TARKARAHASYA AND VĀDARAHASYA

By Gudrun Bühnemann, Poona

Recently ACHARYA PARAMANANDAN SHASTRI has edited the Tarkarahasya¹, a compendium of Buddhist logic, with the help of one manuscript² photographed by Rāhula Sāṅkṛtyāyana in Tibet, which is now preserved in the archives of the Bihar Research Society, Patna.

This text is available in film-negatives and some parts of it (fol. 41a–52b, 58) are also in glass-negative form, along with the titles “Vādarahasya”³, six folios of an unidentified Nyāyaṭīkā⁴ and a collection of texts by Śaṅkaranandana⁵. The manuscript is written in Proto-Maithili, and is quite legible, although some folios are slightly damaged.

There are five chapters, the last one being incomplete:
(1) Svaparapramāṇaṃsaṃkhyānyāyaniṁrṇaya p.1–32
(2) Svaparapratyakṣalaksanaṅanyāyaniṁrṇaya p.33–44
(3) Pratyakṣaprabhedasvaparanyāyaniṁrṇaya p.45–63
(4) Viśāyādīnyāyaniṁrṇaya p.64–74
(5) Incomplete p.75–111

As the colophon is missing, the author of the Tarkarahasya is not known to us. SHASTRI, judging by the many quotations from Śāntarakṣita’s Tattvasaṃgraha, infers that its author is Śāntarakṣita’s disciple Kamalaśīla (740–795, A.D.)⁶. An examination of these quotations, however, reveals that almost all of them are taken from non-Buddhist sources being quoted in pūrvapakṣa-parts of the Tattvasaṃgraha.
 Furthermore later authors like Dharmottara (c. 750–810 A.D.)⁷ and

³ Cf. JBORS 23/1 (1937) 56, No. 37.
⁴ Cf. JBORS 23/1 (1937) 55, No. 28.
⁶ Cf. Introduction p. XXXIII.
Prajñākaragupta (9th cent. A.D.)\* are quoted. Jñānasrimitra (first half of the 11th cent. A.D.), who is called Mitrapāda here, is quoted three times:
1) TR 47, 18–19: mitrapādāś ca paravyāpāravāraṇam ity āhūḥ / (This quotation is so far unidentified)
2) TR 60, 13–14: mitrapādaith svaprakāśam asāmānyam vijnānam iti sammatam / = J 358, 15 (Advaitabinduprakaraṇa)
3) TR 95, 16–18: mitramataṁ punaḥ anupala(bdha)ta svabhāvasyaśa- rā / svabhāvānupalabdhir evāparasyāparā bhavati kāraṇānupalabdhir vyāpakānupalabdhīś cetyādiprakāraḥ /
   a) note that the manuscript reads: evāparasya pratīṣṭhāsyaśaṇaṁ
cf. J 188, 12–14: api ca anupalabdhiḥ svasyāparasyāparā kāraṇāvyaśaṇaḥ svabhāvānupalabdhir eva / aparasya kāryasya vyāpyasya vāparā kāraṇānupalabdhīḥ vyāpakānupalabdhīs cetyādiprakāraḥ / (Anupalabdhirahasya)

For these reasons it is not possible to accept Kamalaśīla’s authorship for the Tarkarahasya.

In referring to the folios the editor did not make use of the numbers clearly written in the manuscript, but gave the number of the glass-plate and the number of the folio on it:
(P4B/2) = plate 4B, folio 2;
(P2A/3) = plate 2A, folio 6, when counted from the bottom to the top (the folios on this plate have been arranged that way), folio 4, when counted from the top to the bottom.

While neglecting the original folio numbers it escaped his notice that they indicate a lacuna in the manuscript at two places:
1) (P5B/3) = (39 b) is followed on p. 83, 8 by (P5A/4) = (41 a), thus one folio is missing. The editor did not succeed in constituting a continuous text here:
84, 7: tataḥ samānāṇām bhāvaḥ sāmānyam ity anyarūpavyāvṛttam eva (P5A/4) (vi?) paritādīśaṁkā na kāryā / Read: tataḥ samānāṇām bhāvaḥ sāmānyam ity anyarūpavyāvṛttam eva (lacuna) (41 a) paritān-vyaśadīśaṁkā na kāryā /

2) On p. 109, 12 fol. (P6B/7) = (52 b) is followed by (P6A/8) = (58 a), thus five folios are missing:
p. 109, 11: na sāmānyāks(śr?)ayāviruddham tatsambaddham (P6A/8) na /
   Read: na sāmānyāks(śr?)ayāviruddham tatsambaddham (lacuna) (58 a) na /

serves that Dharmottara is not referred to by Śāntaraksita and Kamalaśīla, and is therefore later than they.

