an Ascetic)

by
V. V. GOKHALE
Poona

It has not yet been generally recognised that the Mādhyamikas, who are known to have a strong predilection for the logic of language and a metaphysics of transcendence, and who accept the traditional analysis of mind and matter current among the Vaibhāṣikas, also possess a strong streak of asceticism and a passion for ethics oriented towards the Bodhi-sattva idealism. Coming later in the Mādhyamika tradition Śāntideva's *Bodhicaryāvatāra* is an outstanding example of this ethical trend, but even before him Ācārya Bhāvaviveka (or Bhavya, as we call him here), the commentator of Nāgārjuna's *Madhyamaka* and presumably a younger rival of Buddhapālita, is seen to give prominence to this aspect of the Mādhyamika view of life by placing in the forefront of his independent treatise, called the *Madhyamakahrdaya* (The Heart of the Madhyamaka Philosophy) two chapters, called: I. *Bodhicittāparityāga* (Not surrendering the Spirit of the Highest Wisdom) and II. *Munivratasamāśraya* (Taking the Vow of an Ascetic) before explaining at length his own special method of forming syllogisms that should lead to the conviction regarding the absolute Reality in Chapter III, called *Tattvajñānaiṣaṇā* (Quest for Truth).

In an article on "The Vedānta-Philosophy described by Bhavya in his *Madhyamakahrdaya*" published in the *Indo-Iranian Journal*, Vol. II (1958), Nr. 3, pp. 165-190 (jointly with Prof. Hajime Nakamura, Tokyo). I have already briefly indicated in footnote 1 the general nature of this work of Bhavya as gathered from a hasty handcopy of a palm-leaf manuscript made by Pandit Rāhula Sāṃkṛtyāyana at the Zha.lu monastery in Tibet. There it will be seen, that after the third chapter, viz., *Tattvajñānaiṣaṇā*, Bhavya is occupied with a critical examination of non-Mādhyamika schools, firstly among the Buddhists themselves, viz.,

* Paper read at the 28th International Congress of Orientalists, Canberra, on 7.1.1971, slightly enlarged and revised on 3.2.1971.

the Śrāvakayānist and the Yogācāras in Chapters IV and V respectively, and then among the non-Buddhists, viz., the Sāṃkhyas, the Vaiśeṣikas, the Vedāntins and the Mimāṃsakas from Chapters VI to IX — all these Chapters forming as it were an amplification of the principles and methods expounded by him at great length in his crucial chapter III, *Tattvajñānaiṣaṇā*. The tail-end consists of two smaller chapters, viz., X. *Sarvajñatāsiddhinirdeśa* (which is preserved barely in one and a half verse of the Sanskrit original and the Tibetan version of which refers to the Jaina doctrine of *Sarvajñatā* (omniscience) and XI. *Stutīlakṣaṇanirdeśa*, which completes this work of Bhavya, so to say his *magnum opus*.

That the first three chapters formed the nucleus of his enlarged and complete treatise as we have it before us, is borne out by the following two verses from Chapter I, *Bodhicittāparityāga*, which follow immediately after the preliminary salutation to the Buddha in the first three verses. They run thus:

- I.4 *mahābodhau kṛtadhiyām parārthodayadīkṣayā /*
 tattvāmṛtāvadhārāya śaktiṭaḥ kiṃcid ucyate //
 .5 *Bodhicittāparityāgo Munivratasamāśrayaḥ /*
 Tattvajñānaiṣaṇā ceti caryā sarvārthasiddhaye //

With whatever ability I possess, I venture here to say a few words to guide the comprehension (of those who hold different views) in respect of that nectarlike Truth (*tattvāmṛta*) — that Truth, which was revealed by those, who, having taken a vow to work for ever for the benefit of others, dedicated all their powers of understanding to the attainment of the Great Wisdom. Non-surrender of the Spirit of the Highest Wisdom, Taking the Vow of an Ascetic, and a Quest for Truth — this threefold course of conduct (*caryā*) leads to the fulfilment of the entire purpose of life (*sarvārthasiddhi*).

Hereafter follows an exposition of the Bodhicitta, which forms the subject-matter of the First Chapter, *Bodhicittāparityāga*. Thus, these two stanzas quote the titles of the first three Chapters, describing the ethical ideals and the logical method prescribed by Bhavya in his *Madhyamakahrdaya* (containing nearly a thousand verses, of which well over one third part is occupied by the Third Chapter alone).

I have already pointed out (in note 1, referred to above, to my said article in the *IJJ*, II), that an independent treatise called *Tattvajñānāmṛtāvātāra* could be regarded as the earlier nucleus of the enlarged *Madhyamakahrdaya* and that it contained only the three chapters, which have been mentioned in the above two stanzas by their titles. The de-

scription of the Absolute Reality as *tattva* (among Buddhist philosophers) seems to have come in vogue at least since the days of Harivarman's *Tattvasiddhi* – The restoration of this title as: *Satyasiddhi* by Ui and other scholars is hardly justified by its Chinese translation (成實) – and it continued to be favoured by positivistic thinkers like Śantarakṣita in his *Tattvasaṃgraha*. Bhavya himself likes to call it the *tattvajñānāmṛta* (the Nectar of Truth) in various contexts in his present treatise, e.g., III.136 ... *nirātmatām / vidvān vibhāvya bhāvānaṃ tattvajñānāmṛtam pibet* //; V. 1 *Anye pracakṣate dhīrāḥ svanītāv abhimāninaḥ / tattvāmṛtāvatāro hi Yogācāraḥ sudeśitaḥ* //; VIII.94 (= Tib. 86) *Buddhānāṃ lokabandhūnāṃ tattvāmṛtam idam param* //. Moreover, the title *Tattvajñānāmṛtāvatāra* is authenticated in the colophon to Chapter III, so that there should be no doubt, that we have this small tractate of three chapters here incorporated within the larger treatise called *Madhyamakahrdaya*.

Out of the three Chapters of this *Tattvajñānāmṛtāvatāra*, the first two, as mentioned at the outset, deal with the ethical idealism of the Mādhyamikas while the third deals with the Madhyamaka philosophy, set forth in the style of the Svātantrika logic, which appears to represent Bhavya's own contribution to Indian philosophy. In the present article, I propose to edit the Sanskrit text of the Second chapter. It contains only twelve stanzas and is (after Tib. versions) the smallest among all the chapters of the *Madhyamakahrdaya* except the very last one, which contains only three stanzas. While in the first chapter Bhavya speaks about the "Non-relinquishment of the Bodhicitta", in the Second chapter he speaks in positive terms about the acceptance of the vow of an ascetic. The text, corrected in the light of the Tibetan versions, runs as follows:

Chapter II: *Munivratasamāśraya* (Taking the Vow of an Ascetic)

- 1 *Evaṃ dṛḍhamahābodhisamādāno jagad-dhite /
Pratirūpām pratipadam pratipanno virājate //*

Having thus gone in for a resolute acceptance of the (vow, in respect of the) Great Wisdom for the sake of the good of the world, and having established himself in the Right Path (*pratirūpā pratipad*), he is covered with glory.

- 2 *Sa maitryā¹ 'pratighātinyā kāruṇyena prasarpinā /
Saddharmādhigamātr̥pto dharmadāne vimatsarah //*

¹ The *avagraha* is missing in the Mc (= manuscript copy).

With his love (*maitrī*), which (always protects and) never injures, and the development in him of a feeling of compassion (*kāruṇya*), he is insatiable in his greed for knowledge of the Good Law, and is far from sparing in his religious gifts.

- 3 *Rjunā² 'hatamānena manasā tattvadarśinā /*
Paradoṣekṣaṇāndhena svadoṣāpattibhīruṇā //

With a mind, straightforward and devoid of self-conceit, he visualises the Absolute Truth, and while turning a blind eye towards the sins of others, he is anxious about himself falling into (the merest) error.

- 4 *Vivādalokasaṃsargalokāyataparāṇmukhaḥ /*
Nirguṇe 'pi guṇādhānapratatya³sraṃsitādarah //

He turns his back on (all kinds of) disputations, on social contagion and on (those confounding sophists belonging to) the Lokāyata cult, and his faith in the continuous generation (*pratati*) of virtue in (the minds of) even those who are devoid of all virtue, is unswerving (*asraṃsita*).