\* Cf. Tarkarahasya 57, 8 = PV Bh 375 c etc.
At both places it is therefore impossible to have a continuous reading and sequence of arguments. Thus to avoid confusion, the present article includes an appendix, in which the original folio numbers are provided in correspondence to Shastri’s glass-plate numbers.

Certain refinements are necessary in the critical apparatus of Shastri’s edition. One example may be shown here: in the discussion of yogic perception (yogipratyakṣa) the proof of the omniscient being (sarvajña) is treated and the term sarvasarvajña / sarvasarvavedin / sarvasarvavid is mentioned p. 61, 6. 12; 63, 10 in contrast to svalpavid. In some texts of the later period of Buddhist logic, like Jñānaśrīmitra’s Yoginirṇayaparakaraṇa and Ratnakūrti’s Sarvajñaśiddhi, the term sarvasarvajña (‘the one who knows each and everything’) is used to contrast with upayuktasarvajña (‘one who knows what is appropriate for salvation’)*. Unaware of the use of this technical term, Shastri has emended the text here to read simply sarvajña.

The Vādarahasya is an unedited manuscript of the same collection, consisting of 42 folios (7–10 lines each) written in Proto-Bengali style. It is available in film-negatives, while the folios 23–42 are also preserved in glass-negative form. The plates have been labelled by the photographer as:
1A, 1B (= 8 fol., no. 1–8)
2A, 2B (= 8 fol., no. 9–16)
3A, 3B (= 8 fol., no. 17–24)
4A, 4B (= 10 fol., no. 25–34)
5A, 5B (= 9 fol., no. 34–42; no. 34 has been photographed twice).

Compared to the Tarkarahasya the Vādarahasya is difficult to decipher, as the photographs are out of focus in many places.
The two texts were found in different locations: the Tarkarahasya at Žalu monastery and the Vādarahasya at Ñor monastery in Tibet.

The Vādarahasya consists of three chapters, of which the third is incomplete.
The beginning of the text on fol. 1 b is out of focus; however, in the first line the name of the Nyāya teacher Udayana and in the second line the name of the Buddhist logician Jñānaśrīmitra can be deciphered. The end of the first chapter is found on fol. 13 b*, but not much can be read here because of the poor quality of the photograph:

---

... udayanirākarāṇe vādarahasye ... nyāyanirṇayaḥ // 206 (?) // prathamāḥ /

Then follows the second chapter, beginning with vyatireka ... It ends on fol. 26 b:\  (i)tī udayanirākarāṇe vādarahasye vyatirekārthātā- (*āditā?)*vādinyāyanirṇayo dvitiyāḥ // 406 //

The third chapter begins on fol. 27 a:\ ihāpohe pratyāhavyūho vyudas-
yate /

The end of this chapter and the colophon of this work are missing. Neither the original number of chapters in this text nor the identity of its author is clearly indicated within the body of the text. But from the legible passages we come to know that this prose text deals with jāti ('false objection to an argument') and nigrahasthāna ('wrong understanding or non-understanding of the object under discussion'), a topic, which Udayana has treated in his Nyāyaparīśiṣṭa, and refutes Udayana’s attacks.

It seems to be the only currently extant Buddhist reply to Udayana’s arguments.

Both texts were written in the final stages of Indian Buddhism: the Tarkarahasya quotes Jñānaśrīmitra, who we know was attacked by Udayana\(^{10}\), and who might have been Udayana’s elder contemporary, but it does not seem to quote Udayana.

The Vādarahasya criticizes Udayana and might therefore have been written later than the Tarkarahasya. Both works show a similarity in their titles and division into chapters which are called nyāyanirṇaya. A closer study of both works will show whether they can be attributed to the same author, or whether one of them has been written as an imitation of the other.

Unfortunately, the poor condition of the negatives of the Vādarahasya would make a good critical edition of the text impossible. One can only hope that more complete manuscripts or at least helpful fragments will be discovered elsewhere.