- 5 *Kṛpodbhūtena dānena sarvajñatvagatasprhaḥ⁴ /*
Sarvasya janakāyasya sarvaduḥkhopāśāntaye //

While practising charity out of (sheer) commiseration (*kṛpā*), he creates in himself a desire for omniscience (only) for the sake of pacifying all the miseries of the entire world of living beings.

- 6 *Śīlāmalajalasnāyī kṣamāsitapavitrakaḥ /*
Vīryabaddhajaṭābhāro dhyāna⁵jñānaparāyaṇaḥ //

He takes his (holy) bath as it were in the pure waters of Morality (*śīla*); Patience (*kṣamā*) is as it were the white ring of hemp on his finger (*pavitraka*); he has tied up his matted hair, representing as it were his Fortitude (*vīrya*); and he has dedicated himself to contemplation (*dhyāna*) and knowledge.

- 7 *Samunmīṣitadhīnetraḥ śāstra⁶lokajñātāpaṭuḥ /*
Hīra⁷patrāpyavasanaḥ sauratya⁸tanubandhanaḥ //

² Mc. reads *ajñānā-*, but Tib. *draṇ* = upright, honest, straightforward (explained in the Commentary (i.e. *Tarkajvālā*) as 'without deceit').

³ Mc. reads *-pratātā-*, which may be corrected as above following the Tib. ...*yon. tan.gyi/ rgyun.rnams.skye.bar.rtag.tu.gus/*.

⁴ The *Tarkajvālā* here discusses the question: "If charity is given with a desire for omniscience, how could the donor be disinterested (*phalāśārahitāḥ*)?"

⁵ Mc. shows a gap^o of three syllables as: —*na*, which is filled in as above after Tibetan readings.

⁶ The *Tarkajvālā* explains the word *śāstra* in the same way as the famous stanza: *Yac chāsti vaḥ kleśaripūn aśeṣān, santrāyate durgatito bhavāc ca/* etc. variously attributed to Ārya Deva or Vasubandhu (see my article on the "*Pañcaskandhaka* by Vasubandhu and its commentary by Sthiramati", *ABORI*, Vol. XVIII, pt. iii (1937), p. 283, note 1).

⁷ Mc. reads *hrīpatrāpya-*. (Cf. *Śikṣāsamuccaya* (Bendall), p. XVII, quoting Whitney, 1250f., cf. *Pāṇ.* VI. iii. 25 for the retention of the nominative form in the compound word).

⁸ For *sauratya* see *Mhvy.* 1115, 6597 (Sakaki); *Śikṣāsamuccaya*, p. 183 etc.

With his eye of intelligence wide opened and his skill in theoretical as well as practical matters, he puts on his garments of modesty and bashfulness as it were, and he wears a girdle as it were of dignified softness (*sauratya*) around his waist.

- 8 *Kṛpākṛṣṇājīnadharaḥ śraddhā⁹ 'malakamaṇḍaluḥ |*
Smṛtiguptendriyadvāro dhṛtivetṛāsanāsanah ||

Wearing the dark deerskin as (a symbol of) Commiseration (*kṛpā*) and having a spotlessly clean water-jug (*kamaṇḍalu*) in the form of Faith (*śraddhā*), and with the gates of his senses guarded as it were by constant awareness (*smṛti*), he has his seat on the reed-mat of Endurance (*dhṛti*).

- 9 *Mahāyāna¹⁰ mahāramyatapovanasamāśrayaḥ |*
Dhyānapṛītiphalāhāraḥ smṛtyupasthānagocaraḥ ||

He has his dwelling in the luxurious forest-hermitage of *Mahāyāna* (Superior Career), where he nourishes himself upon the fruits of happiness, born of Meditation; and the sphere of his actions is represented by the location of (the four kinds of) Mindfulness (*smṛtyupasthāna*).

- 10 *Gambhīrodārasūtrānta¹¹ svādhyāyatakilbiṣaḥ |*
Pratītyotpādasāvitriṇ¹² japan satyadvayāśrayām¹³ ||

He has destroyed all his sins by giving oral instruction (*svādhyāya*) in the Sūtrānta-texts, which are profound and extensive, while chanting to himself as it were the Hymn to the Sun (*Sāvitri*) in the form of the Chain of Causation (*Pratītyasamutpāda*), founded upon the twofold aspect of Truth.