---

\(^{10}\) The date of Udayana is a matter of controversy. Cf. G.CHEMPARATHY, An Indian Rational Theology. Introduction to Udayana’s Nyāyakusumānjali. Vienna 1972, pp. 19–21. Note that Udayana criticizes Jñānaśrīmitra in his Ātmatattvaviveka and Nyāyavārtikatātparyapariśuddhi (cf. A. THAKUR, Jñānaśrīmitranibandhāvalī. Patna 1959, pp. 32ff.), and further note that he uses allusions to Ratnakūrti’s Citrādvaitaprakāśavāda (cf. D. C. BHATTA-
List of folio numbers in the manuscript of the Tarkarahasya as corresponding to the numbers given in Shastri’s edition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>p.</th>
<th>Folio</th>
<th>Corresponding Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>P/B/1</td>
<td>= 1 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P/A/1</td>
<td>= 2 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>P/B/2</td>
<td>= 2 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>P/A/2</td>
<td>= 3 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>P/B/3</td>
<td>= 3 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>P/A/3</td>
<td>= 4 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>P/B/4</td>
<td>= 4 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>P/A/4</td>
<td>= 5 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>P/B/5</td>
<td>= 5 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>P/A/5</td>
<td>= 6 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>P/B/6</td>
<td>= 6 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>P/A/6</td>
<td>= 7 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>P/B/7</td>
<td>= 7 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>P/A/7</td>
<td>= 8 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>P/B/8</td>
<td>= 8 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>P/A/8</td>
<td>= 9 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>P/B/9</td>
<td>= 9 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>P2A/9</td>
<td>= 10 a*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>P2B/1/9</td>
<td>= 10 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>P2A/2/8</td>
<td>= 11 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>P2B/2/8</td>
<td>= 11 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>P2A/3/7</td>
<td>= 12 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>P2B/3/7</td>
<td>= 12 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>P2A/5/5</td>
<td>= 13 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>P2B/4/6</td>
<td>= 13 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>P2A/6</td>
<td>= 14 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>P2B/5/5</td>
<td>= 14 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>P2A/7</td>
<td>= 15 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>P2B/8</td>
<td>= 15 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>P2A/8</td>
<td>= 16 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>P2B/9</td>
<td>= 16 b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>P2A/2/8</td>
<td>= 17 a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>P2B/2/8</td>
<td>= 17 b</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* On plate 2 the folios have been arranged from bottom to top.

** These folios are not in proper order and might have been confused because they do not have numbers. They have been rearranged by Shastri.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Volume</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Volume</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>67</td>
<td>P4B/5/6</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>P4A/6/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69</td>
<td>P4B/6/8</td>
<td>without number, 32a?</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>P5A/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70</td>
<td>P4A/6/5</td>
<td>without number, 32b? (for P5B/8)</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>P7B/8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71</td>
<td>P4B/7</td>
<td>34b</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>P4A/8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73</td>
<td>P4B/8</td>
<td>35b</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>P4A/9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>76</td>
<td>P4B/9</td>
<td>36b</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>P5A/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>78</td>
<td>P5B/1</td>
<td>37b</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>P5A/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80</td>
<td>P5B/2</td>
<td>38b</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>P5A/3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>83</td>
<td>P5B/3</td>
<td>39b</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>P5A/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>85</td>
<td>P5B/4</td>
<td>41b</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>P5A/5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>87</td>
<td>P5B/5</td>
<td>42b</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>P5A/6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>89</td>
<td></td>
<td>P5B/6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>91</td>
<td></td>
<td>P5B/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>92</td>
<td></td>
<td>P5A/8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>93</td>
<td></td>
<td>P7B/8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>94</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6A/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>95</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6B/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>96</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6A/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>97</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6B/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>98</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6A/3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>99</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6B/3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6A/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>101</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6B/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>103</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6A/5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>104</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6B/5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>105</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6A/6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>106</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6B/6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>107</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6A/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>108</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6B/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>109</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6A/8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>110</td>
<td></td>
<td>P6B/8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Abbreviations**

- **J** Jñānaśrīmitranibandhāvali, ed. A. Thakur. Patna 1959
- **JBORS** Journal of the Bihar and Orissa Research Society, Patna
- **PVBh** Pramāṇavārtikabhasyam or Vārtikālaṅkārah of Prajñākaragupta. Being a commentary on Dharmakīrti's Pramāṇavārtika, ed. R. Śaṅkṛtyāyana. Patna 1953
- **TR** Tarkarahasya
- **WZKS** Wiener Zeitschrift für die Kunde Südasiens, Wien