- 11 *Varṇāḍhyaiḥ pratipat¹⁴ puṣpaiḥ sarvadiggandhavāhibhiḥ |*
Upāśīnas tv aharahaḥ samyaksaṃbuddhabhāskaram¹⁵ ||

And day after day he worships the Sun, who is the Perfectly Enlightened One (*Samyaksaṃbuddha*), with flowers in the form of his achievements (*pratipat-puṣpa*), which waft their fragrance in all directions and are rich with (colorful) praise (*varṇa*).

- 12 *Hutākuśalasaṃkalpaḥ pratisaṃkhyānapāvake |*
Munivratam cared evam anuttarapadāptaye ||
Munivratasamāśrayaparicchedaḥ dvitīyaḥ ||

Having sacrificed all undesirable notions in the fire of reflexion (*pratisaṃkhyāna*), one has to live an ascetic life of this type for reaching the summit, where there is nothing beyond.

End of Chapter Two on Taking the Vow of an Ascetic.

⁹ Mc. reads *śuddha*-, but Tibetan has *dad.pa*/.

¹⁰ Mc. reads *naṣṭāṅga*- for *Mahāyāna*-.

¹¹ *Tarkajyālā* explains *Sūtrānta* as texts like the *Prajñāpāramitā*.

¹² *Tarkajyālā*: *Sāvitri*, because the Buddha is called the Sun (*Savitā*). (See verse 11 below: *sambuddhabhāskaraḥ*; also *Suttanipāta* 457, 568; *Vinaya* I, 246 etc.).

¹³ Mc. reads *-śrayat*/.

¹⁴ *Pratipat* = Tibetan *bsgrub.pa*; Cf. LVP's *L'Abhidharmakośa*, VII, p. 32 n. etc.

¹⁵ Mc. reads *-bhāskaraḥ* //.

In the above, Bhavya has before him the picture of a fully accoutred *Muni* of the Brahmanical tradition — a Muni with his matted hair, deerskin, water-jug, girdle, reed-mat, sacrificial fire, Sun-worship and whatnot, all of which he seems to admire, if not envy. In poetical flourishes these are described as symbolic of the Mahāyānic virtues, like those of the Pāramitās (*śīla, kṣamā, vīrya, dhyāna*), learning and practical wisdom combined with modesty, mercifulness, faith, alertness, endurance and divine service. The central conception of his Mādhyamika philosophy is represented by the Pratītyasamutpāda formula of 'Dependent Origination' in both its aspects, viz., that of *saṃvṛti* (phenomenal reality) and *paramārtha* (the Absolute Reality) — a formula, regarded by him as a substitute for the Sāvitrī (or Gāyatrī) mantra of the Brahmanic Muni. Actually, the Buddhist Muni described here is not exactly an ascetic, but a sage or holy man in a wider sense, reminding us of the simple and straightforward description of him in the Munisutta of the Pali *Suttanipāta* 12, or even that of the Sthitaprajña-yogin of the *Bhagavadgītā* II.

It is perhaps not altogether without reason that the Prāsaṅgika Mādhyamikas, whose traditions coming through Buddhapālita and Candrakīrti still dominate the ruling Tibetan Buddhism today, regard the Svātantrika Bhavya as a sort of misfit. His general acceptance of the principles of formal logic, as established by the founders of Nyāya, his sympathies with the Jaina view of omniscience and to a certain extent with the monistic illusionism of the early Vedāntins, and his systematic study of the contemporary philosophical doctrines, Buddhist and non-Buddhist, with a view to examine them critically and refute them from the point of view of the Nāgārjunian Madhyamaka as understood by him mark him out as a learned man of compromise as well as a keen and resourceful proselytiser.

Bhavya's real contribution to Buddhist philosophy, however, is his initiation of the Svātantrika method, which he has illustrated at length in the third chapter of his *Madhyamakahr̥daya*, viz., *Tattvajñānaīṣaṇā*, as noted above, and which came to be appreciated by later Buddhist philosophers, like Śāntarakṣita. Special attention has already been drawn to this third chapter in Sanskrit by Prof. Shotaro Iida (Vancouver), who in his Dissertation, submitted to the Wisconsin University (U.S.A.) on "An Introduction to the Svātantrika Mādhyamika" (1968) has utilized a part of it for drawing his own conclusions.